## Contents

List of Figures ..... ix
List of Tables ..... xv
Foreword ..... xxi
Preface ..... xxix
Chapter 1. Historical Context ..... 1
Chapter 2. The Admissions Process and "Race-Neutrality" ..... 15
Chapter 3. Academic Outcomes ..... 53
Chapter 4. Advanced Study: Graduate and Professional Degrees ..... 91
Chapter 5. Employment, Earnings, and Job Satisfaction ..... 118
Chapter 6. Civic Participation and Satisfaction with Life ..... 155
Chapter 7. Looking Back: Views of College ..... 193
Chapter 8. Diversity: Perceptions and Realities ..... 218
Chapter 9. Informing the Debate ..... 256
Chapter 10. Summing Up ..... 275
Afterword ..... 291
Appendix A. The College and Beyond Database ..... 295
Appendix B. Notes on Methodology ..... 340
Appendix C. Earnings in Relation to Advanced Degrees, Sector of Employment, and Occupation ..... 366
Appendix D. Additional Tables ..... 379
References ..... 455
Index ..... 465

## CHAPTER1

## Historical Context

Few people today recall the full measure of the predicament in which African Americans found themselves prior to World War II. In 1940, most black men and women lived out of common view in rural communities, chiefly in the South. Approximately 90 percent lived in poverty (measured by today's criteria). ${ }^{1}$ Their annual earnings were less than half those of whites. The education they received was markedly inferior in quality. African American children in the South went to predominantly black schools, in which (on average) pupil-teacher ratios were one-quarter greater than those in white schools, school terms were 10 percent shorter, and black teachers were paid half the salary of white teachers. ${ }^{2}$ The median amount of education received by blacks aged $25-29$ was about seven years. ${ }^{3}$ Only 12 percent of blacks aged $25-29$ had completed high school; less than 2 percent could claim a college degree. ${ }^{4}$

Very few blacks managed to enter the higher-paying occupations. Only 1.8 percent of all male professionals were black, and only 1.3 percent of all male managers and proprietors. ${ }^{5}$ Blacks made up 2.8 percent of physicians, 0.5 percent of attorneys, and 0.5 percent of engineers. No more than thirty-three elected officials in the entire United States were black. Of these, one was a member of Congress, but there were no mayors, governors, or senators. Only a single African American sat on the federal bench. ${ }^{6}$

World War II brought an unprecedented demand for factory labor and a new wave of migration to the North, trends that did much to better the material circumstances of blacks. The sustained economic growth that followed the war accomplished even more. From 1940 to 1960, black poverty rates declined from roughly 93 to 55 percent, while expected lifetime earnings as a percentage of the prevailing levels for

[^0]whites rose from 42 to 50 percent for men and from 56 to 72 percent for women. ${ }^{7}$

Educational levels also increased as millions of blacks moved from the rural South to the urban North and as Southern states improved black schools in an effort to slow the outward migration of cheap labor. By 1960, even in the South, teachers' salaries and the length of the school term were approximately equal in black and white schools, and the high pupil-teacher ratios for black schools had declined to within approximately 10 percent of the average level in predominantly white schools. ${ }^{8}$ Meanwhile, median years of schooling for blacks aged 25-29 grew from approximately 7 years in 1940 to 10.5 years in $1960 .{ }^{9}$ Over the same period, the proportion of blacks aged 25-29 who had graduated from high school increased from 12.3 to 38.6 percent, and the percentage graduating from college rose from 1.6 to 5.4 percent. ${ }^{10}$

Despite these gains, little progress occurred in opening elite occupations to African Americans. The percentage of all professionals who were black rose to 3.8 percent for men and 6.0 percent for women, while the percentages of managers and proprietors who were black grew only to 3.0 percent for men and 1.8 percent for women. ${ }^{11}$ The percentage of physicians who were black, only 2.8 in 1940, failed to increase at all during the ensuing 20 years. Meanwhile, the proportion of attorneys who were black rose only from 0.5 percent to 1.2 percent, while the percentage of black engineers remained the same. ${ }^{12}$ The number of black elected officials jumped from 33 in 1941 to 280 in 1965, but even this total was only a tiny fraction of the thousands of elected offices throughout the nation. No more than four African Americans sat in Congress (less than 1 percent of all members), and there were still no senators. The largest gains came at the lower levels of government, with increasing numbers of blacks serving as state legislators (26 to 102), mayors (0 to 3), city council members ( 4 to 74 ), and school board members ( 2 to 68 ). In 1961, only four federal judges were black. ${ }^{13}$

The early postwar period also brought several Supreme Court rulings that changed the impact of the Constitution on African Americans. Most of these decisions involved educational opportunity. A 1938 Supreme

[^1]Court opinion had found that Missouri had violated the Equal Protection Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment by barring blacks from attending the state university's law school, giving them tuition money instead to attend an out-of-state law school. ${ }^{14}$ In 1949, the Court went further, ruling that Texas could not satisfy the Fourteenth Amendment by establishing a separate law school for blacks. ${ }^{15}$ Finally, in 1954, a unanimous Supreme Court handed down its celebrated decision in Brown v. Board of Education, putting an end to de jure school segregation in the South. ${ }^{16}$

As events unfolded, the early effects of Brown proved to be limited. Although the prohibition against segregation was quickly extended to public transportation and other state-owned facilities, these rulings were not widely enforced. Southern politicians uniformly denounced the school desegregation decision, and white citizens' councils sprang up in countless Southern communities to harass any black who advocated desegregation.

Responding to these developments, blacks began to organize. ${ }^{17}$ The Montgomery, Alabama, bus boycott in 1955-1956 brought Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., to prominence and launched a long series of efforts to desegregate public transportation, schools, and places of public accommodation throughout the South. During the rest of the decade, however, the federal government refused to take decisive action to secure the rights of blacks. Faced with open defiance by an Arkansas governor, President Eisenhower reluctantly sent federal troops to Little Rock to enforce a court order to integrate the schools, but the executive branch did little more to hasten the end of segregation. Congress did even less, passing a Civil Rights Act in 1957 that was too weak to have much effect in breaching the barriers to black voter registration in the South.

## THE ORIGINS AND DEVELOPMENT OF RACE-SENSITIVE ADMISSIONS POLICIES

In 1960, then, the outlook for blacks seemed highly uncertain. Their economic position had improved greatly but was still vastly inferior to that of whites. Although they had acquired important new constitutional

[^2]rights, these Supreme Court rulings had not yet produced much tangible change. Moreover, the role of blacks in the nation's power structure was virtually nonexistent. Very few African Americans held public office, and few had entered the elite occupations and professions. Virtually no blacks could be found in the country's leading corporations, banks, hospitals, or law firms. Erwin Smigel reported in his 1960s study of Wall Street law firms: "In the year and a half that was spent interviewing, I only heard of three Negroes who had been hired by large law firms. Two of these were women who did not meet the client." ${ }^{18}$ Colleges and professional schools enrolled few black students. In 1965, only 4.8 percent of all U.S. college students were African American. ${ }^{19}$

The position of blacks in selective colleges and universities was, if anything, even more marginal than in higher education as a whole. Occasionally, a particular college demonstrated a desire to attract black students. As early as 1835 , the Oberlin board of trustees declared that "the education of the people of color is a matter of great interest and should be encouraged and sustained in this institution." ${ }^{20}$ Beginning in 1941, Antioch College took steps to recruit black students and managed to enroll 123 black undergraduates before discontinuing the program in 1955. Even before World War II, universities such as Rutgers and the University of California, Los Angeles, featured a Paul Robeson or a Jackie Robinson on their football teams. It is probably safe to say, however, that prior to 1960 , no selective college or university was making determined efforts to seek out and admit substantial numbers of African Americans.

In the fall of 1951 , black students averaged 0.8 percent of the entering class at the nineteen College and Beyond schools for which adequate records are available; the range was from zero at four schools to a high of 3 percent at Oberlin, and the percentage of black matriculants exceeded 1 percent at only five other C\&B schools. Overall, there were 63 black matriculants in these nineteen entering classes. ${ }^{21}$ The faces in the college yearbooks tell the same story graphically.

By the end of the 1950s, faint stirrings of interest had begun to appear. ${ }^{21}$ In 1959, the director of admissions at Mount Holyoke College started to visit "schools which might provide promising Negro appli-

[^3]cants," and the college actually enrolled a total of ten black students in 1964.22 In 1963, Wellesley College introduced a junior-year program for black students attending colleges supported by the United Negro College Fund. Dartmouth, Princeton, and Yale all established special summer enrichment programs to prepare promising disadvantaged students for possible admission to selective colleges.

By the mid-1960s, amid a rising concern over civil rights, a number of schools began to recruit black students. Nevertheless, the numbers actually enrolled remained small, with blacks making up only 1 percent of the enrollments of selective New England colleges in 1965, according to one estimate. ${ }^{23}$ The reasons were clear enough. As one author put it, "The selective colleges would rather be selective than integrated." 24 Accordingly, although they might recruit black students vigorously, they did not significantly modify their regular standards for admission and financial aid. Their academic requirements were too demanding to accommodate more than a tiny number of African American students, and their tuition and fees were more than most of those who were admitted could afford.

Similarly, few blacks were enrolled in the nation's professional schools. In 1965, barely 1 percent of all law students in America were black, and over one-third of them were enrolled in all-black schools. ${ }^{25}$ Barely 2 percent of all medical students were African American, and more than three-fourths of them attended two all-black institutions, Howard University and Meharry Medical College. ${ }^{26}$ It was in this context that Harvard Law School dean, Erwin Griswold (later solicitor general of the United States), undertook to increase the number of black students. Griswold was struck by the fact that law had come to play a crucial role in the lives of American blacks, yet virtually no black students were enrolled in the Harvard Law School or any other predominantly white law school. In 1965, therefore, he launched a special summer program for juniors from historically black colleges to interest them in attending law school. One year later, Harvard began admitting black students with test scores far below those of their white classmates. The strategy that Griswold employed was adopted by other law schools, and black enrollment began to rise.

Over this same period, the civil rights struggle had been intensifying throughout the country. In 1960, black students in North Carolina began a series of sit-ins to protest segregation at Woolworth stores and other

[^4]retail establishments. In 1961, black and white freedom riders boarded buses bound for the deep South to protest continued segregation in buses and other forms of public transportation. In 1962, a federal judge ordered the University of Mississippi to admit a black student, James Meredith, and violence erupted as Governor Ross Barnett ordered state troopers to block Meredith's entry. The following year, Governor George Wallace tried to keep two black students from attending the University of Alabama, the last remaining all-white state university. In 1965, police reacted with violence to a peaceful voting rights march in Selma, Alabama.

Meanwhile, as protests continued, public opinion in the country gradually shifted in favor of blacks. Eventually, Congress was moved to act. In 1964, President Johnson signed into law a Civil Rights Act committing the government to serious efforts to dismantle state-enforced segregation. In 1965, following the bloody police action at Selma, Congress passed a Voting Rights Act with real teeth. Almost immediately, black registration levels and election turnouts began to rise rapidly throughout the South.

As the 1960s progressed, the government's efforts on behalf of blacks grew more determined. A policy of simple nondiscrimination gave way to a requirement that companies contracting with the federal government make deliberate efforts to identify and consider minority applicants for employment. In June 1965, at Howard University, President Johnson delivered his now famous justification for moving beyond nondiscrimination to a more vigorous, affirmative effort to provide opportunities for black Americans: "You do not take a person who, for years, has been hobbled by chains and liberate him, bring him up to the starting line in a race and then say, 'you are free to compete with all the others,' and still justly believe that you have been completely fair." ${ }^{27}$ Soon, the Office of Federal Contract Compliance and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission were requiring federal contractors to submit elaborate plans that included goals and timetables for assembling a workforce reflecting the availability of minority employees in the relevant labor market. Before long, these requirements were extended beyond the recruitment of black workers to include Hispanics, Asian Americans, and Native Americans.

In the years that followed, almost all leading colleges and professional schools came to believe that they had a role to play in educating minority students. Often spurred by student protests on their own campuses, university officials initiated active programs to recruit minority applicants

[^5]and to take race into account in the admissions process by accepting qualified black students even if they had lower grades and test scores than most white students. A few universities said that they were acting out of a desire to rectify past racial injustices. As the chapters that follow will elaborate, however, most college and university leaders adopted these policies for two other reasons, both closely related to the traditional aims of their institutions. To begin with, they sought to enrich the education of all their students by including race as another element in assembling a diverse student body of varying talents, backgrounds, and perspectives. In addition, perceiving a widely recognized need for more members of minority groups in business, government, and the professions, they acted on the conviction that minority students would have a special opportunity to become leaders in all walks of life.

These efforts soon bore fruit. According to one study, the percentage of blacks enrolled in Ivy League colleges rose from 2.3 in 1967 to 6.3 in 1976, while the percentages in other "prestigious" colleges grew from 1.7 to 4.8. ${ }^{28}$ Meanwhile, the proportion of black medical students had climbed to 6.3 percent by 1975, and black law students had increased their share to 4.5 percent. ${ }^{29}$

Much had changed, however, from the early efforts to recruit black students to the approaches followed at the time the ' $76 \mathrm{C} \mathrm{\& B}$ matriculants were admitted. The exuberance and strong ideological commitment that were so evident in the late 1960s and early 1970s had led many colleges to place an emphasis on recruiting truly disadvantaged students from the ghettos. It was frequently assumed that once minority students were admitted, they would fit in "naturally," as earlier groups of newcomers had done. In fact, however, the absorption of black students into higher education did not prove to be a simple matter. ${ }^{30}$ Some black students were disillusioned by their experiences in white institutions, and there was considerable debate on many campuses about admissions criteria, support programs, residential arrangements, and curricular offerings. Student protests in the late 1960s and early 1970s-which were closely tied to the Vietnam War-were but a visible manifestation of recurring efforts to reconcile differences in perspectives and priorities.

While selective colleges and universities continued to work hard to recruit minority students-often increasing their admissions staffs for this purpose-the numbers of black matriculants at these schools began to plateau. Also, by the mid- to late 1970s, many liberal arts colleges had

[^6]"discontinued their initiatives aimed at enrolling high-risk or underprepared blacks," while adopting other modes of minority recruitment. ${ }^{31}$ The ' 76 C\&B matriculants reflect this shift in emphasis.

The law had played little part in increasing minority enrollments. In fact, some university administrators worried that race-sensitive admissions might run afoul of Title VI of the Civil Rights Act, which states: "No person in the United States shall, on grounds of race, color, or national origin, . . . be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance." By the early 1970s, however, federal officials had incorporated reports on student enrollment into the affirmative action plans they required of universities, thus seeming to make race-conscious admissions not merely permissible but mandatory.

In 1978, a challenge to the legality of such admissions policies under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act finally reached the Supreme Court in the Bakke case, involving a white student who claimed that he had been wrongfully excluded from the medical school of the University of California, Davis, to make room for minority applicants with inferior academic records. ${ }^{32}$ The Court was sharply divided. Four justices found that the system of racial quotas used by the medical school was discriminatory, and hence violated "the plain language" of Title VI. Four justices upheld the admissions procedure as a necessary device to overcome the effects of past discrimination, with Justice Blackmun writing, "In order to get beyond racism, we must first take account of race." 33 The deciding opinion was written by Justice Lewis Powell. Powell condemned the use of rigid quotas in admitting minority students and found that efforts to overcome "societal discrimination" did not justify policies that disadvantaged particular individuals, such as Bakke, who bore no responsibility for any wrongs suffered by minorities. At the same time, as a means to secure the educational benefits of a student body of diverse backgrounds and experience, he ruled that admissions officers could "take race into account" as one of several factors in evaluating minority applicants in comparison with other candidates.

On the authority of Justice Powell's decisive opinion in Bakke, virtually all selective colleges and professional schools have continued to consider race in admitting students. The period from 1975 to 1985, however, was a difficult one for many colleges and universities because of the severe financial pressures brought about by the oil crisis and stagflation. These pressures affected financial aid budgets at many institutions, drove up

[^7]tuition, and in general made it harder to build on previous efforts to enroll a more diverse student population. As a general rule, black enrollments did not decline as a percentage of total enrollment, but they did stop increasing.

As the economic circumstances of colleges and universities improved in the latter half of the 1980 s, there was "a resurgence in recruitment." 34 It was not only administrators, faculty members, and current students who stressed the need to continue-and, if possible, augment-efforts to enroll talented minority students. For example, John Anderson, the dean of admissions at Kenyon College, recalled that parents would comment that Kenyon was "too sheltered" and that their children needed to be exposed to people from different backgrounds. ${ }^{35}$ At the same time, competition for places at the most selective colleges and universities was intensifying; black students were now competing not only with rising numbers of extremely well-qualified white candidates but also with much larger numbers of well prepared Asian Americans and Hispanics. The result was that the percentages of black students remained largely constant through the 1980s, while the relative numbers of Asian Americans and Hispanics increased. ${ }^{36}$

Looking back over the whole period from the beginning of the civil rights movement to the present day, we see that the percentage of black students graduating from colleges and professional schools has grown enormously. From 1960 to 1995, the percentage of blacks aged 25 to 29 who had graduated from college rose from 5.4 to 15.4 per-

[^8]cent. ${ }^{37}$ In the nation's law schools, the percentage of blacks grew from barely 1 percent in 1960 to 7.5 percent by $1995 .{ }^{38}$ Similarly, the percentage of medical students who were black climbed from 2.2 percent in 1964 to 8.1 percent in $1995 .{ }^{39}$ Although figures for Hispanics are not available for years prior to 1970, the percentage of Hispanics twenty-five years of age or older with a college degree more than doubled, from 4.5 percent in 1970 to 9.3 percent in 1995; since 1981, their share of professional and doctoral degrees has nearly doubled. ${ }^{40}$

## SOCIETAL CONSEQUENCES

These trends have led to striking gains in the representation of minorities in the most lucrative and influential occupations. By 1996, blacks made up 8.6 percent of all male professionals and 13.1 percent of all female professionals (up from 3.8 percent and 6 percent in 1960). They also accounted for 8.3 percent of all male executives, managers and administrators and 9.6 percent of all females in such positions (up from 3 percent and 1.8 percent). ${ }^{41}$ From 1960 to 1990, blacks almost doubled their share of the nation's physicians and almost tripled their share of attorneys and engineers. ${ }^{42}$ From 1965 to 1995, black representation in Congress increased from four to 41 members, and the total number of black elected officials rose from a scant 280 in 1965 to 7,984 in 1993. ${ }^{33}$ Hispanics also made impressive gains. From 1983 to 1996, they increased their share of executives, managers, and administrators from 2.8 percent to 4.8 percent and their proportion of professionals from 2.5 percent to 4.3 percent. ${ }^{44}$

The growing numbers of blacks graduating from colleges and professional schools, and the consequent increase in black managers and professionals, have led to the gradual emergence of a larger black middle class. In 1990, 20 percent of blacks were managers or professionals, up from only 5 percent in $1950 .{ }^{45}$ The proportion of blacks earning more than $\$ 50,000$ per year rose from 5.8 percent in 1967 to 13 percent in

[^9]1992.46 These developments contrasted sharply with the condition of blacks possessing only a high school education or less. From 1967 to 1992, the share of total black income received by the most affluent 20 percent of blacks rose from 44.6 percent to 48.8 percent, while the share received by the poorest fifth fell from 4.7 percent to only 3 percent. ${ }^{47}$ After the rate of economic growth declined sharply in the early 1970s, the incomes of the most affluent 20 percent of blacks continued to rise at virtually the same rate as the incomes of their white counterparts, while the bottom 20 percent of blacks saw their incomes fall at more than twice the rate for similarly situated whites. ${ }^{48}$

With all the progress that has occurred since the 1960s, the black middle class is still much smaller proportionately than the white middle class. Blacks are less than half as likely as whites to earn $\$ 50,000$ a year. Moreover, their economic position is even more precarious, since even the highest-earning blacks have less than a quarter of the net financial assets of whites earning comparable incomes. ${ }^{49}$ Still, the entry of so many highly educated blacks into the ranks of managers and professionals must count as the principal success story for African Americans in the past twenty-five years.

The growth of minority managers and professionals has been encouraged by a widespread recognition of the pressing need for greater diversity at all levels of responsibility and in all walks of life. Evidence of this recognition is provided by the actions of leaders throughout government, business, and the professions. It is reflected in the efforts of every U.S. president since Lyndon Johnson to appoint a diverse cabinet and to achieve diversity in other federal appointments. It is manifest in the programs initiated by the American Bar Association and the American Medical Association to attract more minoritiy lawyers and doctors into their professions and into leading law firms and hospitals. It is underscored by the policies and practices of major companies. As Louis V. Gerstner, Chairman and CEO of IBM, has said: "Inclusion is a timehonored aspect of our corporate culture. We're a diverse organization by design, not mandate. The practices and policies we follow . . . were in place many years before required by law. . . ."50

The reasons why diversity has become so important at the highest levels of business, the professions, government, and society at large are readily apparent. By the year 2030, approximately 40 percent of all Amer-

[^10]icans are projected to be members of minority groups. ${ }^{51}$ It will surely be more difficult for government officials to produce enlightened policies and harder still to enjoy the confidence of the minority community if an overwhelmingly white cabinet and Congress are making the decisions affecting the lives of such an increasingly diverse, multiracial society.

Similar considerations apply to business. More than $\$ 600$ billion in purchasing power is generated by minorities and more than one-third of all new entrants to the workforce are persons of color. In this environment, a diverse corporate leadership can be valuable both to understand the markets in which many companies sell and to recruit, manage, and motivate the workforce on which corporate performance ultimately depends. Two statements by corporate CEOs make these points forcefully: ${ }^{52}$

At The Coca-Cola Company, we remain focused on taking actions that serve us best over the long run. That includes building strong management teams and a diverse workforce. As a company that operates in nearly 200 countries, we see diversity in the background and talent of our associates as a competitive advantage and as a commitment that is a daily responsibility.

At Chrysler Corporation, we believe that workforce diversity is a competitive advantage. Our success as a global community is as dependent on utilizing the wealth of backgrounds, skills and opinions that a diverse workforce offers, as it is on raw materials, technology and processes.

In addition, business executives often stress another reason for seeking diversity at all levels. Ultimately, they say, corporations will not be healthy unless the society is healthy, and a healthy society in the twenty-first century will be one in which the most challenging, rewarding career possibilities are perceived to be, and truly are, open to all races and ethnic groups.

Other important opportunities exist for highly trained minority managers and professionals in meeting the pressing needs in predominantly minority communities. At present, minority groups are disadvantaged in government and politics because they are less likely to vote than the rest of the population. This is especially true in poor communities, where voting rates have been falling for three decades and are now far below the national average. Because these communities have such a vital stake in public policies involving health care, welfare, law enforcement, job training, education, and other areas, it is especially important that they have well-trained, articulate leaders to represent them in the political arena.

[^11]Urban minority communities are also in need of business leadership to help offset the loss of jobs resulting from the movement of employers from the cities to the suburbs. Jobless rates for black males have been double those of whites. Minority enterprises can play a distinctive role in helping to overcome this problem, because the record shows that minority-owned businesses-whether they are located in the central city or the suburbs-are much more likely than white-owned companies to hire minority employees. ${ }^{53}$

Finally, many minority neighborhoods suffer from a shortage of doctors and from a lack of ready access to high-quality health care. Minority doctors are not the only physicians capable of meeting these needs, and one recent study of the medical school at the University of California at Davis found that there was no significant difference in the ethnic mix of patients treated by graduates (mostly minority students) recruited through a "special" process and graduates recruited through the regular admissions process. ${ }^{54}$ But more comprehensive investigations have found that black and Hispanic physicians are much more likely to serve minority communities and to include minorities and poor people among their patients. ${ }^{55}$ According to one study, minority physicians are twice as likely to work in locations designated as health manpower shortage areas by the federal government. ${ }^{56}$ Another study revealed that minority patients are more than four times as likely as whites to receive their regular care from a minority physician. ${ }^{57}$

Despite widespread recognition of the value of diversity, efforts to increase the number of minority professionals through race-sensitive admissions policies have never been fully accepted. For almost two decades, the Bakke case seemed to have settled the issue from a legal standpoint. Still, large segments of the public continued to object to the use of race as a factor in deciding who should gain entry to selective institutions. As the competition to enter leading colleges and professional schools continued to intensify, this opposition became more vocal.

In 1989, and again in 1995, Supreme Court opinions involving other aspects of affirmative action signaled a possible shift in the attitudes of the Justices toward race-based policies. ${ }^{58}$ In 1996, the Court of Appeals

[^12]© Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.
for the Fifth Circuit ruled in the case of Hopwood v. Texas that the University of Texas law school could not take race into consideration in admitting students unless such action was necessary to remedy past discrimination by the school itself. ${ }^{59}$ Although the court could have invalidated the law school's admissions policy on the ground that it did not meet the Bakke test, a majority of the judges chose instead to declare that Bakke no longer represented the view of the Supreme Court and that "the use of race to achieve a diverse student body . . . simply cannot be a state interest compelling enough to meet the steep [constitutional] standard of strict scrutiny." 60

At about the same time, the Regents of the University of California issued a ruling of their own, announcing that the nine universities in the state system would no longer be permitted to take race into account in admitting students. This policy was subsequently affirmed by the voters of California in a statewide referendum.

By now, therefore, the efforts of selective institutions to increase the number of black, Hispanic, and Native American students have come under heavy fire. Lawsuits have been filed in several other states challenging the race-sensitive admissions policies of public universities. All signs suggest that the controversy is moving toward some new authoritative review and resolution. Clearly the time is ripe for a careful accounting of how race-sensitive admissions policies have been applied during their thirty-year history, and what their consequences have been.

[^13]
## Index

Page numbers for entries occurring in exhibits are suffixed by an e; those for entries in figures, by an $f$; those for entries in notes, by an $n$, with the number of the note following; and those for entries in tables, by a t .

Academic outcomes, 53-90; choice of major, 70-72, 358; class rank, see Class rank; grade point average, see Class rank; graduation rates, see Graduation rates; institutional initiatives and, 8688; methodology used for analysis of, 357-58
Academic skills, 211t, 212t, 224t, 227t
Achievement tests (SAT II), 28
Adams, Henry, 218
Adjusted probabilities, method of computing, 348-351
Admissions, 15-52; applicant pools and, 18-23; broad aims of, 23-26; classbased, see Class-based admissions; four considerations in, 23-24; on the merits, see Merit; misunderstandings concerning, 15-16; probability of, 23-30; probability of by race, 26-30; race-blind or race-neutral, see Race-neutral admissions; race-sensitive, see Race-sensitive admissions
Advanced degrees, 91-117, 257, 261; aspirations for, 93-96, 103-6; civic leadership and, 166, 167-68; class rank and, $110,112-14,395 t$; by degree type, class rank, and race, 113f; by degree type and race, $98 f$; by degree type, selectivity, gender, and race, 389-390t; earnings and, $95,136,137,366-370$; factors predicting attainment of, 103-6; logistic regression model predicting attainment of, 391-92t; methodology for analysis of, $355-56$; overall patterns in attainment, 96-99; response bias and, 311t, 312; satisfaction with life and, $185 n 44$; college selectivity and, 110-11, 114-15, 389-90t, 395t. See also Degree type; specific types
Allport, Gordon, 219n3
Alumni/ae activities. See Cultural and alumni/ae activities

America in Black and White (Thernstrom), 253
American Bar Association (ABA), 11, 44, 45, 56
American Medical Association (AMA), 11
Anderson, John, 9
Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, The, 283, 295, 302, 305
Antioch College, 4
Appiah, K. Anthony, 220n4, 221n5
Applicant pools, 18-23
Aronson, Joshua, 81n34, 262n11
Arrow, Kenneth, 93n4
Asian Americans, xiv, xv, 9, 37, 56, 233, 283
Association of American Medical Colleges (AAMC), 10n39, 46, 56, 260n8
Association of American Universities, 251
Astin, Alexander, 92n3, 228, 228n9, 267n21, 317n26
Athletes, 26, 54-55, 265, 286-87n12; mentors and, 203-4; probability of admission for, 29; SAT scores of, 44 n 32
Avery, Christropher, 38n24
Axtell, James, 219n3
Baccalaureate and Beyond Longitudinal Study (B\&B), xviiin8, 56n4
Bakke case, 8, 13, 14, 253, 283-84n6
Barnard College, xvi, 40, 60n10, 296t, 343t
Barnett, Ross, 6
Barron's, 15n1
Bartman, Barbara, 13n57
Bates, Timothy, 13n53
Battelle Memorial Institute, 45, 46
B\&B. See Baccalaureate and Beyond Longitudinal Study
Becker, Gary, 118n1
Beginning Postsecondary Student Longitudinal Study (BPS), xviiin8
Behrman, Jere, 128n16
Bernstein, Richard, 266n19

# © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher. 

Black, Daniel, 128n16
Black/African American studies, 71
Black middle class, 10-11, 169-70, 173
Blackmun, Harry, 8, 289
Blackwell, James, 7n29
Black-white gap: in advanced degree attainment, 94, 99-100, 112-14, 115; in civic participation, 157 ; in class rank, 77-78; in cohort response rates, 310; in diversity attitudes, 223; in earnings, 95 , 123, 264, 285; in earnings for men, $145-48$; in graduation rates, $56,58,68$; in job satisfaction, 151-53; in labor force participation, 120-22; in leadership of civic activities, 160-62, 167-68, 169; in academic performance, 77-85; in satisfaction with life, 186-87, 191; in SAT scores, 18-23, 30; in yields, 34-35
Bobo, Lawrence, 188n47, 188n48
Bok, Derek, xxvin4, 92n1, 155n2, 305
Boli, John, 118n2
Bowen, William G., 70n21, 76n26, 78n29, 79n30, 80n32, 82n35, 302, 301
"Bowling Alone" (Putnam), 169
BPS. See Beginning Postsecondary Student Longitudinal Study
Brewer, Dominic, 128n16
Bronner, Ethan, 13n54, 16n2
Brown v. Board of Education, 3
Bruni, Frank, 38n23
Bryn Mawr College, xvi, 40, 60n10, 292t, 304n14, 343t
Business degrees, 97, 103, 112, 257
Business schools: admissions process in,
25; race-neutral admissions and, 44,
45-46; top-rated, 100, 101, 102-3, 360

Cain, Glen, 374n6
Campbell, Angus, 180n37, 185n44
Card, David, 1n2, 2n8, 69n19, 78n29
Careers: advancement pathways in, 128-131; impact of race-sensitive admissions on, 263-65
Carmines, Edward, 268, 268n22
Casper, Gerhard, 24n10
Census data, 344, 361; on earnings, 125 , 148, 362; on earnings premiums, 68-69; on labor force participation, 122
Choice of school, 205-7, 435t. See also
First-choice school
Chrysler Corporation, 12n52

CIRP. See Cooperative Institutional Research Program
Civic participation, 155-74, 257-58; diversity attitudes and, 223, 226; methodology used for analysis of, 358 ; by type of activity, 158f; by type of activity, race, and gender, 159f, 161f, 163f, 164f. See also Leadership
Civil Rights Act: of 1957, 3; of 1964, 6; Title VI of, 8
Civil rights movement, 5-6, 169
Clark, Kenneth, xi
Class-based admissions, 46-50, 51, 270-71, 288 ; diversity and, $46,50,288$; selectivity and, 49-50
Class rank, 72-85, 261; advanced degree attainment and, 110, 112-14, 395t; as alternative to test scores, 271-74; civic leadership predicted by, 165; college experiences and, $81-85$; life satisfaction and, 261-63; earnings and, 140-42; high school, see High school class rank; institutional initiatives and, 87-88; mean earnings by gender, race and, 141f; medical school admissions and, 46; OLS regression models of, 387t; precollege influences and, 78-81; predicting, 72-76; professional degrees by race and, 113f; response bias and, 309t; satisfaction with college and, 201-3; satisfaction with life and, 183-85, 422t; SAT scores and, 74-75; socioeconomic status and, $76,80-81$; study time and, 208, 441t
Coale, Ansley, 76n26
Coca-Cola Company, 12n52
COFHE. See Consortium on Financing Higher Education
College and Beyond (C\&B) database, xv-xviii, 295-339; institutional data file, 295-300; NORC control group, see National Opinion Research Center control group; response bias and, 307-314; secondary data sources and, 316-18; survey data file, 301-307, 319-37e
College dropouts, 195, 258-59
College Entrance Examination Board, 213, 295, 298, 300, 317, 342
Collins, Randall, 101n16
Columbia University, xvi, 40, 60n10, 70, 292, 296t, 297n3, 343t
© Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

INDEX

Community and social service, 162,166 , 167-68, 282
Consortium on Financing Higher Education (COFHE), 301
Control group. See National Opinion Research Center control group
Converse, Philip, 180n37, 185n44
Cook, Philip, 69n20
Cooperative Institutional Research Program (CIRP), 94n8, 148, 298, 317, 342
Cose, Ellis, 87n42, 188, 188n48, 199n46
Credentialing effects, 91, 101, 140
Cross, Theodore, 39n25, 46n35, 277n1
Crouse, James, 23n9
Cultural and alumni/ae activities, 158, $162,165,166$

Daniel, Kermit, 128n16
Dartmouth College, 5
Davidson, Robert, 46n35, 167n14
Degree type: advanced, by class rank and race, 113f; advanced, by race, 98f; advanced, by selectivity, gender, and race, $385-86$ t; advanced, community and social service by race and, 168f; doctoral and professional, by race, $100 f$; mean earnings by race and, 367f; mean earnings by race, gender, and, 454t; mean earnings of women, by race and, 368 f
Denison University, xvi, 40, 60n10, 296t, 343t
Diener, Edward, 149n38
Diversity, 11-12, 24, 29, 218-55, 265; attitudes of blacks toward, 245-47; attitudes of whites toward, 241-45, 445t; of beliefs, 221, 223, 226; contribution of college to, 225-29; educational value of, 253-54, 279-80; effects on campus life, 266-68; effects on racial tensions in society, 268-69; effects on racial understanding, 266-74; high school, 238; importance in life, 220-23; institutional approaches and, 226-28; institutional policies and priorities in, 241-45; institutional type and, 248-49, 449t; in professional schools, 25 ; of race/culture, 220-21, 223, 226; racial interaction and, see Interaction; SAT scores and, 249, 250f, 265; views on by selectivity, institutional type, and race, 449 t

Doctoral degrees, 281, 359; defined, 97; by degree type and race, 100f; earnings and, 369; civic leadership and, 167 ; logistic regression model predicting attainment, 393-94t; by race, 116f; SAT scores and, 106; selectivity and, 110111, 112; types of, 99-100
Doermann, Humphrey, 49n42
Dropouts: college, 195, 258-59; high school, 95
D'Souza, Dinesh, 42n30, 193, 193n1
Du Bois, W. E. B., x
Duffy, Elizabeth, 4n20, 5n22, 8n31, 9n34, 9n35
Dugan, Mary Kay, 45n34, 85n39
Duke University, xvi, 40, 60n10, 294t, 304n14, 343t

Earnings, 10-11, 122-28, 257, 261, 281, 285, 366-78; advanced degrees and, 95, 136, 137, 366-70; annual, of full-time workers, 122-25; class rank and, 140-42; cumulative, by race and gender, 126f; by employment sector, 369, 370-74; factors affecting College and Beyond matriculants', 131-45; family income and, 177,178 ; fit hypothesis and, 143-45; job satisfaction and, 149-51; mean, see Mean earned income; methodology used to estimate, 361-62; by occupation, 369, 374-78; OLS regression model prediction for all men, 399-400t; OLS regression model prediction for all women, 401-02t; OLS regression model prediction for black men, 399-400t; OLS regression model prediction for black women, 405-6t; "other," 177-78; post-World War II, 1-2; of professionals, 92; response bias and, 312-14; SAT scores and, 125, 127, 128n17, 132n24, 133-36, 142, 143, 263; selection bias in analysis of, 125-28; selectivity and, 135, 137-40, 143; socioeconomic status and, 135, 136-37; spousal, 178, 362; successive regression models for, 132-33, 352
Earnings premiums, 127-28; advanced degrees and, 369; class rank and, 142; graduation and, 68-69; occupation and, 377, 378
Eaton, Robert, 12n52

> © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

Edelin, Kimberley, 15n1
Educational Testing Service (ETS), xvii, 3, 213, 216, 269
Ehrenberg, Ronald, 128n16, 374n6
Eide, Eric, 128n16
Emory University, xvi, 40, 60n10, 296t, 297n3, 343t
Employment. See Careers; Employment sector; Job satisfaction; Labor force participation; Work status
Employment sector, 129-30; earnings by, 369, 370-74; job satisfaction and, 149, 150f. See also For-profit sector; Government sector; Not-for-profit sector
Engineering, 10, 70, 71, 72, 73, 110, 111, 358 ; earnings and, 142n30; percentage of blacks in, post-World War II, 2; percentage of blacks in, pre-World War II, 1
ETS. 48n40, See Educational Testing Service
Executive Leadership Council, 11n50, 12n52

Fairbanks, Andrew, 38n24
Family (household) income, 177-78, 342, 344; admissions based on, see Classbased admissions; earnings and, 177, 178; labor force participation and, 120; leadership and, 165; methodology used to estimate, 361-362; by race and gender, 179f, 418t; response bias and, 311t, 312; satisfaction with life and, 185,186 f, 191; socioeconomic status and, 137; of women, by work status, marital status, and race, 419 t
Family life, 175-78; satisfaction with, 183
Farley, Reynolds, 2n7
Feagin, Joe, 188n48
Fetter, Jean, 53n1
Financial aid, 5, 23, 294-96; Bakke case impact on, 8 ; class-based admissions and, 50 ; graduation rates and, 58,65 , 66 n 15
First-choice school: views on diversity and, 251, 252f; rejection by, 268
First-school graduation rates, 57, 66, 68, 194, 257; definition of, 357
Fit hypothesis, 261; advanced degree attainment and, 114-15; earnings and, 143-45; graduation rates and, 59-68,

259; satisfaction with college and, 198201
Foner, Anne, 222n7
Fordham, Signithia, 84, 84n36
For-profit sector, 129-30; earnings and, 369, 370-74; job satisfaction and, 149-51
Frank, Robert, 69n20
Frankfurter, Felix, 287
Franklin, John Hope, x, xxiinl
Freeman, Richard B., 130n19, 374, 374n5

Gallup survey, 156
Garman, David, 128n16, 128n17
Gates, Henry Louis, Jr., 116n28, 170-71, $170 \mathrm{n} 20,17 \ln 22$
Gender: advanced degree by type, selectivity, race, and, 385-86t; civic participation by type of activity, race and, 159f, 161f, 163f, 164f; cumulative earnings by race and, 126f; diversity and, 221n5; employment sector by race and, 371f, 372; family income by race and, 179f, 418t; job satisfaction by earnings and, 150f; marital status by, 176f; mean earnings by class rank, race and, 141f; mean earnings by degree type, race, and, 454t; mean earnings by employment sector, race, and, 373f; mean earnings by occupation, race, and, 452-53t; mean earnings by race and, 124f, 146f, 179f; mean earnings by SAT scores and, 134f; mean earnings by selectivity, race and, 139f; mean earnings by socioeconomic status and, 138f; mentoring and, 438t; NORC control group by race and, 315t; occupational distribution by race and, $450-51 \mathrm{t}$; political participation by race and, 417t; response rates by, 309t, 313t; satisfaction with college by graduation status, race, and, 428-29; satisfaction with college by race and, 196f; satisfaction with life by race and, 181f, 182f, 416t. See also Men; Women
General Social Survey (GSS), 92, 183, 301
GMAT. See Graduate Management Admissions Test
Goldberg, Idana, 4n20, 5n22, 8n31, 9n34, 9n35
Goldin, Claudia, 122n6
Goode, William J., 92n4
> © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

Government sector, 129-30; earnings and, 366-70; job satisfaction and, 149
Grades. See Class rank
Graduate Management Admissions Council, 45,46
Graduate Management Admissions Test (GMAT), 45, 46, 109
Graduate Record Examination (GRE), 109
Graduation rates, 54-70, 88, 257; adjusted probabilities for, 348-51; for blacks, by SAT scores and selectivity, 61f; first-school, 57, 66, 68, 194, 257, 357; improvements in, 68-70; logistic regression model predicting, 385 t; overall, $55-59$; by race, 69 ; by selectivity, institutional type, and race, $380-81$ t, 382-83t; by selectivity, SAT scores, and race, 384 t ; for whites, by SAT scores and selectivity, 62f
Graduation status: response bias and, 308, 309t, 310-14; satisfaction with college by race, gender, and, 428-29
Graglia, Lino, 71n22, 259n4
Gray, William, 303n12
GRE. See Graduate Record Examination
Greider, William, 287n12
Greif, Geoffrey, 88n43
Griswold, Erwin, 5
GSS. See General Social Survey
Guinier, Lani, 271n26
Gulati, G. Mitu, 131n21

Hacker, Andrew, 4n19
Hamilton College, xvi, 40, 60n10, 296t, 297n3, 343t
Handicapped parking space analogy, 36-37
Harvard College, 49n42
Harvard Law School, 5, 284
Harvard University, 170, 259-60
Healy, Patrick, 27ln27, 272n29
Heckman, James, 55n2
Hedges, Larry, 23n9
HERI. See Higher Education Research Institute
Herrnstein, Richard, 42n30, 75n26
Higginbotham, Leon, 286, 286n11
Higher Education Research Institute (HERI), 295, 298, 317-18, 342, 356
High School and Beyond, 57n6

High School and Beyond Longitudinal Study (HS\&B), xviiin8, 157n7, 301
High school class rank, 27, 257; college class rank predicted by, 76, 79-80; earnings and, 135
High school diversity, 238
Hispanics, xiv, xv, 9, 260, 272; advanced degrees and, 103; class-based admissions and, 47, 270, 271; class rank and, 78 n28; diversity and, 267; graduation rates for, 56 ; interactions with other races/cultures, 233; percentage with a college degree, 10 ; in professional schools, 44, 45
Historical context, 1-14; of race-sensitive admissions, 3-10
Historically black colleges and universities (HBCUs), 5, 295n2
Hochschild, Jennifer, 10n45, 11n46, 11n47, 11n48, 188n48, 190n49, 265, 265n16
Hopwood v. Texas, 14, 271, 286
Household income. See Family (household) income
Hout, Michael, 138n28
Howard University, 5, 295n2
Howd, Jay B., 260, 260n6
Hrabowski, Freeman, 88n43
HS\&B. See High School and Beyond Longitudinal Study
Humanities majors, 70, 73, 111, 142n30, 358
Hungerford, Thomas, 55n2
Illiberal Education (D'Souza), 193
Income: earned, see Earnings
Independent Sector, 156-57
Inman, Dana, 38n23
Institutional autonomy, 286-89
Institutional initiatives, 86-88
Institutional policies and priorities, 241-45, 448t
Institutional selectivity. See Selectivity
Institutional type: choice of school by selectivity, race, and, 439t; diversity and, 248-49, 449t; graduation rates by selectivity, race and, 380-81t, 382-83t; satisfaction with college by selectivity, race, and, 437 t ; satisfaction with college by selectivity, SAT score, race, and, 436t. See also Liberal arts colleges; Private universities; Public universities

> © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

## INDEX

Interaction among students, 229-40, 304-305; factors influencing extent of, 234-38; overall extent of, 231-34; presumed effects of, 238-40; questions on College and Beyond survey, 338-39e; by self-ratings of personality traits, 237-38, 446t
Ivester, M. Douglas, 12n52
Jaeger, David, 55n2
Jaynes, Gerald, 1n1, 1n3, 1n5, 1n5, 2n7, 2n9, 2n11, 2n13, 10n41, 10n43, 13n53
Jencks, Christopher, 16n2, 59n8, 78n29
Job satisfaction, 148-53, 407-8t
Johnson, Lyndon B., 6, 11
Johnson, William, 95n10

Kahlenberg, Richard, 46n36, 270, 270n25
Kane, Thomas, 15n1, 16n2, 36, 37n21, 47, 47n37, 47n38, 47n39, 128n17, 259, 260n5, 263-64, 264n13, 342n4
Karen, David, 7n28
Katchadourian, Herant, 118n2
Katzenbach, Nicholas, 285, 285n10
Keith, Stephen, 13n56
Kendall, Patricia, 104n19
Kendrick, SA., 5n23, 5n24
Kenyon College, xvi, 9, 40, 60n10, 296t, 297n3, 304n14, 343t
Kernan, Alvin, 149n39
King, Martin Luther, Jr., 3, 277n1
King, Rodney, 254-55
Klitgaard, Robert,77n27, 262n10
Kluger, Richard, 3n17
Knaplund, Kristine, 87n42, 89n44
Komaromy, Miriam, 13n55
Kravitz, David, xxiiin2
Krueger, Alan, 1n2, 2n8, 23n8, 69n19
Krysan, Maria, 306n20

Labor force participation, 119-22
Ladd, Everett, 169n17
Law, 10, 11, 281; civic leadership and, 167; earnings and, 374, 377n8; percentage of blacks in, post-World War II, 2; percentage of blacks in, pre-World War II, 1
Law degrees, 97, 99, 103, 105, 112, 257
Law School Admissions Council, 269
Law School Admission Test (LSAT), 38, 45, 109

Law schools, 10, 94, 269; admissions process in, 25 ; enrollment following civil rights movement, 7; enrollment prior to race-sensitive admissions, 5 ; graduation rates from, 56 ; percentage of applicants rejected by, 260; race-neutral admissions and, 37-38, 39n25, 44-45, 282; toprated, 100, 101, 102, 359-60
Leadership of civic activities, 160-62; abilities, 211, 214-15; black civic, 169-73; diversity attitudes and, 223; factors predicting, 162-68; logistic regression models predicting, 408-9t, 410-12t; moral, 170; satisfaction with life and, 185-86
Lederman, Douglas, 38n23
Legacies, 24, 26, 28-29, 265, 286-87n12
Leisure gap, 120
Levin, Richard, 93, 93n6
Levy, Frank, 69n19
Lewis, Ernest, 46n35, 222n6
Lewis, W. Arthur, 167n14, 222
Liberal arts colleges, 206, 293; in College and Beyond database, xvi-xvii; diversity in, 249; entering cohort sizes, 296t; mentoring in, 204-5
Light, Richard, 228, 240n 18
Logistic regression models, 44; advanced degree attainment predicted by, 391-92t; definition of, 346, 347-48; doctoral or professional degree attainment predicted by, 393-94t; graduation rates predicted by, 385t; job satisfaction predicted by, 407-8t; leadership predicted by, 412-13t, 414-16t; satisfaction with college predicted by, 430-32t, 433-34t; satisfaction with life predicted by, 423-25t; women's decision not to work predicted by, 397-98t
Looney, Jacqueline, 86n41
Los Angeles riots, 254-55
Loury, Glenn, 128n16, 128n17, 170, 170n19, 264n14, 285
Lowe, Eugene, 203n10
LSAC Bar Passage Study, 56
LSAT. See Law School Admission Test

McPherson, Mary Patterson, 82
McPherson, Michael, 35n19
Majors, 70-72; advanced degree attainment and, 99; categories of, 358; earn-

> © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.
ings and, 135n24, 142n30; likelihood of choosing same by race, 440t; percentage in by race, 386 t; regrets about choice of, 207-8
Malamud, Deborah, 270n25
Marital status, 175-77; labor force participation and, 120; mean household income of women by work status, race, and, $419 t$; by race and gender, $176 f$
Marshall, Burke, 289, 289n10
Marshall, Thurgood, 287-88n6, 287n6
Master of Business Administration (MBA), 103
Master's degrees, 94, 359, 369
Mathematica Policy Research, Inc. (MPR), 301, 305
Math Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT): distribution of scores by race, 19f; mean scores, 379t
Maton, Kenneth, 88n43
MBA. See Master of Business Administration
MCAT. See Medical College Admission Test
Mean earned income. See Earnings
Medical College Admission Test (MCAT), 109
Medical degrees, 97, 99, 103, 112, 257; labor force participation and, 120; by race, 104-5; retrospectively rejected matriculants attaining, 364t
Medical schools, 94; admissions process in, 25; enrollment following civil rights movement, 7 ; enrollment prior to racesensitive admissions, 5 ; percentage of applicants rejected by, 260; race-neutral admissions and, 44, 46, 282; top-rated, 101, 102, 360; undergraduate major and, 70
Medicine, 10, 11, 13, 281; civic leadership and, 167 ; earnings and, 374 ; percentage of blacks in, post-World War II, 2; percentage of blacks in, pre-World War II, 1. See also Medical degrees

Meharry Medical College, 5
Mellon Minority Undergraduate Fellowship Program (MMUF), 86-87
Mentoring: by race and gender, 438t; satisfaction with college and, 203-5
Meredith, James, 6
Merit, 25, 26-27, 52, 276-86; of diversity, 279-80; grades and test scores as indica-
tors of, 277, 278; identifying individuals with, 278-79; societal needs and, 280-86
Merton, Robert K., 104n19
Methodology, 340-65; for academic outcome analysis, 357-58; adjusted probabilities, 348-51; for advanced study analysis, 359-60; for civic participation analysis, 362; for earnings estimates, 361-62; for race-neutral admissions analysis, 353-57; regression analysis, see Regression analysis; sample weights, 340; for satisfaction with life analysis, 362; for selectivity determination, 341-42; for socioeconomic status determination, 342-44, 345t
Metzger, Walter, 92-93, 93n5
Meyerhoff Program at the University of Maryland, Baltimore County (UMBC), 87-88
Miami University (Ohio), xvi, 40, 60n10, 296t, 304n14, 343t
Miller, L. Scott, 78n29
Mincer, Jacob, 69n19
MMUF. See Mellon Minority Undergraduate Program
Morehouse College, 295n2
Morgan, S. Philip, 175n30
Morris, John, 38n23
Mount Holyoke College, 4-5, 4n20
Moy, Ernest, 13n57
Murnane, Richard, 69n19
Murphy, Kevin, 69n19
Murray, Charles, 42n30, 75n26, 263, 263n12

Nakao, Keiko, 92n2
National Collegiate Athletic Association (NCAA) Division I universities, graduation rates, 56-58, 64-65, 259
National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988 (NELS), xviii, xxxn8
National Longitudinal Survey of 1972 (NLS), xxxn8, xviiin8
National Opinion Research Center (NORC) control group, 127, 157, 295, 314-16
National simulation of race-neutral admissions, 353
Native Americans, xiv, xv, 233, 235
Natural science majors, $73,142 \mathrm{n} 30,358$

# © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher. 

## INDEX

NCAA. See National Collegiate Athletic Association
Neal, Derek, 95n10
NELS. See National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988
Nettles, Michael, 10n38, 15n1, 56n4, 58n7, 65, 94n7
Nickens, Herbert, 5n26, 10n39
NLS. See National Longitudinal Survey of 1972

NORC. See National Opinion Research Center control group
Northwestern University, xvi, 40, 60n10, 292t, 343t
Not-for-profit sector, 129; earnings and, 369, 370-74; job satisfaction and, 149
Nowell, Amy, 23n9

O'Neil, Robert, 5 n25
O'Sullivan, John, 42n30, 264n15
Oberlin College, xvi, 4, 40, 60n10, 156n4, 296t, 304n14, 343t
Occupation(s), 10, 130; distribution by race and gender, 450-51t; earnings by, 369, 374-74; job satisfaction and, 149; mean earnings by race, gender, and, 452-53t; open to blacks post-World War II, 2
Odds ratios, explanation of, 347
Offutt, Kate, 175n30
Ogbu, John, 84, 84n36
Oliver, Melvin, 11n49, 48n41
OLS regresion models. See Ordinary least squares regression models
Ordinary least squares (OLS) regression models, 132n23, 346, 348; class rank predicted by, 387t; income for black men predicted by, 403-404t; income for black women predicted by, 405-6t; income for all men predicted by, 399-400t; income for all women predicted by, 401-02t

Page, Benjamin, 268n23
Page, Marianne, 55n2
Parental education, 47, 49, 80, 342, 344
Pascarella, Ernest, 118n2, 174n28
Patterson, Orlando, 171, 171n21
Peer pressure, 84-85
Pennsylvania State University, xvi, 40, 61n10, 292t, 293n5, 304n14, 343t

Performance assessment, 256-58. See also Underperformance
Perna, Laura, 10n38, 15n1, 56n4, 58n7, 94n7
Personal/social skills, 211t, 212t, 224t, 227 t
Petersdorf, Robert, 5n26, 10n39
Peterson's Guide, 15n1
Peterson, Marvin, 7n30
PhDs, 94, 97, 99-100, 103, 257; factors predicting attainment of, 105-6; job satisfaction and, 149; labor force participation and, 122
Phillips, Meredith, 16n2, 23n9, 59n8, $78 n 29$
Physical science majors, 70
Physicians. See Medicine
Pindyk, Robert, 346n7, 346n8
Piscataway case, xiii-xiv, 288
Polachek, Solomon, 55n2
Political participation, 173-74, 413t
Powell, Lewis, 8, 253
Price, Hugh, 84-85
Princeton University, xvi, 5, 40, 60n10, 131, 231, 296t, 297n3, 301, 304n14, 343t
Private universities, 206, 295; diversity in, 249; entering cohort sizes, 296t; mentoring in, 205
Probabilities: adjusted, 348-51; of admission, 23-30
Professional degrees, 257, 281, 359; by class rank and race, 113f; defined, 97; by degree type and race, 100f; logistic regression model predicting attainment, 393-94t; by race, 116f; SAT scores and, 106; selectivity and, 111f, 112; types of, 99-100
Professional schools, 129; admissions process in, 25 ; enrollment prior to racesensitive admissions, 5 ; graduation rates from, 257; interaction in, 239; raceneutral admissions and, 44-46, 282; top-rated, 100-103, 359-60
Professions: importance of, 91-93; most prestigious, 92 n 2 ; open to blacks postWorld War II, 2
Proposition 209, 288
Public universities, 206, 295-96; diversity in, 249; entering cohort sizes, 296t; mentoring in, 204-5
Putnam, Robert, 169, 169n16

# © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher. 

Race-neutral admissions, 18, 47, 54, 262, 280, 285; academic profiles and, 42-44; advanced degrees and, 110; application and attendance patterns under, 353-57; in College and Beyond universe, 31-39; defined, 17; effects of, 31-42; interaction and, 235; methodology used for analysis of, 353-57; percentage reduction of black enrollment under, 51 ; in professional schools, 44-46, 282; simulations based on national data, 39-42, $353-57$; yields and, see Yields
Race-sensitive admissions, $17,30,32,193$, 285; advanced degrees and, 103, 109; class-based admissions versus, see Classbased admissions; impact on intended beneficiaries, 258-65; impact on racial tensions in society, 268-69; job satisfaction and, 154; origins and development of, 3-10; proposed alternatives to, 269-74
Rage of a Privileged Class, The (Cose), 188
Rainwater, Lee, 6n27
Ralph, John, 23n9
Ramist, Leonard, 78n29
Ramphele, Mamphela, 284, 284n7
Rank in class. See Class rank
Reader, George, 104n 19
Ready, Timothy, 5n26, 10n39
Recruitment, 9, 24, 269-70, 287; of athletes, 26; historical, 5
Reddy, Marlita, 9n36
Regression analysis: logistic, see Logistic regression models; OLS, see Ordinary least squares regression models
Research universities, xvi-xvii
Response bias, 307-14; estimating effects of, 310-14; measuring, 307-8
Response rates, 305-7; cohort, 305, 306t, 307, 308-10; sample, 305-7, 308-10
Retrospectively rejected students, 37,38 , $43,44,54,281,282$; estimating outcomes for, 365 ; number of, 363 t; number pursuing medical degrees, 364 t
Rice University, xvii, 40, 60n10, 292t, 343t
Riley, Matilda White, 222n7
Rindfuss, Ronald, 175n30
Roberts, Sam, xxiiin3
Rodgers, Willard, 180n37, 185n44
Rodriguez, German, 349n13
Rosen, Jeffrey, 288n15

Rouse, Cecilia, 78n29
Rubinfeld, David, 346n7, 346n8
Rudenstine, Neil, 218, 218n1, 281n2
Rutgers University, 4

Sample weights, 340
Sander, Richard, 87n42, 89n44
SAT. See Scholastic Aptitude Test
Satisfaction with college, 194-205, 281; class rank and, 201-3; fit hypothesis and, 198-201; graduation rates and, 259; by graduation status, race, and gender, 428-29t; logistic regression models predicting, 430-32t, 433-35t; mentoring and, 203-5; overall measures of, 194-95; by race and gender, 196f; racial interaction and, 240; response bias and, 311t, 312; selectivity and, 197-201, 436t, 437t
Satisfaction with life, 180-91; class rank and, 183-85, 418t; factors predicting, 183-86; logistic regression model predicting, 423-25t; methodology used for analysis of, 362 ; by race, $186-91$; by race and gender, 181f, 182f, 420t; by race and SAT scores, 184f, 421t; response bias and, 311t, 312; in specific domains, 180-83
Sax, Linda, 228, 228n9, 267n21
Schön, Donald, 93n4
Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT), xvii, 269-70; admissions based on, 16-17, 18-23; advanced degree attainment predicted by, 99, 106-10; assessment of, 256; athletes and, 44n32; black graduation rates by selectivity and, 61f; choice of school and, 207; civic leadership predicted by, 165; class rank predicted by, 74-75; diversity attitudes predicted by, 249, 250f, 265; earnings predicted by, $125,127,128 \mathrm{n} 17,132 \mathrm{n} 24,133-36,142$, 143, 263; graduation rates and, 59-68, 60f, 66f, 259, 384t; interaction predicted by, 236-37; major based on, $70-7 \ln 21$; mean earnings by gender and, 134f; mean earnings for men by race, selectivity and, 144t; mean earnings for women by race, selectivity and, 144t; mean scores of matriculants by race, 30 ; mean verbal and math scores, 379 t; probability of admission and, 26-30;

# © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher. 

Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) (continued) race-neutral admissions and, 31-44, $353-56$; race-sensitive admissions and, 260; response bias and, 308, 309t, 310; satisfaction with college by institutional type, selectivity, race, and, 436t; satisfaction with college by selectivity and, 198-201; satisfaction with life and, 183, 184f, 421t; score distribution by race, 20f; score distribution of black applicants, 22f; score distribution of black matriculants at SEL-1, 31f; score distribution of verbal and math by race, 19f; selectivity and, 198-201, 341-42; self-ratings compared with scores on, 214; white graduation rates by selectivity and, 62 f; yields by race and, 34 f. See also Fit hypothesis
Schuman, Howard, 188n47, 188n48, 268n23
SDQ. See Student Descriptive
Questionnaire
Sector of employment. See Employment sector
Seglin, Jeffrey, 148n37
Selection bias, xix, 125-28
Selectivity of undergraduate institution: advanced degree attainment and, 11011, 114-15, 389-90t, 395t; black matriculants as percentage by, 41f; choice of school and, 206, 439t; civic leadership and, 165-66, 172-73; class-based admissions and, 49-50; class rank and, 73 ; criteria for, 15 n 1 ; diversity and, 249, 449t; earnings and, 135, 137-40, 143; freshman enrollment by race and, 295t; graduation rates, of blacks, by SAT scores and, 61f; graduation rates, of whites, by SAT scores and, 62f; graduation rates by, 59-68, 259-60; graduation rates by institutional type, race and, 380-81t, 382-83t; graduation rates by SAT scores, race and, 384 t; institutional categories of, 343t; mean earnings by gender, race and, 139f; mean earnings for men by race, SAT scores and, 144t; mean earnings for women by race, SAT scores and, 144t; methodology for determination of, 341-42; race-neutral admissions simulations and, 39-42, 355, 356-57; racial interaction and, 236-39;
satisfaction with college and, 197-201, 436t, 437t; satisfaction with life and, 185, 190-91; SAT scores and, 198-201, 341-42; self-ratings of personality traits by, 447t. See also Fit hypothesis
Self-employment, 151, 370
Self-ratings of personality traits: racial interaction predicted by, 237-38, 446t; by selectivity, 447t
Self-ratings of skills, 213-14, 442t
Shapiro, Thomas, 11n49, 48n41, 268n23
Sheepskin effect, 55
Shepard, Scott, xxviin5
Sikes, Melvin, 188n48
Skills, 209-16; rating of college contribution to by race, 212 t , 227t; rating of importance by race, 211t, 224t; self-ratings of, 213-14, 442t
Slater, Robert, 39n25, 46n35, 277n1
Smigel, Erwin, 4n18
Smith College, xvi, 40, 60n10, 288, 296t, 343t
Smith, Jeffrey, 128n16, 374n6
Sniderman, Paul, 268, 268n22
Social science majors, 70, 73, 142n30, 358
Socioeconomic status (SES), 48-50; class rank and, 76, 80-81; diversity and, 249 ; earnings and, 135, 136-37; graduation rates and, 66-68; mean earnings by gender and, 138f; methodology for determination of, 342-44, 345t; racial interaction and, 237; response bias and, 308, 309t, 310. See also Class-based admissions
Solon, Gary, 55n2
Sowell, Thomas, 269, 269n24
Spelman College, 295n2
Spoken expression, 214-15
Spousal earnings, 178, 362
Stanford, Jane, 24
Stanford University, xvii, 40, 41, 60n10, 81, 118n2, 266, 296t, 304n14, 343t
Steele, Claude, 81, 81n34, 82n35, 86, 86n40, 262n11
Steele, Shelby, xxviin5, 261n9
Stereotype-vulnerability theory, 81-82, 262
Student Descriptive Questionnaire (SDQ), 214, 313, 342
Sturm, Susan, 271 n26
Sugar import quota analogy, 37n21
Suh, Susan, 188n47, 188n48

> © Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

Sullivan, William, 93n4
Supreme Court, U.S., xiii, 2-3, 4, 8, 14. See also specific cases
Survey Research Center at Princeton University, 297
Swarthmore College, xvii, 40, 41, 60n10, 288, 296t, 343t

Talented tenth, 170, 171
Terenzini, Patrick, 118n2, 174n28
Test scores: grades as alternative to, 271-74; as indication of merit, 277, 278.
See also specific tests
Texas, 3, 272, 273, 287
Thernstrom, Abigail, 3n17, 85n38, 253, 253n23, 258, 258n2, 266, 266n17, 272n28
Thernstrom, Stephan, 3n17, 85n38, 253, 253n23, 258, 258n2, 266, 266n17, 272n28
Thomas, James, 101
Tinto, Vincent, 55n3
Tocqueville, Alexis de, 155, 155n1
Top-tier institutions, 101-3
Transfer graduates, 357-58; graduation rates of, 257; satisfaction with college in, 194-95
Treas, Judith, 92n2
Tufts University, xvii, 40, 60n10, 296t, 343t
Tulane University, xvii, 40, 61n10, 296t, 343t
Turner, Sarah, 70n21
21st Century Program, University of Michigan, 86
U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, 10n41
U.S. Bureau of the Census, 1n6, 2n12, $9 n 36,10 n 40,10 n 42,10 n 43,10 n 44$, 12n51
U.S. Department of Education, 1n4, 2n10, 10n37, 58n6
UMBC. See Meyerhoff Program at the University of Maryland, Baltimore County
Underperformance, 72-85, 88; demoralization and, 262-63; pre-college influences and, 78-81. See also Performance assessment
University of California, Berkeley, 32-33, 33n17, 36n20
University of California, Davis, 8, 13, 46n35, 167, 167n14, 283-284n6
University of California, Los Angeles, 4, 38n23, 89n44, 291

University of Cape Town, 284
University of Colorado at Boulder, 87
University of Maryland, Baltimore County, 87-88
University of Michigan at Ann Arbor, xvii, $40,58 \mathrm{n} 7,60 \mathrm{n} 10,86,292 \mathrm{t}, 304 \mathrm{n} 14,343 \mathrm{t}$
University of Mississippi, 6
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, xvii, 40, 60-61n10, 231, 296t, 304n14, 343t
University of Pennsylvania, xvii, 40, 60n10, 292t, 304n14, 343t
University of Texas, 14, 38n23, 272, 288
Vanderbilt University, xvii, 40, 60n10, 288, 292t, 304n14, 343t
Vars, Fredrick, 78n29, 79n30, 80n32, 82n35
Verbal Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT): distribution of scores by race, 19f; mean scores, 379t
Verhovek, Sam, xxiiin2
Viner, Jacob, 149
Wage premiums. See Earnings premiums
Waring, Joan, 222n7
Washington University, xvii, 40, 60n10, 292t, 304n14, 343t
Webster, David, 360n18
W. E. B. Du Bois Institute, 170

Welch, Finis, 69n19
Wellesley College, xvii, 4n20, 5, 40, 60n10, 292t, 304n14, 343t
Wesleyan University, xvii, 40, 60n10, 292t, 293n3, 304n14, 343t
West, Cornel, 116n28, 173, 173n24
Westoff, Charles, 349n13
Wightman, Linda, 25n11, 32n16, 37-38, $38 \mathrm{n} 22,39 \mathrm{n} 25,44,44 \mathrm{n} 33,45,57 \mathrm{n} 5$, 85n39, 260, 260n7
Wilkins, David, 131n21
Williams College, xvii, 40, 60n10, 292t, 293n3, 304n14, 343t
Williams, Robin, 1n1, 1n3, 1n5, 1n6, 2n7, 2n9, 2n11, 2n13, 10n41, 10n43, 13n53
Wilson, William Julius, 156n3, 169, 169n18, 171n22, 285
Women's colleges, 292t, 293
Work status, 119-22, 419t
Wright, Charles, 288n16
Written expression, 214-15
© Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

Xavier University of Louisiana, 291n2

Yale Law School, 101
Yale University, xvii, 5, 40, 60n10, 292t, 293n3, 304n14, 343t
Yancey, William, 6n27

## INDEX

Yields, 17, 33-36, 38
Yoo, John, 288
Youth/educational activities, 158, 162, 165-66

Zeckhauser, Robert, 38n24


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 277.
    ${ }^{2}$ Card and Krueger 1992b, p. 167.
    ${ }^{3}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 334.
    ${ }^{4}$ U.S. Department of Education 1997, p. 17.
    ${ }^{5}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 273.
    ${ }^{6}$ Data on the professions are from the U.S. Bureau of the Census 1940, tab. 6; data on public service are from Jaynes and Williams 1989, pp. 240, 243.

[^1]:    ${ }^{7}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, pp. 278, 295. The changes in the economic and educational status of blacks and Hispanics since 1940 have been described more recently by Reynolds Farley (1996, pp. 208ff.).
    ${ }^{8}$ Card and Krueger 1992, p. 168.
    ${ }^{9}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 335.
    ${ }^{10}$ U.S. Department of Education 1997, p. 17.
    ${ }^{11}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 273.
    ${ }^{12}$ U.S. Bureau of the Census 1940, 1960.
    ${ }^{13}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, pp. 240, 243.

[^2]:    ${ }^{14}$ Missouri ex rel. Gaines v. Canada, 305 U.S. 337 (1938).
    ${ }^{15}$ Sweatt v. Painter, 339 U.S. 629 (1950).
    16347 U.S. 483 (1954).
    17 A succinct summary of the struggle for civil rights can be found in Thernstrom and Thernstrom (1997, esp. pp. 97-180). Among the many extended treatments, see Kluger (1975).

[^3]:    ${ }^{18}$ Smigel 1969, p. 45.
    19 Hacker 1983, p. 247.
    ${ }^{20}$ Cited in Duffy and Goldberg (1997, p. 137). Chapter 5 of this book provides an informative account of the earliest beginnings of active recruitment of minority students by selective liberal arts colleges and is also the source of the account below of "stirrings of interest" at colleges such as Mount Holyoke and Wellesley.

    21 The College and Beyond database is described in the Preface and in Appendix A. The 0.8 percent figure cited in the text is an unweighted average of the percentages at the individual C\&B schools.

[^4]:    ${ }^{22}$ Duffy and Goldberg 1997, pp. 138-39.
    ${ }^{23}$ Kendrick 1967, p. 6.
    ${ }^{24}$ Ibid.
    ${ }^{25}$ O'Neil 1970, p. 300.
    26 Nickens, Ready, and Petersdorf 1994, p. 472.

[^5]:    ${ }^{27}$ Reprinted in Rainwater and Yancey 1967, p. 126.

[^6]:    ${ }^{28}$ Karen 1991, pp. 208, 217.
    ${ }^{29}$ Blackwell 1987, pp. 103, 290.
    ${ }^{30}$ See Peterson et al. (1978), for a detailed analysis of the period 1968-1975.

[^7]:    ${ }^{31}$ Duffy and Goldberg 1997, p. 152.
    ${ }^{32} 438$ U.S. 265 (1978).
    ${ }^{33}$ Ibid., p. 407.

[^8]:    ${ }^{34}$ Duffy and Goldberg 1997, p. 155.
    ${ }^{35}$ Quoted in Duffy and Goldberg 1997, p. 156.
    ${ }^{36}$ During the 1960s, most universities seeking to enroll a more racially diverse student body concentrated on black students. It was soon apparent, however, that other groups, especially Hispanics, also suffered from inferior schools, low enrollments in colleges and universities, and scant representation in management and the professions. In 1970, more than half of all Americans over the age of twenty-five had completed high school, but less than one-third of all Hispanics possessed a high school diploma. Whereas 10.7 percent of whites had graduated from colleges, only 4.5 percent of Hispanics possessed a BA (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1997, tab. 243, p. 159). Only 2 percent of all managers and administrators and less than 1 percent of all lawyers were Hispanic (Reddy 1995, p. 506). Against this backdrop, students began to protest the failure of selective colleges and professional schools to seek out Hispanic applicants. By the early 1970s, almost all of these institutions had responded by expanding their minority recruitment programs to include not only Hispanics but Native Americans as well. Along with the admission of women to traditionally single-sex colleges, the rapid rise in applications from Asian Americans, and the influx of many more foreign students, the growth in the number of minority students was a major element in the enrollment of much more diverse student bodies in all selective institutions.

[^9]:    ${ }^{37}$ U.S. Department of Education 1997, p. 17.
    ${ }^{38}$ Nettles and Perna 1997, p. 330.
    ${ }^{39}$ Nickens, Ready, and Petersdorf 1994, p. 472; Association of American Medical Colleges 1996, p. 73.
    ${ }^{40}$ U.S. Bureau of the Census 1997, pp. 159, 194.
    ${ }^{41}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 273; U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics 1998.
    ${ }^{42}$ U.S. Bureau of the Census 1960, 1990.
    ${ }^{43}$ Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 240; U.S. Bureau of the Census 1997, pp. 281, 286.
    ${ }^{44}$ U.S. Bureau of the Census 1997, p. 405.
    ${ }^{45}$ Hochschild 1995, p. 43.

[^10]:    ${ }^{46}$ Ibid., p. 44. Income reported in constant 1992 dollars.
    ${ }^{47}$ Hochschild 1995, p. 48.
    48 Ibid., p. 49.
    ${ }^{49}$ Oliver and Shapiro 1995, p. 101.
    ${ }^{50}$ Executive Leadership Council 1998, p. 59.

[^11]:    ${ }^{51}$ U.S. Bureau of the Census 1997, tab. 19, p. 19.
    ${ }^{52} \mathrm{M}$. Douglas Ivester (Chairman and CEO of The Coca-Cola Company) and Robert J. Eaton (Chairman and CEO of Chrysler Corporation), in Executive Leadership Council 1998, pp. 10, 34.

[^12]:    ${ }^{53}$ Bates 1993, pp. 90-91. For unemployment data, see Jaynes and Williams 1989, p. 308.
    ${ }^{54}$ Bronner 1997.
    ${ }^{55}$ See, e.g., Komaromy et al. 1996, p. 1305.
    ${ }^{56}$ Keith et al. 1985, p. 1521.
    57 Moy and Bartman 1995, p. 1515.
    ${ }^{58}$ City of Richmond v. J. A. Croson Co., 488 U.S. 469 (1989); Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Peña, 515 U.S. 200 (1995).

[^13]:    5978 F.3d 932 (5th Cir. 1996), cert. denied, 116 S.Ct. 2581 (1996).
    ${ }^{60}$ Ibid., p. 948.

