Contents

	Preface DIANA KORMOS BUCHWALD	VII
1	Introduction TILMAN SAUER	1
2	The Quest for (and Discovery of) Gravitational Waves BARRY C. BARISH	6
3	One Hundred Years of Relativity: From the Big Bang to Black Holes and Gravitational Waves KIP S. THORNE	19
4	The New Era of Gravitational-Wave Physics and Astrophysics ALESSANDRA BUONANNO	47
5	The Wagers of Science DANIEL KENNEFICK	62
6	The Genesis and Transformation of General Relativity JÜRGEN RENN	76
7	The Detection of Gravitational Waves: A Reflection HARRY COLLINS	111
8	Einstein at Caltech DIANA KORMOS BUCHWALD	129
9	How General Relativity Shaped Twentieth-Century Philosophy of Science DON HOWARD	149

VI CONTENTS

Notes	197
References	207
The Contributors	223
Index	227

Introduction

TILMAN SAUER

The first direct observational detection of gravitational waves by the Laser Interferometer Gravitational-Wave Observatory (LIGO) consortium on September 14, 2015, was a momentous event in the history of science. It shares a number of features with another decisive event of the previous century, the first direct observational detection of gravitational light bending during the solar eclipse of May 25, 1919. This, too, was a tiny effect predicted by a bold theory but was barely detectable given the day's technology. Its observational confirmation, like that of LIGO, took many years of preparation and involved failed attempts, its case made more difficult by the adversities of war and international hostility. Yet both investigations provided strong support for Einstein's theory of general relativity, a theory grounded on a willingness to question and seriously modify deeply entrenched notions of space and time.

Soon after the historic event took place, a meeting of leading scientists, historians, and philosophers was held at the California Institute of Technology to reflect on Einstein's legacy and to discuss its enduring validity. The meeting, which had been planned before the LIGO observation took place, reflected a centenary of Einstein's general theory. As it turned out, the detection occurred almost exactly a hundred years after Einstein published his foundational field equations. The meeting at Caltech, and the present volume, bring together leaders of the LIGO project with historians and sociologists of science to reflect on the event and its implications. The accounts in this volume offer a virtual participation in the process of science in the making, accompanied by informed historical, sociological, and philosophical reflection.

Barry Barish was principal investigator and director of the LIGO laboratory in its crucial period between the mid-1990s and 2005, when the project transitioned from a local endeavor at the two founding institutions Caltech and MIT to a multinational, multi-institutional largescale science project involving eighteen nations, more than one hundred

2 TILMAN SAUER

institutions, and in excess of a thousand individuals. His contribution opens the volume to remind us of the rapid pace of science, so rapid indeed that the detection overtook the initial planning of the anniversary conference at Caltech. Barish, one of the recipients of the 2017 Nobel Prize awarded for the discovery of gravitational waves, provides a concise account of the LIGO collaboration. His contribution conveys the sense of a rapidly expanding field that exploded into a spectrum of activities after a long period of preparation and gestation. Further observations of wave events followed the initial one on September 14, 2015. His words evoke a field in which one sensational, new event is hardly processed and prepared for public announcement when the next renders the first old news. Barish's contribution itself reflects the rapidly increasing success: he added a note in proof to announce that a second gravitational event (GW151226) had been detected during the first run (O1) of advanced LIGO, which took data between September 12, 2015, and January 19, 2016. That was followed by several more detections during the second observation run (O2) from November 30, 2016, to August 25, 2017. During that period, LIGO not only produced further evidence for binary black hole mergers but also yielded evidence for the merger of a binary neutron star as a first observation of a gravitational-wave event in conjunction with its electromagnetic counterpart. More new data can be expected from the third observation run (O3), which is projected to begin taking data in February 2019. This run will include, in addition to the two LIGO interferometers, data taken from the European observatory VIRGO, which should allow more accurate localization as well as give, for the first time, information about the polarization of gravitational radiation.

Kip Thorne, who with Barish and Rainer ("Rai") Weiss was awarded the 2017 Nobel Prize, was for many years a principal mover of the project directly to detect gravitational radiation, having begun theoretical investigations into the subject in the late 1960s. His contribution to this volume provides a broad perspective on the significance of the endeavor, emphasizing its importance for our understanding of the observable universe's curved space-time. Thorne's reflections beautifully convey his long-standing fascination with general relativity's counter-intuitive implications as he describes the development of the LIGO project from its first ideas to the large-scale international discovery machine. No one can tell this story better and with more authority than Kip Thorne, the institutional father of LIGO. Indeed, he has gone further in conveying the wonder of gravitational physics, serving as scientific adviser to the

film *Interstellar*, which trades on the possibilities suggested by some of the field's implications.

Alessandra Buonanno, director at the Albert Einstein Institute for Gravitational Physics in Berlin and Professor of Physics at the University of Maryland, provides insight concerning what may begin to be detected with new gravitational-wave "telescopes." A principal aim of the extraordinary technology developed for the LIGO interferometer was and remains to provide qualitatively new information in the fields of astrophysics and cosmology. Buonanno sketches the possibilities now opened by gravitational-wave astronomy. She explains the intricate and fascinating astrophysical processes that take place when black holes or neutron stars collide, inspiral, merge, and settle down, and explains what gravitational and electromagnetic signals we can expect from those violent processes.

Dan Kennefick, professor of physics at the University of Arkansas and a longtime collaborator of the Einstein Papers Project at Caltech, provides an intimate, historical account of the LIGO project. In addition to training as a historian, while a graduate student Kennefick was early involved in the efforts led by Kip Thorne to prepare the theoretical grounds underlying the empirical search for gravitational waves that eventuated in LIGO's success. Drawing on his own experience and direct involvement, Kennefick points to the role of theorists and theoretical controversies in shaping the successful outcome of the quest, emphasizing in particular the importance of detailed numerical modeling. The large-scale simulations of such astrophysical catastrophes as black hole collisions through the explicit numerical solution of Einstein's equations provided the filters by which the raw interferometric data was interpreted. In 2005, a breakthrough became possible when it was realized that special coordinate conditions allowed the uninterrupted simulation of the full cycle of the inspiral, merger, and ring down of a binary black hole. That breakthrough allowed LIGO researchers to interpret the interferometric signals in terms of specific astrophysical causes, including estimates of distance as well as of initial and final masses.

Jürgen Renn, director at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science, lays out a long-term history of research into the theory of relativity and gravitation that culminated in LIGO's successful detection of waves. He reaches back to the preconditions that underpinned the theory of general relativity and the details of the heuristics deployed by Einstein in his search for the field equations. That almost exactly a century passed between Einstein's publication of the equations and the

4 TILMAN SAUER

first direct observation of ripples in space-time is, of course, a numerical contingency. But it is a contingency that appeals to the historical mind. Renn takes it as a challenge for the historian to account for the longue durée of a historical process that began with a theoretical conjecture, that underwent ups and downs in the structure's appeal and deployment by the physics community, settling at long last into a multimillion-dollar, large-scale endeavor that lasts for decades until delivering what had until then been a long-sought and discussed possibility. Renn focuses on the interplay between theoretical premises and experimental design, describing the transformation of the field from its origin in the imagination of a single mind to a collaborative enterprise involving thousands of scientists.

Harry Collins, professor of sociology at the University of Cardiff, has been interested in, and indeed associated with, the LIGO project for decades as a sociologist. Large-scale scientific projects, involving hundreds or thousands of researchers, technicians, and other personnel and enjoying levels of funding that surpass the means of individual groups or institutions, represent, Collins points out, a social reality of their own. This is particularly the case with LIGO, which was funded by the National Science Foundation at an unusually high level for more than two decades before achieving success. LIGO's efforts put ever more stringent constraints on the observability of gravitational-wave events as its instruments became steadily and impressively more accurate. Collins has observed the ongoing research with the eve of a critical and skeptical sociologist since the early seventies. He tells an intriguing story concerning an attempt by a LIGO predecessor, Joe Weber, to detect the effect. Given the technology available in the 1970s, Weber employed resonant bars. These large aluminum cylinders, Weber argued, would be set into vibration by passing gravitational waves. Despite the near unanimous rejection by the community of his early claims of detection, Weber, Collins argues, should be seen as a pioneer of the field because his experimental work created the community interest that made further work possible-most immediately the indirect observation of waves in 1975 by Hulse and Taylor due to energy loss by a neutron star binary.

Diana Buchwald, professor of history at Caltech and director of the Einstein Papers Project, focuses on Einstein's relationship with the California Institute of Technology. Not only is Caltech a founding institute and core partner of the LIGO endeavor, since 2000 it has been host to the long-term, multi-volume editorial project of the *Collected Papers of Albert Einstein*. Under Buchwald's aegis, to date eight volumes of writings and

INTRODUCTION 5

correspondence from the years 1918 to 1927 have been published. This is particularly apposite since Caltech's relationship with the founder of general relativity and the originator of the idea of gravitational waves goes back to the very beginnings of the theory, when Einstein corresponded in 1913 with the Caltech astronomer George Hale about the possibility of observing gravitational light deflection. Had historical circumstances been slightly different, Caltech might have become Einstein's home after he was forced to leave Germany and emigrate to the United States following the acquisition of power by the Nazis. He spent three winters in the early 1930s at Caltech, before finally accepting an offer at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton, which became his home for more than twenty years until his death in 1955.

Don Howard, professor of philosophy at the University of Notre Dame, focuses on the impact that Einstein's theory had for our modern understanding and philosophy of science. Philosophical reflection of science in the twentieth century underwent profound transformations with the advent of general relativity. Indeed, philosophy of science in a modern sense was created, Howard suggests, in its present form not the least by Einstein himself in a debate with philosophical interlocutors such as Moritz Schlick, Hans Reichenbach, Rudolf Carnap, Ernst Cassirer, and others. Howard goes back to the early years of the radically new understanding of space and time when it was first explored by philosophers. Howard describes how, in response, they reconsidered long-standing problems in the relationship between empirical and conceptual content, discussing in so doing the principal aspects of theory verification, the distinction between the a priori and convention, and the ontological structure of physical theory. Philosophy of science in the 1920s, Howard argues, reacted primarily and importantly to Einstein's theory of general relativity. In light of LIGO's first direct observation of gravitational waves, predicted by Einstein one hundred years before, this debate has lost nothing of its relevance.

Index

2001: A Space Odyssey (film), 34 Abraham, Max, 94, 100 accretion disks, 28-32 Adams, Walter S., 131 Adler, Friedrich, 193 affine formulation, 135 Akademie Olympia, 153-54 Albert Einstein Institute for Gravitational Physics, 3 amplitude, 14-15, 17, 48 Andromeda, 30 Avenarius, Richard, 154, 162 Bachem, Albert, 138 Bacon, Francis, 198n2 Bacon Foundation, viii bandwidth, 8, 48, 57, 61 Barish, Barry C., vii-viii; Caltech and, 1-2, 41; detection of gravitational waves and, 6-18, 36; LIGO and, 1-2, 34, 41, 43, 68, 126-28; management style of, 126-28; Nobel Prize and, 2; Sanders and, 126-27 Bauch, Bruno, 157 Bayesian analysis, 50-51 beam splitters, 12, 36-38 Belinsky, Vladimir, 32 Bender, Peter, 113-14 Bergson, Henri, 149 Bernays, Paul, 94 Besso, Michele, 92-94, 152, 160-61, 164 big bang, 23, 149 big science, 72-73, 122, 126 Billings, Heinz, 38 Binary Black Hole Grand Challenge Alliance (BBHGCA), 70, 72-73 BKL singularity, 32-33 black holes: accretion disks and, 28-32; astrophysics implications and, 51-53; binary, 2-3, 8, 11, 16, 18, 44-55, 52, 60, 62, 65, 68, 70-74, 118, 197n9; Buonanno on, 42-43, 47-61; chirp mass and, 17, 51; collision of, 3, 42-47, 69, 104, 110; computer simulation

of, 29-30; confidence levels and, 51, 53, 56, 58-59; electromagnetism and, 53, 57-58; event horizon and, 24, 30-31, 71, 74; field equations and, 3, 26, 32, 42, 50, 54, 56-57, 69, 71, 104; fundamental physics implications and, 54-56; future observations of, 56-59; gas and, 28-30, 53; as gravitational solitons, 24-25; inside, 31-34; inspiral phase and, 3, 8, 14, 15, 42, 48, 50, 57, 62, 66-67, 119; Interstellar and, 3, 21-34; light and, 18, 27-33, 35, 43, 44, 47-48, 50, 55-57, 60, 70-71; Markov Chain Monte Carlo algorithms and, 50; mass and, 17, 43, 45, 51, 53, 55, 119; mergers of, 2, 8, 16-18, 53, 68; nonlinear dynamics of, 23-25; numerical relativity and, 48-49, 50, 52, 55, 58, 69-74; plunging into, 24, 31-32, 34, 48, 50; post-Newtonian theory and, 50, 52, 54-55; pulsars and, 55-56, 58-60, 68; quadrupole formula and, 65, 68; quantum physics and, 23-36, 60; ringdown and, 14, 15, 17, 48, 50, 55, 74; signal analysis and, 3, 32, 47, 50-59; singularities and, 11, 31-34, 63-64, 71, 104, 108, 139; spacetime and, 11, 21-28, 31-34, 47-50, 55, 63-64, 71, 104, 108, 139; spin and, 17, 23-25, 28, 42-43, 48, 51-58, 73; tidal gravity and, 26-35, 57, 60; time and, 21-23, 31-34; waveforms and, 42-43, 47-51, 57; weight of, 30, 45 Bondi, Hermann, 64-65 Born, Max, 101, 173-74 Bruegmann, Bernd, 198n3 Buchwald, Diana Kormos, vii-xi, 129-48

bucket experiments, 80-81, 83

Buonanno, Alessandra, 3, 35, 42-43, 47-61

Cactus code, 73

Caltech: Barish and, 1–2, 41; Drever and, 38–39, 40, 122–23, 202n11; Einstein and, xi, 1–5, 129–47, 198; Jet Propulsion Laboratory and, 40; LIGO and, 6 (*see also* Laser Interferometer Gravitational-Wave Observatory (LIGO)); Lorentz and, 130–37; Massachusetts

228 INDEX

Caltech (continued) Institute of Technology (MIT) and, 1, 18, 38-42, 66, 122-23, 131; Millikan and, 129-32, 134, 140, 143, 145, 203n8; National Science Foundation (NSF) and, 39, 416; Norman Bridge Physics Laboratory and, 129, 132; Physics, Mathematics, and Astronomy (PMA) Division and, viii; Robertson and, 64; Space Radiation Laboratory and, 40; Thorne and, 36, 38-40, 66, 69, 121-22, 126 Carnap, Rudolf, 5, 150-51, 155-57, 164, 178, 190-92, 205n7, 205n11 Carnegie Institution, 132 Case Western University, 133 Cassiopeia A, 59 Cassirer, Ernst, 5, 149, 157, 175-78, 182-83, 192 causality, 157, 185, 192 Chapel Hill conferences, 11, 64-65, 69, 210n97 Chaplin, Charlie, 146 Charles University, 157 chirp mass, 17, 51 chronology protection conjecture, 34 Cohen, Hermann, 153, 174 Cold War, 110 collaborational infrastructure, 73 Collins, Harry, 4, 35, 65-66, 111-28 Compton, K. T., 135-36 computers, 30, 35, 42, 50, 59, 62, 69-71, 108 confidence levels, 51, 53, 56, 58-59 Conklin, E. B., 136 conservation of energy, 88, 90, 93, 98, 102 conservation of momentum, 88, 90, 93, 98, 102 Cosmic Explorer, 57, 59, 61 cosmic inflation, 23, 59 cosmic microwave background radiation, 23, 59 Crab pulsar, 59 Critiques (Kant), 152 cryogenic bars, 116 Cutler, Curt, 67 dark energy, 23, 149 dark matter, 23, 149 Dedekind, Richard, 154 de Sitter, Willem, 99-101 de Witt, Bryce, 69 "Do Gravitational Waves Exist?" (Einstein and Rosen), 11, 63-64 Drever, Ron: Caltech and, 38-39, 40, 122-23, 202n11; death of, 121; LIGO and, 122-26; Troika and, 123, 124; University of Glasgow and, 38-39, 122 Duhem, Pierre, 150-51, 158, 166, 183-85, 193, 195, 205n12

Dühring, Eugen, 153 Dukas, Helen, 141, 204n41

- Earth, 135; gravitational waves and, 11-13, 36, 44-45, 52-53, 59-60, 66, 112-18, 121, 137; gravity and, 20-21, 24, 26, 121, 137; Lagrange L1 point and, 60; line-of-sight signals and, 58; luminosity distances and, 52; Moon and, 26, 53; noise sources of, 11; spacetime experiment and, 21-22; Sun and, 20-21, 26, 137; tidal gravity and, 26; time and, 21-22, 24 Eddington, Arthur, 10, 63, 71, 100, 130, 135, 138, 186 Ehlers, Juergen, 65 Ehrenfest, Paul, 96, 130-32, 134, 138, 160-64, 169 Eidgenössische Technische Hochschule (ETH) [Swiss Federal Polytechnic], 152-53 Einstein, Albert: Caltech and, xi, 1, 5, 129–47; de Sitter and, 99-101; Entwurf theory and, 88, 91-98, 101, 158-59, 164, 199n39, 200n42, 200n52; field equations and, 6, 22 (see also field equations); field theory and, 78-81, 88, 92, 98, 100, 104-5, 143; frames of reference and, 77-83, 161-62; general relativity and, 5 (see also general relativity); gravity and, 8-10, 20-23, 32, 54, 57, 62, 89, 100, 105, 137, 139, 149; Mercury and, 9-10, 81, 82, 92-93, 95, 159; new spacetime framework of, 19 (see also spacetime); "On German American Agreement" and, 146; "On Gravitational Waves" and, 63, 64; "On the Cosmological Problem" and, 139; patent office and, 77, 88, 153; philosophy and, 151 (see also philosophy); principle of equivalence and, 76, 78-81, 83, 88, 138, 185; principle of relativity and, 19-20, 22, 79-80, 91, 95; quadrupole formula and, 10, 58, 63, 65, 68, 102, 201n2; Rosen and, 11, 63-65, 102; special relativity and, 19, 76-81, 83, 105, 129, 133, 154 Einstein, Elsa, 91, 137, 141, 143, 145, 204n37, 204n51 Einstein effect, 137-38 Einstein@Home, 59
- Einstein Papers Project, vii, 3–5, 198
- Einstein Telescope, 57, 59-61, 138
- Einstein Toolkit, 73
- Eisenstaedt, Jean, 103
- electromagnetic astronomy, 46, 74-75
- electromagnetic bookkeeping, 135 electromagnetism: black holes and, 53,
- 57–58; field theory and, 78–81, 88, 92, 98, 100, 104–5, 143; general relativity and, 76,

INDEX 229

78, 81, 90, 100; gravitational waves and, 18, 46, 53, 201n2; inertia and, 78, 81; pulsars and, 201n2

ellipticity, 59

- Elsbach, Alfred, 177, 193
- empiricism: general relativity and, 149–51, 155, 159–95, 205n8; "hole" argument and, 159–92; Kant and, 167, 173–93; new, 173–89; Petzoldt and, 162–64; philosophy and, 149–51, 155, 159–73, 178, 182–95, 205n8; Schlick and, 164–73, 182–94
- *Entwurf* theory, 88, 91–98, 101, 158–59, 164, 199n39, 200n42, 200n52
- Epstein, Paul, 131, 133-34
- equivalence, 76, 78-81, 83, 88, 138, 185
- "Essence of Truth According to Modern Logic, The" (Schlick), 166
- Euclidean geometry, 83, 173, 175–77, 179, 184–85, 191, 194
- European Space Agency, 46, 60, 113
- event horizon, 24, 30-31, 71, 74
- exemplars, 72
- expanding universe, 100, 139

Fabry-Perot cavity, 38, 121, 123–24, 202n12 Faller, Jim, 113 Feynman, Richard, 64, 69, 201n97

- field equations: black holes and, 3, 26, 32, 42, 50, 54, 56-57, 69, 71, 104; computer simulation of, 29-30; consequences of, 105; covariant, 159; development of, 82-98, 110; Entwurf theory and, 88, 91-98, 101, 158-59, 164, 199n39, 200n42, 200n52; equation of motion and, 81; fundamental physics implications and, 54-56; gravitational radiation and, 50; Minkowski and, 83-84; November theory and, 95-98; numerical relativity and, 42, 69-71; plane gravitational waves and, 101; publication of, 1, 3-4; reformulation of, 83-84, 108; Riemann tensor and, 88, 90, 95-96; Schwarzschild and, 56; spacetime and, 22-23; Zurich notebook and, 85-91
- field theory, 78–81, 88, 92, 98, 100, 104–5, 143 filters, 3, 47, 66–68
- Fleming, Arthur, 139-44
- Flexner, Abraham, 141, 145-46, 203n28
- Fokker, Adriaan, 94
- formalism, 50, 88-90, 93-96, 100
- Forward, Robert, 12, 116
- frame of reference, 77-83, 161-62
- Francis Bacon Award, viii, 198n2
- Frank, Philipp, 150, 157–58, 192
- Franklin Journal, 11

Freundlich, Erwin, 84–85, 94 Friedmann, Alexander, 100, 139 funding, 4, 7, 41, 110, 116, 118, 123, 126, 128

Galileo, 46, 77

- gamma rays, 53, 56–58
- general relativity: affine formulation of, 135; background context and, 149-58; beauty of, 2, 21-22; black holes and, 23-36, 31-34, 47, 50-51, 54-55, 60-61; closed universe and, 139; consequences of, 19, 23-46, 100-102; cosmological solution to, 99; counterintuitive measurements and, 19-20; detection of gravitational waves and, 6, 9-10; different kind of gravity wave and, 149-51; drama of November 1915 and, 95-98; electromagnetism and, 76, 78, 81, 90, 100; empiricism and, 149-51, 155, 159-95, 205n8; Entwurf theory and, 88, 91-98, 101, 158-59, 164, 199n39, 200n42, 200n52; equivalence and, 76, 78-81, 83, 88, 138, 185; expanding universe and, 100, 139; field equations and, 6, 32 (see also field equations); field theory and, 78-81, 88, 92, 98, 100, 104-5, 143; formalism for, 50, 88-90, 93-96, 100; formative years of, 98-100; frame of reference and, 77-83, 161-62; Golden Age of, 104-5; historical perspective on, 8-18, 100-102; "hole" argument and, 95, 98, 158-92; impact on philosophy of, 5, 149-96 (see also philosophy); inertia and, 77-78, 80-81, 83, 99-100, 198n7; Kant and, 150-53, 157, 167, 173-93, 205n7, 205n8; kinematic framework for, 76-77; light and, 1, 5, 10, 60, 78-79, 81, 84-85, 100-101, 129, 137, 139, 172, 186; linearized approximation and, 63; low-water mark period of, 102-4; Mach and, 80-81, 83, 95, 99, 158, 162, 164, 167-70, 173, 183; Mercury and, 9-10, 81, 82, 92-93, 95, 159; Minkowski and, 83-84; Newton and, 9-10, 20, 76-81, 83, 85, 88, 90, 93-96, 101, 104, 149, 153, 158-59, 168; prediction of gravitational waves by, 10-11, 34-46 (see also gravitational waves); principle of equivalence and, 78-81; pulsars and, 23, 109; quantum physics and, 23, 34, 79, 94, 100, 105, 156; renaissance of, 104-8; Schlick and, 98, 150-51, 154-56, 164-75, 179-94, 205n1, 205n9, 205n10; solar eclipse and, xi, 1, 75, 100, 130, 137; spacetime and, 23, 27, 34, 42, 49, 50, 83-84, 85, 98, 157, 159-62, 165, 167, 170-73, 175, 183, 185, 190; static universe and, 100, 139; transformation of, 104-10; Zurich notebook and, 85-91, 100, 199n23

230 INDEX

General Relativity at One Hundred: The Sixth Biennial Bacon Conference, 10–12 March 2016, Pasadena, CA, vii–xi

GEO600, 60

- geometry: analytic, 185; axiomatic, 176–77, 191; Carnap and, 178; differential, 161;
 Euclidean, 83, 173, 175–77, 179, 184–85, 191, 194–95; geometrodynamics and, 23; metric tensor and, 85; Poincaré and, 150, 194; practical, 176; spacetime and, 23, 45, 55, 64, 69, 83, 139, 173
- Gertsenshtein, M. E., 116
- Gezari, Suvi, 30
- Ghez, Andrea, 30
- gravitational lensing, 27-29, 44, 85, 86, 149
- gravitational radiation: black hole mergers and, 15; field equations and, 50; LAGOS and, 113; polarization of, 2; sources of, 65–66; Thorne and, 2; Weber and, 202n7 gravitational waves: beginnings of search
- for, 108-10; confidence levels and, 51, 53, 56, 58-59; controversies over, 63-66; detection of, vii, 1-8, 12, 38, 41-47, 53, 56-57, 62, 65-66, 74, 110-28, 201n1, 201n2; doubting existence of, 11, 63-66; Earth and, 12-13, 36, 44-45, 52-53, 59-60, 66, 112-18, 121, 137; Einstein's changing views on, 63-64, 112; electromagnetism and, 18, 46, 53, 201n2; future observations of, 56-61; GR100 conference and, vii-xi; historical perspective on, 8-18, 100-102, 111-28; indirect observation of, 112-13; Isaacson and, 40; neutron stars and, 18, 36, 46, 51, 56-59, 118; new era of physics and, 47-61; prediction of, 10-11, 34-46; pulsars and, 46, 112, 201n2; quadrupole formula and, 10, 58, 63, 65, 68, 102, 201n2; quest for, 6-18; ripples of, 4, 35, 45; Schwarzschild and, 100-101; signal analysis and, 3, 8, 12-18, 44, 45, 47, 50-62, 66-67, 69, 74, 112-13, 116-23, 126, 201n2; singularities and, 11, 31-34, 63-64, 71, 104, 108, 139; sociological perspective on, 1, 4, 35, 114-16, 119-21, 201n1, 202n5; spacetime and, 1, 5, 23, 27, 34-36, 42, 44, 47-50, 64, 84, 85, 114; speed of, 35; spurious forms of, 63; Thorne's wager and, 62-63, 70, 198n3; waveforms and, 8, 13-14, 17, 35-36, 42-43, 47-51, 57, 62, 67, 70, 73, 120, 198n1, 202n8
- gravity: Earth and, 20–21, 24, 26, 121, 137;
 Einstein and, 8–10, 20–23, 32, 54, 57, 62, 89, 100, 105, 137, 139, 149; field theory and, 78–81, 88, 92, 98, 100, 104–5, 143; La-

grange L1 point and, 60; loop quantum gravity and, 23; Newton and, 9-10, 20, 54, 104, 149, 153; relativistic description of, 20-23; singularities and, 11, 31-34, 53-54, 71, 104, 108, 139; solitons and, 24-25; spacetime and, 8-9 (see also spacetime); Sun and, 9, 15, 20, 26, 45, 56, 118-19, 137; tidal, 26-35, 57, 60 Gravity's Shadow (Collins), 121-23 Grebe, Leonhard, 138 Grossman, Marcel, 87-94, 158 Guillochon, James, 29-30 Gutfreund, Hanoch, viii GW150714 event, 66 GW150911 event, 16-17 GW150914 event, 16, 43-55, 57, 63, 66, 69, 73-74, 198n1 GW151226 event, 2, 18, 47-55, 57 Habicht, Conrad, 153 Hahn, Hans, 150 Hahn, Susan, 69 Hale, George, xi, 5, 129-31, 135 Harvard-Smithsonian Center for Astrophysics, 21 Havas, Peter, 6565 Hawking, Stephen, 34, 70 Hearst Universal Service, 134 Hebrew University, xi, 129 Hertz, Paul, 159-60 Hilbert, David, 93-98, 105, 149, 160, 164, 190-91 Hitler, Adolf, 140, 147 "hole" argument: empiricism and, 159-92; general relativity and, 95, 98, 158-92; Petzoldt and, 162-64; philosophy and, 158-92; Schlick and, 95, 164-75, 179-92 Howard, Don, 5, 149-96 Hubble, Edwin, 138-39, 141 Hulse, Russell A., 4, 65, 201n2 Human Bettermnet Foundation, 147 Humason, Milton, 139, 204n37 Hume, David, 154, 174, 205n1 Husserl, Edmund, 178 Hydrodynamic code, 73

IBM, 69

Idea of a Social Science, The (Winch), 115 India, 14, 58

inertia: bucket experiments and, 80–81, 83; electromagnetism and, 78, 81; general relativity and, 77–78, 80–81, 83, 99–100, 198n7; Mach on, 80–81, 83, 99; static universe and, 100

INDEX 231

Infeld, Leopold, 64-65, 102, 107, 201n86 infrared light, 53, 57-58 inspiral phase, 3, 8, 14, 15, 42, 48, 50, 57, 62, 66-67, 119 Institute for Advanced Study, 5, 141, 144, 203n28, 204n53 International Committee for Intellectual Cooperation, 131 Interpretations and Misinterpretations of Modern Physics (Frank), 157-58 Interstellar (film), 3, 21-34 Isaacson, Richard, 40, 121 Janssen, Michel, 88-89, 92-93, 198, 199n23 Jet Propulsion Laboratory, 40 Juggernaut, 67 Jupiter, 46 KAGRA, 14, 18, 58 Kant, Immanuel: Cassirer and, 175, 177-78, 183, 192; doctrine of intuition and, 167, 173-79, 184-85; empiricism and, 167, 173-93; general relativity and, 150-53, 157, 167, 173-93, 205n7, 205n8; neo-Kantianism and, 173-89; Reichenbach and, 150-51, 173, 178-81, 184-85, 192-93, 205n7, 205n8 Keller, Helen, 141 Kennedy, R. J., 134 Kennefick, Daniel, 3, 36, 62-75, 111-12 Kerr, 56

Khalatnikov, Isaak, 32 kilonovae, 58 Kretschmann, Erich, 98 Kubrick, Stanley, 34 Kuhn, Thomas, 72

L3 mission, 60 Lagrange L1 point, 60 Lange, Friedrich Albert, 174 Laser Antenna for Gravitational radiation Observation in Space (LAGOS), 113 Laser Interferometer Gravitational-Wave Observatory (LIGO): Advanced, 2, 6-8, 11-12, 43, 48, 50, 53, 56-61, 71, 73, 118, 128, 197n9; astrophysics implications and, 51-53; Barish and, viii, 1-2, 34, 41, 43, 68, 126-28; chirp mass and, 17, 51; coincidence times and, 11, 16; confidence levels and, 51, 53, 56, 58-59; construction of, 6-7; design of, 12-14; detection of gravitational waves and, 1-7, 12, 41-42, 47, 53, 57, 62, 66, 75, 118, 121, 125-26, 128; Drever and, 122-26; early observation runs of, 2, 6; fundamental

physics implications and, 54-56; funding of, 4, 7, 41, 118, 123, 126, 128; future observations of, 56-59; GW150714 event, 66; GW150911 event, 16-17; GW150914 event, 16, 43-55, 57, 63, 66, 69, 73-74, 198n1; GW151226 event, 2, 18, 47-55, 57; Hanford location of, 8, 9, 13-14, 17, 45, 48, 126; India and, 14, 58; Initial, 6-8, 71, 74, 128; KAGRA and, 14, 18, 58; Livingston location of, 8, 9, 13, 17, 45, 48; Markov Chain Monte Carlo algorithms and, 50; mirrors and, 12, 36, 37, 47, 122-25; MREFC program and, 7; neutron stars and, 18, 46, 51, 56-59, 65-66, 73, 204; numerical relativity and, 62, 69-74; pendulum of, 12; pulsars and, 55-56, 59, 65, 68; resonant bars and, 4, 11-12, 66, 108, 116, 122; sensitivity levels of, 6-8, 11, 18, 46, 51, 53, 56-60, 74, 127; signal-to-noise ratio (SNR) and, 47, 55-56, 61 (see also signal analysis); spacetime and, 13, 34, 42, 50, 64, 69-71; split beams and, 12, 36-38; theorists' role in, 66-69; Thorne and, 2-3, 62-63, 66-71, 74-75, 121-23, 126, 198n3; Troika and, 123, 124; two-step concept of, 7; vacuum vessels of, 7, 12; Virgo and, 2, 14, 18, 45, 56-61, 197; Vogt and, 40-41, 123, 125-26; waveforms and, 8, 13-14, 17, 35-36, 42-43, 47-51, 57, 62, 67, 70, 73, 120, 198n1, 202n8; Weiss and, 2, 36, 37-38, 68, 116-17, 121-23, 125 Laser Interferometer Space Antenna (LISA), 46, 59-60, 112-14, 117 lasers, 12, 36, 37-38, 60 "Last Three Minutes, The: Issues in Gravitational Wave Measurements of Coalescing Compact Binaries" (Cutler et al.), 67 League of Nations, 131 Lemaître, Georges, 100, 139, 146, 204n38 Le Roy, Edouard, 183-84 Libman, Emanuel, 141 Lifshitz, Evgeny, 32 light: bending of, 1, 5, 10, 18, 78, 81, 84, 100, 137; black holes and, 27-33, 35, 47-48, 50, 55-57, 60; detection of gravitational waves and, 10-15, 35-38, 123; eclipses and, xi, 1, 75, 100, 130, 137; general relativity and, 1, 5, 10, 60, 78-79, 81, 84-85, 100-101, 129, 137, 139, 172, 186; infrared, 53, 57-58; laser, 12, 36, 37-38, 60; quantum physics and, 60, 79, 100, 129; redshift and, 17, 44, 52, 61, 78, 81, 84, 100, 138-40, 203n32; solar eclipse and, xi, 1, 75, 100, 130, 137; speed of, 11, 13, 15, 19, 22, 48, 50, 63, 71, 76, 79, 134; subjective coincidence and, 172

232 INDEX

LIGO Scientific Collaboration (LSC), 68, 73-75 Lindquist, Richard, 69 loop quantum gravity, 23 Lorentz, Hendrik A., 130-37 luminosity, 17, 51-52 McConaughey, Matthew, 32 Mach, Ernst: analysis of mechanics and, 80, 152; Besso and, 152; Frank and, 158; general relativity and, 80-81, 83, 95, 99, 158, 162, 164, 167-70, 173, 183; inertia and, 80-81, 83, 99; influence of, 152, 154-55; philosophy and, 150, 152, 154-56, 158, 162, 164, 167-70, 173, 183; positivism of, 162; Schlick and, 150, 154, 156, 167-68, 170, 173, 183; two-bucket experiment and, 80-81, 83 magnetism, 133, 135, 193 Major Research Equipment and Construction (MREFC) program, 7 Marburg thesis, 175 Markov Chain Monte Carlo algorithms, 50 Mars, 21 Marx, Jay, 42, 128 **MASER**, 108 Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT): Caltech and, 1, 18, 38-42, 66, 122-23, 131; LIGO and, 40 (see also Laser Interferometer Gravitational-Wave Observatory (LIGO)); Vogt and, 40, 123, 126; Weiss and, 36-39, 122-23 materialism, 153, 175 Max Planck Institute, 3, 8 Mayer, Walther, 144-45, 204n53 Meers, Brian, 122 Mercury, 9-10, 81, 82, 92-93, 95, 159 metallicity, 53 Meyerson, Émile, 149 Michelson-Morley experiments, 135 Milky Way, 30, 31, 45, 58 Mill, John Stuart, 154 Miller, Dayton C., 133-35 Millikan, Greta, 137, 140 Millikan, Robert, 129-32, 134, 140, 143, 145, 203n8 Minkowski, Hermann, 83-84 mirrors, 12, 36, 37, 47, 122-25 Misner, Charles, 69 Mizuno, Jun, 122 moons, 26, 46, 53, 57 Mount Wilson Observatory, 99, 100, 129, 131-35, 138-40, 144, 204n37

M theory, 23 Munto, William Bennett, 146-47 NASA, 9, 113 National Academy of Sciences, 130 National Center for Super-Computing Applications (NCSA), 70 National Research Fellowship, 130 National Science Board, 6 National Science Foundation (NSF), 4, 6-7, 39-41, 70, 121, 126-27, 198n8 Natorp, Paul, 174 Nazis, 5, 140, 145, 147 neutron stars: binary, 2, 4, 18, 56-57, 73, 118, 197n9; collision of, 3, 46, 104; future observations of, 56-59; gravitational waves and, 18, 36, 46, 51, 56-59, 118; GW151226 and, 51-53; LIGO and, 18, 46, 51, 56-59, 65-66, 73, 204; mergers and, 2-3, 18, 51, 56-60, 104, 197n10; signal analysis and, 3, 56-59 Newman, Ted, 65, 107 Newton, Isaac: action at a distance and, 76; general relativity and, 9-10, 20, 76-81, 83, 85, 88, 90, 93-96, 101, 104, 149, 153, 158-59, 168; gravity and, 9-10, 20, 54, 104, 149, 153; as greatest scientific mind, 20; Mach and, 80; Mercury and, 9-10, 81, 93, 159; Oldenburg and, 153; optics and, 153; physics framework of, 19; post-Newtonian techniques and, 42, 50, 52, 54-55, 68, 74; Rosenberger on, 153, 175; spacetime and, 19, 76-77; Sun and, 9, 20; two-bucket experiment and, 80-81, 83; Wesftall and, 153, 175 New York Times, 135, 138-39 Nobel Prize, 2, 65, 120, 131, 201n2 Noether, Max, 156 noise, 7, 11-13, 37, 47, 60-62, 66-68, 113, 125-27 Nolan, Christopher, 21, 25-26, 34 Nordström, Gunnar, 94, 102 Norman Bridge Physics Laboratory, 129, 132 Norton, John, 89, 199n23, 205n5 November theory, 95-98 nucleosynthesis, 58 numerical relativity, 198; black holes and, 48-49, 50, 52, 55, 58, 69-74; collaborational infrastructure and, 72-73; computers and, 69-71; detection of gravitational waves and, 15, 42; LIGO and, 62, 69-74; signal analysis and, 69-74; Smarr and, 69-72, 198n8; SXS Collaboration and, 35, 42-44, 45, 50

INDEX 233

Oldenburg, Henry, 153 "On German American Agreement" (Einstein), 146 "On Gravitational Waves" (Einstein), 63, 64 "On the Cosmological Problem" (Einstein), 139 Ooguri, Hirosi, viii Oppenheimer, Robert, 146 optics, 153 Oxford University, 139

Pearson, Karl, 154 pendulums, 12 Penrose, Roger, 65, 107 perihelion motion, 81, 82, 92-93, 95, 159 Petzoldt, Joseph, 162-64 Philosophical Investigations (Wittgenstein), 115 philosophy, 1, 80; Avenarius and, 154, 162; Carnap and, 5, 150-51, 155-57, 164, 178, 190-92, 205n7, 205n11; Cassirer and, 5, 149, 157, 175-78, 182-83, 192; causality and, 157, 185, 192; coincidences and, 151, 159-73, 175, 190; conventionalism and, 150-51, 157-58, 164, 166, 173-88, 193-95; Dedekind and, 154; Duhem and, 150-51, 158, 166, 183-85, 193, 195, 205n12; empiricism and, 149-51, 155, 159-73, 178, 182-95, 205n8; Frank and, 150, 157-58; historical perspective for, 151-58; "hole" argument and, 158-92; Hume and, 154, 174, 205n1; Kant and, 150-51, 173, 178-81, 184-85, 192-93, 205n7, 205n8; Mach and, 150, 152, 154-56, 158, 162, 164, 167-70, 173, 183; materialism and, 153, 175; Mill and, 154; modern structure of, 149-51; ontological issues and, 5, 150-51, 159-73, 190, 202n6; Pearson and, 154; Petzoldt and, 162-64; physics and, 155-58; Poincaré and, 154, 194; positivism and, 153-54, 158, 162-63, 192, 195; Quine and, 150, 195-96, 205n12; reductionism and, 195; Reichenbach and, 5, 150-51, 155-56, 162, 171-73, 178-86, 190-95, 205nn7-9, 205n12; Schlick and, 5, 98, 150-51, 154-56, 164-75, 179-94, 205n1, 205n9, 205n10; sensualism and, 150, 183; univocalness and, 151, 158-64, 166, 170, 173, 175, 178, 180, 190-91, 194; Vienna Circle and, 150, 155-57, 178, 189; Weyl and, 135, 149, 192, 200n61; Wittgenstein and, 115 photons, 13 Physical Review Letters, 6, 11, 37, 63-64, 102 Pirani, Felix, 64-65, 201n97

Pirenne, Henri, 130, 203n8

Planck, Max, 94, 145, 155-56, 179

Planck satellite, 59 plasma, 57 plunge, 24, 31-32, 34, 48, 50 Poincaré, Henri, 150, 154, 158, 166, 180-84, 193-95 positivism, 153-54, 158, 162-63, 192, 195 post-Newtonian theory, 42, 50-55, 68, 74 Pound-Drever-Hall method, 123 Press, Bill, 36 Pretorius, Frans, 71, 120 Princeton University, 5, 64, 135-36, 141, 144-46, 148, 203n28, 204n53 principle of relativity, 19-20, 22, 79-80, 91, 95 Prussian Academy, 145 Prussian Ministry of Science, 130 pulsars: arrival times and, 60; binary, 23, 55-56, 65, 68, 109, 112, 201n2; black holes and, 55-56, 58-60, 68; Cassiopeia A, 59; Crab, 59; general relativity and, 23, 109; gravitational waves and, 46, 112, 201n2; LIGO and, 55-56, 59, 65, 68; mass of, 3, 15, 17, 42-43, 45, 48, 50-58, 60-61, 74, 119-20; post-Newtonian coefficient and, 55; radio telescopes and, 46; rotation frequency of, 58-59; synthesis calculations and, 56; Vela, 59 Pulsar Timing Array (PTA), 60 Pustovoit, V. I., 116 Pythagorean theorem, 84 PZT detectors, 11 quadrupole formula, 10, 58, 63, 65, 68, 102, 201n2 quantum gravity, 23, 31-34, 46 quantum physics: black holes and, 60; general relativity and, 23, 34, 79, 94, 100, 104-5, 157; laws of, 31-34, 46; light and, 60, 79, 100; loop quantum gravity and, 23 quasars, 74, 104-5 Quine, W.V.O., 150, 195-96, 205n12 radio astronomy, 21-22, 30, 46, 53, 57-58 rapid-neutron capture (r-process), 58 Reasenberg, Robert, 21-22 redshift, 17, 44, 52, 61, 78, 81, 84, 100, 138-40, 203n32 reductionism, 195 Reichenbach, Hans: Kant and, 150-51, 173, 178-81, 184-85, 192-93, 205n7, 205n8;

philosophy and, 5, 150–51, 155–56, 162, 171–73, 178–86, 190–95, 205nn7–9, 205n12; Schlick and, 5, 150–51, 155, 171–73, 179–85, 190–94, 205n9

234 INDEX

Reitze, David, viii, 42, 128 Renn, Jürgen, viii, 3-4, 20, 76-110, 199n23, 205n5 resonant bars, 4, 11-12, 66, 108, 116, 122 Rhodes Lectures, 139 Riehl, Alois, 174 Riemann tensor, 88, 90, 95-96 ringdown, 14, 15, 17, 48, 50, 55, 74 Robertson, Howard Percy, 64, 102 Rosen, Nathan, 11, 63-65, 102 Rosenberger, Ferdinand, 153 Royal Society, 153 Russell, H. N., 136 Ryckman, Tom, 149 Sachs, Rai, 65 St. John, Charles, 138 Sandage, Allan, 138 Sanders, Gary, 126-28 satellites, 53, 59, 112-14 Saturn, 57 Sauer, Tilman, 1-5, 89 Schlick, Moritz: empiricism and, 164-73, 182-94; "The Essence of Truth According to Modern Logic" and, 166; general relativity and, 98, 150-51, 154-56, 164-75, 179-94, 205n1, 205n9, 205n10; "hole" argument and, 95, 164-75, 179-92; Mach and, 150, 154, 156, 167-68, 170, 173, 183; philosophy and, 5, 98, 150-51, 154-56, 164-75, 179-94, 205n1, 205n9, 205n10; Reichenbach and, 5, 150-51, 155, 171-73, 179-85, 190-94, 205n9 Schneider, Ilse, 174 Schwarzschild, Karl, 15, 56, 63, 100-101, 139, 200n67 Science of Interstellar, The (Thorne), 34 Seelig, Carl, 152 Sellien, Ewald, 174 sensualism, 150, 183 Shapiro, Irwin, 21-22 Shoemaker, David, 128 signal analysis: amplitude and, 14-15, 17, 48; black holes and, 3, 32, 47, 50-59; electromagnetic, 18; error and, 71; extraction of, 68-69; filters and, 3, 47, 66-68; gravitational waves and, 3, 8, 12-18, 44, 45, 50-59, 62, 66-67, 69, 74, 112-13, 116-23, 126, 201n2; LIGO observatories and, 13-14; neutron stars and, 3, 56-59; numerical relativity and, 69-74; strain signals and, 8; Thorne wager and, 62-63, 70-71, 198n3; time and, 13-14, 21-22, 32; Weber and, 11-12, 112, 116-17

signal-to-noise ratio (SNR), 47, 55-56, 61 singularities: BKL, 32-33; black holes and, 31-34, 139; Friedmann and, 139; Schwarzschild and, 139; spacetime and, 11, 31-34, 63-64, 71, 104, 108, 139 Slipher, Vesto, 138-39 Smarr, Larry, 69-72, 198n8 sociology, 1, 4, 35, 111, 114-16, 119-21, 201n1, 202n5 solar eclipse, xi, 1, 75, 100, 130, 137 solitons, 24-25 Solovine, Maurice, 153 Solvay Congress, 135 Sommerfeld, Arnold, 88, 94-96, 101, 137 Space Radiation Laboratory, 40 spacetime: absolute, 19; black holes and, 21-28, 34, 47-50, 55; Carnap and, 178; coincidences and, 69, 165; cosmic strings and, 23, 46, 59, 202n5; counter-intuitive measurements and, 19-20; curved, 2, 55, 83-85; direct observation of, 4; field equations and, 22-23; general relativity and, 83-84, 98, 157, 159-62, 165, 167, 170-73, 175, 183, 185, 190; geometry and, 23, 45, 55, 64, 69, 83, 139, 173; gravitational waves and, 1, 5, 23, 34-36, 44, 47-50, 64, 114; LIGO and, 13, 34, 42, 50, 64, 69-71; Minkowski and, 83-84; Newton and, 19, 76-77; ripples of, 4, 35, 45; singularities and, 11, 31-34, 63-64, 71, 104, 108, 139; solitons and, 24-25; special relativity and, 79-80; SXS Collaboration and, 35, 42-44, 45, 50; verification of, 20-21; Viking experiment and, 21, 22; warped, 2, 13, 20-25, 27, 29, 34, 48, 71; Wheeler on, 84; wormholes and, 23; Zurich notebook and, 85-91, 199n23 special relativity, 19, 76-81, 83, 105, 129, 133, 154 spectra, 50, 59-61, 132, 137 SS Belgenland, 140 Stachel, John, 89, 205n5 Stadler, August, 153, 174 static universe, 100, 139 Stern, Otto, 82, 199n15 sticky-bead argument, 64, 69 string theory, 23, 46, 59, 202n5 Strömberg, Gustaf, 131, 138-39 Sun: bending light and, 137, 186; black holes and, 45, 56; density of, 56; Earth and, 20-21, 26, 137; Einstein effect and, 137-38; gravity and, 9, 15, 20, 26, 45, 56, 118-19, 137; Lagrange L1 point and, 60; Newton and, 9, 20; relative mass of, 15, 26, 45, 119; spacecraft signal time and, 21-22; spectral shift and, 137; weight of, 30

INDEX 235

supercomputers, 62, 69–71 supernovae, 46, 53, 58, 60, 113 Swiss Federal Patent Office, 77, 88, 153 SXS Collaboration, 35, 42–44, 45, 50 symmetry, 56, 64

Talmey, Max, 152

- Tate, John T., 64, 102
- Taudin, Laurent, 77, 82, 84–85, 90, 94, 110, 198, 802
- Taylor, H. S., 136
- Taylor, Joe, 4, 65, 112–14, 201n2
- telescopes, 3, 30–31, 41, 46, 53, 57, 59, 61, 129, 138
- tensors, 59, 85–90, 95–96
- tesseracts, 33
- Teukolsky, Saul, 42
- thermodynamics, 79
- Thorne, Kip S., vii-viii; BBHGCA and, 70; black holes and, 23–36; Caltech and, 66, 69, 121–22, 126; Golden Age of relativity and, 104–5; gravitational waves and, 2, 34–46; group meetings of, 66; influence of, 2–3; Juggernaut group of, 67; Kennefick and, 3; LIGO and, 2–3, 62, 66–71, 74–75, 121–23, 126; Nobel Prize and, 2; *The Science of Interstellar* and, 34; Troika and, 123, *124*; wager of, 62–63, 70–71, 198n3; Weber and, 36
 tidal disruption, 29–30
- time travel, 21–23, 31–34
- Titan, 57
- Tolmon Di
- Tolman, Richard C., 139, 204n37 Toscanini, Arturo, 141
- Trautman, Andrzej, 65, 107
- Traveling at the Speed of Thought (Kennefick), 111–12

Troika, 123, *124*

Two Essays on Entropy (Carnap), 157

University of Glasgow, 38–39, 122 University of Maryland, 3, 36 US-Germany Peace Treaty, 130

vacuum pipes, 12 Veblen, Oswald, 135–36, 141, 144–46, 164, 203n26, 203n28, 205n58 Vela pulsar, 59 Vessot, Robert, 21 Vienna Circle, 150, 155-57, 178, 189 Viking spacecraft, 21, 22 Virgo, 2, 14, 18, 45, 56-61, 197n9 Vogt, Rochus, 40-41, 123, 125-26 von Papen, Franz, 145 Walter Burke Institute, viii waveforms: Bayesian analysis and, 50; black holes and, 42-43, 50-51, 57; gravitational waves and, 8, 13-14, 17, 35-36, 42, 47-51, 57, 62, 67, 70, 73, 120, 198n1, 202n8; Markov Chain Monte Carlo algorithms and, 50 Weber, Joe: background of, 36; controversy over, 65-66, 108-9, 112, 116, 201n7; death of, 112; detectors and, 11, 36, 42, 66, 108-12, 116, 120; influence of, 112-14, 116-17, 119-21, 125, 128; LISA and, 112-14, 117; resonant bars and, 4, 11-12, 66, 108, 116, 122; signal analysis and, 11-12, 112, 116-

- 17; Thorne and, 36; Weiss and, 116–17 Weinberg, Steven, 67
- Weisberg, Joel M., 65, 112–14, 201n2
- Weiss, Rainer: Chapman and, 116–17; Drever and, 121; LIGO and, 2, 36, 37–38, 68, 116–17, 121–23, 125; MIT and, 36, 122–23; Nobel Prize and, 2; technical paper of, 36–39; Troika and, 123, *124*
- Westfall, Richard, 153, 175
- Westphal, Wilhelm, 130
- Weyl, Hermann, 135, 149, 192, 200n61
- Wheeler, John, 36, 69, 84, 108, 199n13, 201n97
- Whiskey, 73
- Whitcomb, Stan, 39
- Will, Clifford, 104
- Winch, Peter, 115
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 115
- wormholes, 23

X rays, 53, 57–58, 117, 132

Yerkes Observatory, 129

Zurich notebook, 85–91, 100, 199n23 Zurich Polytechnic, 87