# CONTENTS

# List of Illustrations ix Acknowledgments xi

	Introduction	1
1	The Multiples Now	10
	Before a Conceit Is Born	10
	Translation Multiples Tell Their Own Story	19
2	Ethics of the Multiple	43
	Against the Grain	43
	The Metatranslation	50
	Pluralist Multiples	61
3	Inner Pluralism in the Wake of 1989	75
	Against the Spirit of Generalization	75
	Oratorium Moratorium	83
	Mister B., but How to Live?	94
4	Winding the Clockwork Orange Three Times	99
	The "2 in 1" in the Making	99
	The Mechanical and the Wind-Up Languages	111
	Multiples Going Round in Circles	121

## viii CONTENTS

5	Doing Brecht in Different Voices	132
	Translation beyond the Barricade	132
	Brecht in Translation Slams	144
	The V-Effekt	156
	Conclusion	161

Notes 169
Bibliography 195
Index 217

# Introduction

"I KNOW NOT who was the first lying author to construct the seventy cells at Alexandria, in which they were separated and yet all wrote the same words," wrote Jerome in "Preface to the Pentateuch" of the Vulgate, his Latin translation of the Bible. He referred here to the famous case of the Septuagint, the erstwhile primary Greek version of the Hebrew Bible commissioned in the third century BCE to a group of seventy Jews of Alexandria. Jerome debunked what later became the core element of its myth: namely, the claim that all the learned translators would under divine inspiration come up with entirely identical translated texts, word after word, sentence after sentence, despite working simultaneously and independently in seventy isolated cells. There are more caveats to the legend as known and subsequently circulated. In fact, the number of Jews was not a round seventy but seventy-two (six men of each of twelve tribes); they did not translate into standard Greek but its spoken vehicular variant, Koine; they originally did not render the entire Old Testament but only its first five books (the Pentateuch); and so on.

The crucial aspect of this widely shared lore, questioned by Jerome in the fourth century CE, is the alleged convergence of seventy-two translation solutions that were said to be produced individually and in isolation. "For it is one thing to be a prophet, another to be an interpreter," soberly argued Jerome, well aware of the translator's convoluted chains of decisions and arduous work, and later chosen as the patron saint of translators. To his mind, rather than being the result of miraculously synchronized interpretations from dozens of different people, the eventual Septuagint came into being as a product of the translators' collaborative work. The latter scenario actually corresponds to the earliest known record of the legend, a letter by Aristeas. It was only centuries later that Philo Judeus—the "first lying author" at whom Jerome pointed the finger—tacked the image of separate cells onto the story in order to strengthen the claim of the

1

#### 2 INTRODUCTION

translation's divine inspiration.<sup>3</sup> And it indeed made quite a difference to say that a few dozen translators did not cooperate over the final product, but somehow their individual readings cohered into what could be nothing else but one true and authorized translation of the Bible.

Besides its obvious scriptural significance, what was accomplished by this meeting of seventy-two translation minds into one? What consequences does it have on translation history and our contemporary understanding of what translation entails? It is safe to say that it could be one of the first moments in the history of textual practice when the "equivalence" between two texts in completely different languages is firmly established, legitimized, and justified with sufficient rhetorical power. Since a few dozen authorities, seventy-two competent interpreters approaching one text, reached exactly the same conclusions in their renderings, the identical fruit of their work must constitute the only faithful and authentic translation, supported by the highest authority imaginable. Radical as this case of imposing Equivalence with the capital E might sound from today's perspective, it is by no means an isolated one in translation and textual history. In principle, it finds its solid continuation in any institutional, political, or cultural mechanism of establishing the one and only translation equivalence in different historical contexts. These occurrences range from bilingual dictionaries with fixed interlingual one-to-one equivalents, to sworn authorized translations, to broader publishing practice and audience expectations making translators merge all potential variations into one ready-to-go translation product: a single finite text substituting for the original.

This book revolves around literary translations and conceptual works that do not conform to such norms and embody the exact reversal of the Septuagint's story. Instead of demonstrating how seventy-two translation attempts coalesce into one sanctioned rendering, the present discussion aims to turn the tables and swap the two sides of the equation. The question at stake here will be rather: how an original literary text can possibly diverge into seventy-two different variants. And when it does, how can such an unconventional multiplicity be displayed and embraced; in what way can it still be read as a coherent text, be it by one translator or poet or a team of several? And what follows: How can readers deal with similar instances of literary works with plural translatorial voices; is it possible to redefine our reading habits to be able to take full advantage of their rich reservoirs of meanings?

These questions are more pressing now than ever before. Translation multiples, this newly emerging genre of writing, has even developed its own artistic form and literary texture. These days, the multiples reside in conceptual books

#### INTRODUCTION

with plural translations or poems composed of different renderings of the same original. Translators, poets, and artists alike have come to expose the act of translation by producing different parallel variants, placing them next to each other as legitimate versions of the original, and presenting them as stand-alone artistic works. While doing so, the creators of multiples also want to tell their own story. The story can be deeply personal, visual, critical, or political; it can reflect on the nature of translation itself, its multiplicity, or any other artistic themes they set out to explore. A whole literary universe can be easily encapsulated in what might look like a series of dispersed translations—multiple translations that have been put together alongside each other for seemingly no reason.

This is of course not to say that the multiplicity of translation as such is something very unconventional. In fact, if we look a little bit closer, the tale of translation multiples is as old as time: plural variants lie dormant in any revised version by the same translator and every single retranslation of one work in a given language by different translators. There are translators who could ponder over alternative versions of their own rendering until doomsday—unless, of course, put under some external pressure (time, financial situation, next project, etc.) to cast what should ultimately be its final version on paper. Consecutive retranslators, too, tend to approach and reinterpret the original text differently from their predecessors; their varied readings of one work fork into multiple different paths depending on their personal and cultural background, interpretative lens, ideology, individually projected audience, and many other factors. This is partly why David Bellos humorously remarked: "Give a hundred competent translators a page to translate, and the chances of any two versions being identical are close to zero." Bellos's assumption clearly jars with the Septuagint-like convergence, shaking and turning the concept of one true equivalence upside down. It is rather the infinite and inevitably multiple nature of translation that comes into play and ought to be treated as a default option. But still, even though such multifarious outcomes are in theory recognized or even taken for granted by literary and translation critics, the actual norms of translation production are a completely different matter. Hardly ever do several different renderings of the same work appear in print simultaneously, alerting readers to various possibilities and alternative translation solutions as well as manifesting how tentative and arbitrary each of them is. With a minor exception of scholarly editions and critical anthologies, the status quo rather leans toward the Septuagint convergence. For a range of reasons, it is more convenient to nourish the illusion that a given translation wholly represents the original it stands for. As many people before have pointed out, despite ongoing efforts to change this state of affairs, the function

#### 4 INTRODUCTION

of translations and their mode of being in the majority of publishing cultures is still to be produced and read as substitutes for their originals.<sup>5</sup> And so this cultural status of translations, along with the respective pursuit of translation equivalence, governs prevailing praxis, apparently leaving little room for multiple variants and divergent readings of the original. A constant friction between the potentially plural and the prescriptively singular lies at the heart of literary translation.

In Translation Multiples, I discuss a wide range of contemporary literary works that against all odds fight for a different form of expression and display plural renderings of the same source text both in parallel to and on a par with one another. The examples of such multiples span the past few decades, beginning in the late twentieth century, and this book discusses several key examples focusing on two different contexts. First, it takes a broader outlook on the Anglophone literary scene. Translation multiples can offer a special shock therapy to the contemporary lingua franca, whose largely monolingual lens makes it necessary to debunk the myth of translation as a transparent medium and an unoriginal, secondary form of writing. Only the oft-quoted "three percent" of all books published the United States are translations, and a roughly matching number of translations are released yearly in the United Kingdom and Ireland.<sup>6</sup> With this lousy translation record as well as its expansive status of a global language, English is often lampooned for being oblivious to the creative resources of translation, let alone to translation coming in larger numbers and repetitions. This is also where authors of translation multiples and their gestures of pushing the envelope of the print format come into play most forcefully. Meddling with the audience's expectations, projects displaying plural renderings of one original lift the veil on the very act and process of translation, alert readers to its transformative powers, and expose different artistic idioms and language variants at play.

Second, this book zooms in on the minor culture of an emerging democracy, post-1989 Poland, where projects introducing multiplied translation variants with different ideological readings offered an essential platform for a pluralist political discussion after the transition from a totalitarian system. In these two literary cultures, a more globalized and a local one, translation activity occupies a completely different place. The almost proverbial "three-percent" figure does not really hold a candle to Poland's one-quarter of translated titles published yearly, a proportion closer to that of other European countries. At the same time, while the English-language and Polish book industries are both governed by free-market publishing, the translation culture of post-1989 Poland needs to be seen in relation to its previous communist counterpart. What translation multiples flesh out

#### INTRODUCTION

in this context is a strong quantitative tension between two successive literary orders: the authoritative legacy of the state-driven publishing monopoly before 1989 on the one hand, and a more decentralized system from the 1990s onward on the other. The first often favored canonization, officially anointed translations, and often reeditions of the same translations rather than soliciting new renderings. The latter has provided—even if in theory and with some caveats—similar technical conditions for a larger number of translations to emerge and more interpretations to be voiced without imposing any ideological priorities. Translation multiples in post-1989 Poland, I argue, are a touchstone of the transition between these two literary orders. Abolishing the communist legacy in favor of a more pluralist system brought about a move from singularity to plurality, from one authoritative interpretation to multiple renderings treated as potential alternatives.

In the same vein, these globalized and local literary contexts do not really lend themselves to comparison in terms of geographical and linguistic scope. Languages involved in English translation multiples span a much wider and more diverse range: from Ancient Greek to French, German, and Italian, to Chinese and Japanese. Among contemporary translation multipliers, we find quite a mixed crowd: not only American and Canadian poets and writers but also a Norwegian French artist (Caroline Bergvall) and two Italian writers and editors (Eugenia Loffredo and Manuela Perteghella), all three based in the United Kingdom, as well as a German-born poet (Rosmarie Waldrop), a Japanese poet and translator (Hiroaki Sato), an Indian-born professor (Aijaz Ahmad), and a Uruguayan artist (Alejandro Cesarco), the last four based in the United States. It does not really matter whether the originals they wished to multiply come from iconic authors such as Ibycus, Wang Wei, and Dante, or more recent (avant-garde and modernist) poets such as Ernst Jandl and Chika Sagawa. What still links the authors of translation multiples is the gesture of welcoming and embracing the creative potential of translation in English. While speaking from the linguistically privileged end, they refract originals through the prism of the global language but also position themselves somewhat against the grain. Their multiples aim to expose the appropriative medium of global English and rebel against institutional and cultural efforts to standardize language. For this reason, some of the multiples explicitly aim to open up the translation scene to very different ways of using of English or writing in various types of Englishes.

Within this power relation, the postcommunist examples should be placed on the other side of the spectrum. They often underscore the Eastern European experience after the fall of communism, anchoring it in a very local political

#### 6 INTRODUCTION

situation. At the same time, however, their creators also transgress the Polish local and ostensibly homogeneous context. In fact, one author, Stanisław Barańczak, was a dissident poet and US émigré who created his political multiples when teaching at Harvard. Another, Robert Stiller, was a Polish Jewish polyglot and translingual visionary. Others were translators affiliated with a liberal "world literature" magazine, which disseminated Western literature in multiplied translation before 1989. Yet, the postcommunist multiples are striking in how they position themselves against major languages and major political forces. In particular, they concentrate on the powerful European triad of English, French, and German, with some presence of Russian added to the mix, and take works originally written in these languages as the starting point of a pluralist discussion. This positioning against major cultures and translatorial intervention into their literary texts will also be key to understanding the subversive element in post-1989 projects. The multiples stray from the beaten pathway of either "assimilation" or "differentiation"—the two possible strategies identified by Pascale Casanova in the history of "small literatures" 8—and look for a third way out. While they are vibrant and critical voices that come from a "minor literature," it is not the kind of minor literature that is written by minor writers fully in a major language (Deleuze and Guattari) nor fully in a minor language (Kronfeld). The oppositional force of these "minor" projects of translation multiples lies in their linguistic in-betweenness. In generating diverse renderings of a work from a major Western language, the postcommunist translation multiples enter a polemic with the originals across languages, dismantle their alleged authority, and offer their own plural interlingual responses.

While these two distinct contexts pose a set of different questions for our understanding of translation multiples, this curious literary practice has emerged on the wave of similar artistic forces. Both these literary milieus treat the texture of translation multiples as an artistic and subversive idiom in its own right—even if to quite a different effect in some instances. Regardless of the geographical location, translation multiples have coincided with broader cultural trends: the gradually changing perception of literary translation and its recognition as a creative domain by both writers and academics. As most of the examples I focus on in the book span the past three or four decades, I also will discuss how these trends have informed the shift in thinking about the artistic potential of translation multiples. The practice of generating plural translation variants has not been so uncommon in other editorial contexts. In particular, scholarly publishing is known for its academic anthologies that present plural translations for pedagogical reasons: they place different renderings one after another to illuminate

#### INTRODUCTION 7

the original from different hermeneutic angles or to trace the reception of translated works or authors in multiple translations over time. While acknowledging the legacy of these editorial strategies, the translation multiples discussed in this book have entered a more artistic and experimental realm. They no longer see originals as the final anchors of meaning but rather treat them as a starting point into a much wider narrative. The critical reflection on the multiple nature of translation that they offer is no longer a by-product of scholarly exegesis but rather a creative principle binding all different variants together and turning their diversity into an artistic conceit.

In the first part of the book, I discuss the notion of translation multiples in the Anglophone context, placing them alongside other experimental practices in modernist and contemporary translation tradition. Whereas some experimental translations, in Sawako Nakayasu's words, "behave, or 'pass' as normal, traditional translations," the genre of creative multiplications and reiterations does not follow suit, resisting easy or passive reception. By subverting the usual one-to-one relationship between the original and its translation, the practice of multiplying translations rather tends to knock readers out of their routine of equating these two and taking one for the other. As translation multiples expose the process and act of translation by producing different parallel variants, their self-referential nature will also inform their longer literary lineage. Drawing on Oulipo-inspired ideas, I argue that the task of translation multiples is in accordance with that of metaliterature. While breaking the original into plural variants, they alert readers to the mediating subject and the act of creative transformation in the process.

The idea of translation ethics that underpins this understanding, discussed more thoroughly in chapter 2, will have a slightly different twist. A lot has been written about the ethics of translation, understood as fidelity toward original authors and source texts. This time, however, the ethics of the multiple will concern the receiving end of translation production: the reader. Instead of asking how to be "true" or "faithful" to the original, this book will open up literary translation to a range of reformulated questions testing in what way the literary genre of translation multiples can be valid for contemporary readers. Is it possible for a translator to signal to their audience the infinite spectrum of possibilities and so the tentative nature of a single translation choice? How can a translator break through the translation's "fourth wall" and the long-cherished illusion of treating translations as providing direct access to original meanings? How does acknowledging more than one legitimate reading of the original change the way we think about language—and global English with its many different varieties—and about

#### 8 INTRODUCTION

society, on today's culturally diverse map? What does it mean to interpret and translate differently from someone else and accept this other reading, and what do these distinct ideas about the original tell us about our own position in the world?

Especially with an eye to these issues, I will move on to discuss in much more detail three instances of translation multiples in postcommunist Poland in the second part of the book. In chapters 3, 4, and 5, respectively, I will highlight how translation multiples could become a pluralist gesture in a newly emerging democracy drawing on the following examples: homophonic multiples of "La Marseillaise," the French anthem (1991); a double/triple rendering of Anthony Burgess's A Clockwork Orange published as a novelistic tie-in (1999); and a quadruple book with Bertolt Brecht's poetry in distinct readings by four translators from Literatura na świecie (Literature in the World), the leading Polish magazine on world literature in translation (2012). These three case studies, outlined chronologically, have made their way into this book for a number of reasons. First, they are particularly compelling manifestations of the art of translation multiples in Polish with its core idea of reading one original text from different interpretative and ideological angles. Second, they also map out the most prominent and controversial figures and translation experiments in the local literary practice of the past decades. Third, their creators have strongly been invested in the literary translation culture. As such, they had their say in shaping it through their own translation works, debates, and criticism, and their artistic personas have incarnated some of the most interesting features of this tradition. Finally, all of these translators and authors have in one way or another dealt with the country's communist past, often taking a stance through their translation practice on the political and cultural situation at the turn of 1989 and beyond.

It is probably no coincidence that these pluralist translation multiples came to fruition in the postcommunist world and often served as a form of artistic liberation and critical reevaluation of the past. At this juncture, I will suggest how in each of these cases a multiplicity of interpretative perspectives in translation could also be read in pluralist or democratic terms: as opening a forum for discussion and introducing different viewpoints in opposition to the communist legacy. Depending on the case, the idea of translation pluralism manifest in post-1989 translation multiples will also put forward agendas pertinent to recent cultural discourse in the country. These include, for instance: an ethical suspicion of language and an urge to pursue individual perspectives against totalizing discourses, a critical engagement with different political systems and the cyclical nature of history, an intellectual protest against partisan tribalism and political polarization

#### INTRODUCTION 9

with an emphasis on the totalitarian mindset with "either/or" and "friend or foe" binaries typical of the Cold War era, a revision of ideologically encumbered images, and an activist role of acknowledging multiple voices and viewpoints.

These themes, one by one, permeate consecutive literary works, but they also nourish the notion of translation multiples more broadly. With special reference to these cases and broader themes, I hope to demonstrate that this newly emerging literary genre, besides simply inviting the diversity of artistic articulations, activates and responds to broader social and ethical issues. Translation multiples that treat different readings, worldviews, and visions of society on a par with one another might be a remedy against totalized ideas in our times. This remedy is particularly necessary in the face of not only the antagonizing rhetoric in the ongoing bloody conflicts all over the world but also the rising tide of political tribalism more generally. These phenomena form the underbelly of Western democracies as well as of a country like Poland, which until recently was seen as part of central Europe's "illiberal revolt" and is still very much torn by partisan divisions. As translation multiples promote polyphony and an open forum for discussion around various ideas, they equip their readers with a crucial critical tool for approaching textual and ideological difference. In the grand scheme of things, they also demonstrate how every act of translation and retranslation, reading and interpreting in different ways, is inherent to the human condition and to coexistence in a democratic society.

### INDEX

Figures are indicated by "f" following page numbers.

Ahmad, Aijaz, 5, 16 Allen, Esther, 170n2 All That Brecht (Ten caly Brecht): authorial credit for, 133-34, 189n3; as collaborative effort, 133, 135, 144, 157; cover of, 133, 134f; format of, 134, 140, 144-49; introduction to, 156-58; objectives of, 132, 144; shifting identities revealed in, 162; translation slams and, 150-58 Apollinaire, Guillaume, 16, 34 Appiah, Kwame Anthony, 170n13 Apter, Emily, 14 Aristeas, 1 Arndt, Walter, 45 Ash, Timothy Garton, 138 Asymptote (online journal), 10 avant-garde, 5, 33, 44, 47, 193n6

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 175n40
back-translation, 16
Baker, Richard, 18–20, 22, 30, 46
Balcerzan, Edward, 84
Barańczak, Stanisław: American persona
of, 76–77, 179n8; on bezecenzja reviews,
183n61; Breathing under Water and Other
East European Essays, 77; "The Confusion of Tongues," 180n13; correspondence with Miłosz, 75; on ethical role
of poetry, 76; experimental genres and,
79, 180n20; Fioletowa krowa, 182n39;
A Fugitive from Utopia, 77; God, Trunk,

Fatherland, 80, 180-81n25; "Goodbye, Samizdat," 94; as Harvard University professor, 6, 75, 76, 78; homophonic translation multiples and, 76, 79-80, 82-93, 161-62, 182n58; on inner pluralism, 78, 180n13; "Like a twin with his twin," 94-98; manifestos of, 77, 79, 82, 180n18; New Wave movement and, 77, 180n24; nonsense poetry of, 79-80, 82, 180nn24-25, 183n63; Pegaz zdębiał, 180n20, 183n63; play based on works of, 78-79, 180n16; "Poetry and the Spirit of Generalization" speech, 76, 80-81; published translations of Anglophone poets, 79, 180n17; on sound, 82, 182n41; Surgical Precision, 181n36; twin-mirror metaphor and, 98; The Weight of the Body, 77, 179n5. See also "Oratorium Moratorium"

Barnstone, Willis, 58
Barwin, Gary, 32, 33
Bashō, Matsuo, 16, 32–34, 53
Bates, John M., 179n99
Baudelaire, Charles, 48, 58, 142, 170n2
Beaulieu, Derek, 32, 33
Beckett, Samuel, 38–39
Beethoven, Ludwig van, 85
Bellen, Martine, 32
Bellos, David, 3
Benjamin, Walter, 20
Bentley, Eric, 158

#### 218 INDEX

172n46; as translation multiplier, 5; in "Translucinación" issue of Chain magazine, 32; "VIA: 48 Dante Variations," 19, 25-27, 28f, 49-53, 161, 172nn46-47, 172-73nn50-51 Bermann, Sandra, 172n46 Bernstein, Charles, 31-32, 44, 47 biases: aesthetic, 58; Brecht and, 132, 147, 151; class-based, 97; in English language, 43; ideological, 62; limitations of, 98; linguistic exclusion and, 48, 49; of Polish underground publishing, 69, 179n99; political, 154; in publishing industry, 48; racial, 49, 50, 174n6; in selection of variants, 59; xenophobia, 50 Bible, 1-3, 45 Blind Chance (film), 70-71, 72f, 73, 95, 162 Bloomfield, Camille, 56 Blyth, R. H., 33 Boethius, 171n22 Bök, Christian, 51, 175n31 Boodberg, Peter A., 21 Borges, Jorge Luis, 122 Borodo, Michał, 67 bpNichol, 33 Brecht, Bertolt: anticommunist translations of poetry by, 69; Baal, 192n76; The Buckow Elegies and Other Poems, 136; de-ideologization of works, 74; estate of, 67; FBI files of, 38-41; Hauspostille, 146, 192n76; instrumentalist readings of, 133, 140, 159, 164; on literal translation, 192n96; musical performances of protest songs, 190n27; New Wave movement and, 136; "On Speaking the Sentences," 147; "On the Drowned Girl," 150-51, 192n76; performance philosophy of,

158-59; "Solely Because of the Increas-

ing Disorder," 150-56; "The Solution,"

146-47, 189-90n23, 191n55; Svendborger

Gedichte, 145, 146; "Theatre for Pleasure

or Theatre for Instruction," 159; "To Those

137, 138f; Stiller's translations of, 140,

Bergvall, Caroline: Drift, 50; Fig, 25, 26,

Born After," 149; on V-effect, 158-60; "What Are You Waiting For?," 137-38, 138f; "When in My White Room at the Charité," 150. See also All That Brecht Brexit referendum (2016), 166 Briggs, Kate, 171n19 Brodsky, Joseph, 67 Brontë, Charlotte, 10, 65, 67 Browne, Laynie, 32 Buck, Adrianus de, 171n22 Buras, Jacek St., 133, 144-45, 149-51, 158 Burgess, Anthony: correspondence with Stiller, 109; Nadsat language invented by, 104-5, 111, 125; Napoleon Symphony, 184n28; political mission of, 135. See also A Clockwork Orange Burnett, Frances Hodgson, 67 Bush, George H. W., 81

Calvino, Italo, 29-30 Cameron, David, 45, 47, 193n6 Campos, Augusto de, 31 Carroll, Lewis, 16, 190n32 Carson, Anne, 38-42, 174n78 Casanova, Pascale, 6 Cassin, Barbara, 14, 176n43 Catholic Church, 84, 126-27 Cato, 18 Cavafy, C. P., 147 Cavanagh, Clare, 76, 181n36 censorship, 63-64, 68-70, 92-94, 105-7, 121, 162, 184n22 Cervantes, Miguel de, 46, 122 Cesarco, Alejandro, 5, 29-30, 31f Cetera, Anna, 176n43 Chain (magazine), 31-32, 37-38, 172n46 chance operations, 44, 46 Chopin, Frédéric, 53, 54 Christian National Union, 183n67 Chuang Tzu, 37-38 Clark, T. J., 55 A Clockwork Orange (Burgess): antitotalitarian message of, 106; glossary of terms

included in, 105, 111; Ludovico technique

#### INDEX 219

in, 117, 123, 128; movie adaptation of, 103, 107; Nadsat language and, 104-5, 111, 125, 184n21, 187n105; repetitive patterns and recurring images in, 121; Stiller's triple translation project for, 8, 74; version N translation (A Spring-Assisted Orange), 100, 127-30, 129f, 184ng. See also version A translation: version R translation Cobb, Allison, 37-38 Cohen, Sharmila, 45 Cold War, 9, 70, 73, 110, 130, 157, 162 Coleman, Jen, 37-38 Coleman, Ornette, 54 Collins, Martha, 57-59 Collodi, Carlo, 67 communist Poland: censorship in, 63-64, 68-70, 92-94, 105-7; labor camp (gulag) testimonies in, 114-16; state-run publishing in, 5, 62-66, 69; suppression of English-language literature in, 178n86; underground publishing in, 63, 68-69, 77, 105, 115, 132, 136, 148, 178-79196, 179199 conceptual moments, defined, 17 Cook, Nicholas, 54 Cooperson, Michael, 49 Copyright and Related Rights Act of 1994 (Poland), 67-68 Corrius, Montse, 176n43 Croatian War of Independence, 88 Croft, Jennifer, 57 Czechowicz, Józef, 190n33

Dante: *Divine Comedy*, 26, 30; *Inferno*, 16, 19, 25–30, 52–53, 143; selection for translation multiples, 5
Dayan, Peter, 24
Deane-Cox, Sharon, 59
Dejmek, Kazimierz, 107
Delaunay, Robert, 34
Deleuze, Gilles, 6, 60
democracy: barriers to, 167; capitalist, 119; emerging, 4, 8, 73–74, 80, 162; peaceful transformation into, 91; postcommunist, 62, 73–74; Western, 9, 92

Derrida, Jacques, 15-17, 44, 97, 1711119 Deschner, Karlheinz, 188n138 dialogue of difference approach, 59 Dickinson, Emily, 45 Diepeveen, Leonard, 47 diPalma, Ray, 32 discrimination. See biases Divided Britain (film), 166 Döblin, Alfred, 159 Donne, John, 38-41 Dostovevsky, Fyodor, 65, 67 The Double Life of Véronique (film), 95-96, Drewermann, Eugen, 188n138 Drunken Boat (website), 10, 170n2 Dubois, Gérard, 73f Dunayevsky, Isaak, 85 Duncan, Dennis, 176n46 Dunne, Conor Brendan, 173n63 Dworkin, Craig, 172nn46-47

Edmond, Jacob, 44, 50

Ekier, Jakub, 133, 145-46, 149-51, 153-56 Eliot, T. S., 143 Ellis, Steve, 27 Eltit, Diamela, 170-71115 Emmerich, Karen, 12 Engelking, Ryszard, 190n33 English language: biases within, 43; fixed concepts of, 13; global, 4, 5, 7, 36, 49, 50, 61, 147; incompatibility between Latin and, 18; monolingual boundaries of, 49; percentage of translations published yearly, 4, 169n6; phonetic imitations of words in, 118; Polish youth attracted to, 108, 112; as vehicular language, 14 English-language translation multiples: of classical texts, 12, 16, 18, 25, 27; demand for airtime and visibility, 43; diversity of languages involved in, 5; ethno-specific varieties among, 49-50; racially biased representations in, 174n6 Enzensberger, Hans Magnus, 171n22 equivalence. See translation equivalence

#### 220 INDEX

ethics: of anticommunist dissident writing, 149; of poetry, 76; of postcolonial translations, 170n13; in postcommunist Poland, 62, 71, 94, 96; of translation multiples, 7, 60–61, 71, 74, 94, 135, 142–44, 165 ethnic conflicts, 81, 88, 91 Etkind, Efim, 176n43 European Union (EU), 74, 85, 127, 129 experimental translation, 7, 11–12, 16, 35, 42, 44–50, 56, 79, 193n6

fascism, 91, 93, 135, 151
Fernández Long, Hilario, 171n26
Figlerowicz, Marta, 186n93
Fink, Thomas, 47
Flaubert, Gustave, 65, 67, 190n33
Fleurs du mal (website), 10, 170n2
Fluxus movement, 44
Foer, Jonathan Safran, 45
Fordoński, Krzysztof, 178n81
fourth wall illusion, 7, 160
framing devices, 52, 175n35
Frank, Armin Paul, 170n4
freedom of speech, 162, 179n99
Friedlander, Benjamin, 32

Fantastyka (magazine), 105-7, 183n7

Galvin, Rachel, 56, 170n2
generalization, spirit of, 76, 80–81, 98
Gibbon, Edward, 30
Gibbons, Reginald, 179n5
Ginczanka, Zuzanna, 15
global English, 4, 5, 7, 36, 49, 61, 147
Goldsmith, Kenneth, 44, 172nn46–47
Gondowicz, Jan, 183n63
Göttingen Project, 170n4
Gould, Glenn, 54, 175n39
Grass, Günter, 66
Guattari, Félix, 6, 60
gulag (labor camps), 114–16

Haddon, Mark, 57 Hahn, Daniel, 15, 170-71115 Halpern, Daniel, 16, 143 Haltof, Marek, 71 al-Harīrī, 49 Harvey, Rosalind, 41 Hawkes, David, 13 Hawkey, Christian, 45-47, 193n6 Heaney, Seamus, 76-77, 173n51 Heine, Heinrich, 142, 190n42 Herbert, Zbigniew, 77 Herling-Grudziński, Gustaw, 115 Hermans, Theo, 176n43, 177n57 Herrmann, Horst, 188n138 Heydel, Magda, 78, 165 Hitler, Adolf, 145 hoaxes, literary, 46, 48, 94 Hofmann, Michael, 16, 143 Hofstadter, Carol, 23-24 Hofstadter, Douglas R., 19, 22-25, 51, 53, 59 Holca, Irina, 35 Holub, Miroslav, 147 Homer, 16 homophonic translation, 8, 44-46, 50, homophonic translation multiples, 8, 73-74, 76, 79-80, 82-93, 161-62, 182n58 Hoover, Paul, 51 Horáček, Josef, 47 Horowitz, Vladimir, 53-54 Houédard, Dom Sylvester, 33 Howitt, Peter, 71 Hughes, Langston, 82 Huss, Joanna Trzeciak, 15

Ibycus, 5, 38–42 identities: group, 126; political, 138, 162; postcommunist, 116; shifting, 161–62, 164; of translators, 24, 26 instrumentalism, 133, 140, 159, 164, 176–77n56 International Translation Day, 57 intralingual translation, 45–46

Jameson, Fredric, 159 Jandl, Ernst, 5, 32–33, 44

#### INDEX 221

Janion, Maria, 186n93
Janouch, Gustav, 38–40
Jerome, 1
Joan of Arc, 40
John of the Cross (saint), 58
John Paul II (pope), 181n25
Johnson, Kent, 45
Joyce, James, 67, 113, 173n54, 186n72,

Kaczorowska, Monika, 181-82n38 Kaczyński, Lech and Jarosław, 183n69 Kapuściński, Ryszard, 186n93 Karasek, Krzysztof, 143 Karkowski, Czesław, 180n24 Kieślowski, Krzysztof, 70-71, 72f, 73, 95-97, Kirsanov, Semyon, 44 Klata, Jan, 119, 125, 131 Kliszko, Zenon, 107 Kneale, Matthew, 164 Kochanowski, Jan, 76-77 Konwicki, Tadeusz, 106, 113 Kopacki, Andrzej, 133, 146-47, 149-51, 156-58, 191n60 Kornhauser, Julian, 139 Korwin-Mikke, Janusz, 190n32 Kosiński, Jerzy, 69 Kraszewski, Józef Ignacy, 186n73 Kronfeld, Chana, 6 Krynicki, Ryszard, 136-37, 138f Krynski, Jan, 179n5 Kubrick, Stanley, 103, 107 Kujawinski, Frank, 179n5

labor camps (gulag), 114–16 L-A-N-G-U-A-G-E poets, 44 Lanthimos, Yorgos, 60–62 Larkin, Philip, 90 Lasdun, James, 16, 143 Law and Justice Party (PiS), 183n69 law of quantity, 15–17, 43–44, 171n19

Legault, Paul, 45, 46, 170n2

Kurosawa, Akira, 55, 73

Legman, Gershon, 124 Leśniewska, Maria, 142 Levý, Jiří, 177n57 Lewin, Leopold, 190n42 Lezra, Jacques, 14 Li Bai, 50 Lindseth, Jon A., 16 literary hoaxes, 46, 48, 94 Literatura na świecie (Polish magazine): ethical agenda of, 142-44; extracts from Burgess's Napoleon Symphony in, 184n28; on merged translation, 142-43; as platform for circulating world literature in translation, 135; Stiller and, 100, 105, 106, 183n6, 185n38; translation multiples in, 8, 141–43, 164, 177n58, 190n33, 190n42; translation of Joyce's "Anna Livia Plurabella" in, 186n72 Literature across Frontiers, 169nn6-7 Łobodowski, Józef, 190n42 Loffredo, Eugenia, 5, 16, 34-35 London Underground, 39, 41-42 Looby, Robert, 69 Lourie, Richard, 179n5 Low, Jackson Mac, 44-45 Luboń, Arkadiusz, 138, 180n18 Luxemburg, Rosa, 150, 192n76

Macpherson, James, 46 Maguire, Robert A., 179n5 Maher, Ciarán, 25, 172n46 Mallarmé, Stéphane, 23 Man, Paul de, 97 Manheim, Ralph, 191n60 Marks, Alfred H., 33 Marot, Clément, 19, 22-25, 51 "La Marseillaise" (French national anthem), 8, 74, 84-92 Martín Ruiz, Pablo, 56 Masłowska, Dorota, 116, 186n93 Matheson, William, 33, 53 Mathews, Harry, 51 Mazowiecki, Tadeusz, 124 McCaffery, Steve, 32, 33, 53

#### 222 INDEX

A Mechanical Orange. See version R translation metaliterature, 7, 55, 176n43 metatranslation, 55, 61, 176n43 Michoński, Cezary, 185n49 Mickiewicz, Adam, 107 Miłosz, Czesław, 75, 77, 80, 113 modernism, 5, 7, 35, 44, 45, 50-51, 142, 158 Monk, Ian, 56 monolingualism, 4, 36, 49, 50, 113, 165 Montesquieu, 46 Moore, Nicholas, 48 Moure, Erin, 170n2 Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 82-83, 182n41 Müller, Wilhelm, 182n41 multilingualism, 32, 35-36, 49, 111-12 multimodal translation, 33, 34 music, thematic variations in, 22, 52-54 Myslovitz (music group), 131 myths: national, 80, 181n25; of the "original," 54; of posttransition miracle, 123; of Septuagint, 1; of translation, 4, 45

Nabokov, Vladimir, 15, 30

Nakayasu, Sawako: *The Collected Poems of Chika Sagawa*, 35; on experimental translation, 7, 47; *Mouth: Eats Color*, 35–36, 47; on one-to-one relationship, 36, 43; "Promenade," 35–37, 49, 52, 55, 161

Nash, Ogden, 82

nationalism, 81, 90, 91

New Wave movement, 77, 136, 139, 143, 147, 180n24

Nielsen BookScan reports, 169n6

"Oratorium Moratorium" (Barańczak):
Beethoven's "Ode to Joy" and, 85, 87;
communist/socialist song and, 85, 87, 92;
on dialectic support for single viewpoints, 163; French national anthem
"La Marseillaise" and, 8, 73–74, 84–92;
Harmonia Mundi choir and, 84, 89–90, 92–93; as homophonic translation

multiple, 8, 73–74, 76, 79–80, 84–93; *The Merry Widow* and, 85; reprinted version, 82, 92

Orwell, George, 81, 106, 184n28

Orzeszkowa, Eliza, 186n73

Osman, Jena, 37

O'Sullivan, Maggie, 34

Oulipo, 7, 32, 44, 51, 53, 56, 175n31, 176n46

Outranspo, 56, 176nn45–46

Ovid, 16, 143

Paktofonika (music group), 131 Paloff, Benjamin, 116 Parker, Dorothy, 82 Parsons, Thomas William, 173n51 Patterson, Cyril, 34 Patton, Julie, 32 Paz, Octavio, 16, 173n61 PEN America Translation Committee, 57 Penguin Classics' Poets in Translation, 11 Penkethman, John, 18 Perec, Georges, 51 Perloff, Marjorie, 44, 46, 51 Perry, Grayson, 166 Perteghella, Manuela, 5, 16, 34-35 Pessoa, Fernando, 48 Phillips, Carl, 58 Philo Judeus, 1-2 physical translation, 37-38 Pijanowski, Lech, 191n55 Pike, Warburton Mayer, 29f PiS (Law and Justice Party), 183n69 Plato's curse, 54 Poe, Edgar Allan, 177n58 poetry and poetics: avant-garde, 5, 33; baroque manuals for, 171n22; conceptual, 19, 29, 33, 43, 94; ethical role of, 76; haiku, 16, 32-34, 53; metaphysical, 80, 181n28; modernist, 5, 35, 50-51; multilingual, 35-36; nonsense, 76, 79-80, 82, 180nn24-25, 183n63; polyphonic, 181n36; procedural, 51, 52; reiterative, 44; renga, 34, 173n61; Romantic, 27; sound in, 44; visual, 20-21, 31-33

#### INDEX 223

Poland: accession to European Union, 74, 127; Balcerowicz Plan in, 118; Borderlands region of, 113; Catholic Church in, 84, 126-27; free-market publishing in, 4, 62-63, 66-68, 107; New Wave movement in, 77, 136, 139, 143, 147, 180n24; number of publishing houses in, 66, 178n81; partition of, 91, 111, 113, 116; percentage of translations published yearly, 4, 62, 169n7, 178n84; Poznań protests in (1956), 135; quota of Syrian refugees allotted to, 129; Roundtable Talks in, 73, 124; Russian language as viewed in, 115, 186n91; Solidarity movement in, 69-71, 73, 77, 80, 124, 132, 137-40, 147-48, 179n99; transition away from totalitarianism, 4, 62. See also communist Poland; postcommunist translation multiples Polański, Roman, 162 Polish language, 79, 104, 108, 110, 128, 130 political tribalism, 8-9, 69, 71, 74, 81, 98, Ponglish (language), 113, 117-19, 127, 185n57 Possession (film), 162 postcommunist translation multiples: Copyright Act and, 67-68; ethical resonance of, 71; homophonic, 84-93, 161-62; pluralist, 4-8, 61-63, 73-74, 165; subversive elements of, 6. See also All That Brecht; A Clockwork Orange; "Oratorium Moratorium" Pound, Ezra, 21, 44 Poussin, Nicolas, 55 Powell, Bud, 54 prejudice. See biases propaganda, 69, 77, 110, 123, 132, 137, 145, 183n61 Prufer, Kevin, 58 Przesmycki, Zenon Miriam, 190142 Przybora, Jeremi, 80 pseudotranslation, 45, 46, 174n6, 174n8 publishing industry: biases within, 48; digital, 10-11, 31, 167; free-market, 4,

62–63, 66–68, 102, 107, 162–64; independent presses, 47, 105, 163; percentage of translations published yearly, 4, 62, 169nn6–7, 178n84; politics within, 59, 162; scholarly, 3, 6–7, 11–12, 170n6; single translations favored by, 43; staterun, 5, 62–66, 69, 105, 135, 163; translators' visibility in, 57; underground, 63, 68–69, 77, 105, 115, 132, 136, 148, 163, 178–79n96, 179n99

Puls (Polish magazine), 83, 94, 95

Purcell, Henry, 182n41

Pushkin, Alexander, 15, 190n42

Pym, Anthony, 176n53

Queneau, Raymond, 51-55

Rachmaninoff, Sergei, 22 racism, 49, 50, 174n6 Rancière, Jacques, 166 Rashomon effect, 55 Ravel, Maurice, 23 reading habits, 15, 28, 30, 33, 35, 164 Rees, Goronwy, 40 Reid, Christopher, 45 Reynolds, Matthew, 173n63 Reznikoff, Charles, 147 Richards, I. A., 12-14, 46 Rimbaud, Arthur, 170n2, 175n31, 190n42 Robert-Foley, Lily, 44 Robinson, Douglas, 38 Rose, Adrienne H. K., 176n55 Rudnytska, Nataliia, 64 Russian language, 99, 109-17, 186n91

Sachs, Jeffrey, 118
Sadkowski, Wacław, 141–42
Sagawa, Chika, 5, 35–36, 47, 49
Saint-Exupéry, Antoine de, 67
Satanowski, Jerzy, 180n16
Sato, Hiroaki, 5, 16, 32, 33, 53
Saussy, Haun, 21, 171n27
Schubert, Franz, 182n41
Schulte, Rainer, 170n6

#### 224 INDEX

Scott, Clive, 38 Senn, Fritz, 173n54 Septuagint, 1-3 Shakespeare, William, 10, 45, 51, 64-65, 151, 164, 176n43, 177n58 Shaw, Lytle, 32 Shklovsky, Viktor, 159 Simon, Claude, 141 Skarga, Barbara, 115 Słomczyński, Maciej, 65, 190n33 Słowacki, Juliusz, 181n25 Snyder, Gary, 21 Solzhenitsyn, Aleksandr, 114-15 Som, Brandon, 49-50 Sommer, Piotr, 133, 143, 147-51, 153-56, 191n60 Sorrell, Martin, 34 Soviet Union: collapse of, 61, 67, 76, 88; cultural and political influence of, 114; disrespect of individual minor nations, 87; labor camps (gulag) in, 114-16; translation in, 63-65, 169n13. See also Cold War Spahr, Juliana, 37 speech, freedom of, 162, 179n99 Spicer, Jack, 45 spirit of generalization, 76, 80-81, 98 A Spring-Assisted Orange (version N translation), 100, 127-30, 129f, 184n9 Stasiuk, Andrzej, 113 Staszewski, Kazik, 190n27 Steiner, George, 48 Stevens, Wallace, 20 Stiller, Robert: Brecht translations, 140, 146-47, 189-90n23, 191n55; on Catholic Church, 126–27; correspondence with Burgess, 109; Heine translations, 142, 190n42; on levels of understanding, 108-9; Literatura na świecie and, 100, 105, 106, 183n6, 185n38; on merged translation, 142; Nadsat language and, 108-19, 125-27, 184n21; A Pesky Orange translation, 130; as Polish Jewish polyglot, 6, 100; skepticism regarding political narratives, 101; on translation multiples

for critical reevaluation of past and present, 163; version N translation (A Spring-Assisted Orange), 100, 127–30, 129f, 184n9. See also version A translation; version R translation
Swensen, Cole, 58
Sze, Arthur, 58
Szirtes, George, 34
Szpotański, Janusz, 94–97
Szymborska, Wisława, 58, 76, 77

Tannenbaum, Alan, 16 Taylor, Karen L., 52 Telephone (online journal), 10, 31 The Tenant (film), 162 thematic variations, 22, 52-54, 82, 175n35 thick translation, 15, 170n13 Thirlwell, Adam, 16, 45 Three Percent program and database (University of Rochester), 56, 169n6 totalitarianism: as barrier to democracy, 167; cultural life under, 77; either/or binary and, 9; legacy of, 70, 74; rhetorical fallacies of, 165; transition away from, 4, 62 translation: back-translation, 16; canonization and, 63-66, 135, 163; cultural trends regarding, 6; as dialogue of the worlds, 165; diaries and memoirs of, 15, 170-71nn14-15; erasure techniques in, 45; experimental, 7, 11-12, 16, 35, 42, 44-50, 56, 79, 193n6; homophonic, 8, 44-46, 50, 176n43; illusions of, 3, 7, 62, 160, 165, 177n57; indirect, 23, 147; institutional constraints governing, 48-50; instrumentalist model of, 176-77n56; intralingual, 45-46; literal, 22, 23, 44, 192n96; literary vs. academic, 12-17; merged, 142-43; metaphor of, 53, 165; metatranslation, 55, 61, 176n43; multimodal, 33, 34; myths related to, 4, 45; norms of, 3, 40, 44, 46, 56; physical, 37–38; postcolonial approaches to, 170n13; pseudotranslation, 45, 46, 174n6, 174n8; retranslation, 3, 9, 21, 56, 59, 64, 165, 170n4, 176n43, 176n53; serial, 11, 19, 31-33; subversive power of, 193n6;

INDEX 225

thick, 15, 170n13; transformative power of, 4, 36, 56 translation equivalence: law of quantity and, 15-17, 43-44, 171n19; limitations of, 51-52; one-to-one, 2, 7, 13-14, 36, 52, 56, 61-62; phonetic, 84, 87; somatic (physical), 38; variorum editions translation multiples: artistic potential of, 2-3, 6; conceptual moments and, 17; for critical reevaluations of the past and present, 163; dialogue of difference approach to, 59; in digital publishing, 10-11, 31, 167; ethics of, 7, 60-61, 71, 74, 94, 135, 142-44, 165; homophonic, 8, 74, 76, 79-80, 82-93, 161-62, 182n58; in Literatura na świecie, 8, 141-43, 164, 177n58, 190n33, 190n42; machine-aided, 193n6; metacritical role of, 18, 55, 133, 151, 158, 166; pluralist, 4-8, 61-63, 73-74, 161, 164-67; polyphonic potential of, 164; reading habits redefined by, 28, 30, 33, 35, 164; in scholarly publishing, 3, 6-7, 11-12, 170n6; shifting identities and, 161-62; spatial relations and, 31, 34, 35; subversive potential of, 44, 50; texture of, 2, 6, 17, 19, 28, 31, 32; traditional studies of, 10-11, 170n4; V-effect in, 159, 160; visualization of, 28-35, 29f, 31f. See also English-language translation multiples; postcommunist translation multiples translation slams, 150-58 translation studies (discipline), 56, 177n57 "Translucinación" (Chain magazine), 31-32, tribalism, 8-9, 69, 71, 74, 81, 98, 166-67 Trump, Donald, 56 Tulli, Magdalena, 190n33 Tuwim, Julian, 93, 180n20, 182n58, 183n63, 190n42, 192n85 Twain, Mark, 67 twin-mirror metaphor, 98 Tykwer, Tom, 71-73

Tymoczko, Maria, 170n13

Urdu, Ghalib, 16 Valles, Alissa, 58 V-effect, 158-60 Venuti, Lawrence, 57, 67, 176-77nn56-57 version A translation (A Wind-Up Orange): afterword of, 103; book cover, 100, 101f; 102-3; circularity of, 121-25; creation and introduction of, 100, 103, 108; explanatory texts for, 103, 184n13; glossary of terms included in, 111; levels of understanding for, 108-9; Nadsat language and, 108-13, 116-19, 125-27; pursuit of the Western lifestyle in, 117; special edition with version R, 100, 102f; stage production of, 119, 120f, 125, 187n107 version N translation (A Spring-Assisted Orange), 100, 127-30, 129f, 184n9 version R translation (A Mechanical Orange): book cover, 100, 101f; 102-3; censorship of, 105-7; circularity of, 121-25; creation and introduction of, 99-100, 103-4; explanatory texts for, 103, 184n13; glossary of terms included in, 106, 111; illegal editions of, 105, 184n15, 185n37; levels of understanding for, 108-9; Nadsat language and, 108-16, 125-27; special edition with version A, 100, 102f; stage production of, 119, 120f; as supplement to *Fantastyka*, 105, 183n7 Virgil, 58 Vulgate Bible, 1

Waczków, Józef, 190n42
Wade, Sidney, 171n32
Waldrop, Rosmarie, 5, 32–33
Wałęsa, Lech, 80, 124, 137, 183n69
Walkowitz, Rebecca, 11, 19, 20, 31, 175n42
Wang Wei: "deer park" and, 16, 19, 21, 52;
Fernández Long and, 171n26; selection for translation multiples, 5; Snyder and, 21; visuality and pictoriality in poetry of, 20, 171n30; Wade and, 171n32; Weinberger and, 16, 19–22, 59, 171n27, 175n42
Wat, Aleksander, 147–48

#### 226 INDEX

Watson, Burton, 37 xenophobia, 50

Ważyk, Adam, 190n42

Weinberger, Eliot, 16, 19–22, 59, 171n27, 175n42 Yiddish language, 111-13, 128 Yugoslav wars, 81, 88

Wilkins, Ernest H., 26 Willett, John, 191n60

A Wind-Up Orange. See version A translation Zabalbeascoa, Patrick, 176n43

Witold Chwalewik, 190n42 Zagajewski, Adam, 77 Wolf, Uljana, 31, 45 Zappulla, Elio, 27

Wolff, Larry, 87 Żeromski, Stefan, 186n73

Zukofsky, Louis and Celia, 44, 47 Wood, Michael, 14 Wright, Chantal, 16

Żuławski, Andrzej, 162