© Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

## Contents

## ${\tt INTRODUCTION}$ "The Most Famous Lay Sermon in All of American History" 1

#### PART I TEXT

1	Writing "A	A Model	of Christian	Charity"	13

- 2 "We Shall Be as a City upon a Hill" 31
  - 3 A Chosen People 44
- 4 New England in a World of Holy Experiments 58
  - 5 Left All Alone in America 71
  - 6 Love Is a Bond or Ligament 86
  - 7 Moralizing the Market Economy 96
- 8 The Poor and the Boundaries of Obligation 107

#### PART II NATION

- 9 Inventing Foundations 123
- 0 Mobile Metaphors of Nationalism 133
  - 11 From the Top Mast 146
- 12 Constructing a City on a Hill in Africa 158
- 13 The Carnage of God's Chosen Nations 171

viii Contents

#### PART III ICON

14	4 The Historical Embarrassments of New England				
	15 Puritanism in an Existentialist Key 204				
16	Arguing over the Puritans during the Cold War 21	17			
	17 Ronald Reagan's Shining City on a Hill 233				
18	Puritan Foundations of an "Exceptionalist" Nation 24				
	19 Ambivalent Evangelicals 264				

EPILOGUE
Disembarking from the *Arbella* 280

APPENDIX
John Winthrop, "A Model of Christian Charity":
A Modern Transcription 289

Notes 309
Acknowledgments 341
Index 345

© Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

#### INTRODUCTION

# "The Most Famous Lay Sermon in All of American History"

FOR THE LAST SIXTY YEARS, a story has been told about the origins of America. Like many historical stories, it is told as a parable: deep and timeless continuities flow out of the specifics of time and place. It is an uplifting story and a haunting one. And it is at least half wrong.

The setting is a vessel in mid-passage on the Atlantic Ocean. The year is 1630. Fast-forward another decade and a half, and a revolution among those passengers' countrymen would turn the political and religious order of absolutist England upside down. But the voyagers aboard the *Arbella* were seeking out a new place of settlement in part because they did not believe such a striking break in human affairs was possible. Balancing hope against despair, they were headed instead for North America.

Somewhere in that mid-ocean passage, their elected governor, John Winthrop, confident and commanding in his presence, rose to deliver an address in which he outlined the purpose of their undertaking. "A Model of Christian Charity" Winthrop's text would come to be titled. A "lay sermon," historians since the middle of the

2 Introduction

twentieth century have called it: "the most famous lay sermon in all of American history." In it Winthrop confirmed these new Americans' commitment to a new life of obedience, love, and mutual affections. He reminded them that they sailed not on their own whim or private ambitions but under a covenant with God: a commission as clear as God's covenant with biblical Israel. Their responsibilities to each other were intense, and the risks of failure were, literally, terrifying. But in return, Winthrop offered a promise. If they should keep true to their purposes they would not only overcome the hardships the future held for them in New England. The eyes of all people would be upon them. They would be made "a praise and glory." And they would be "as a city upon a hill" to the world.

This story of John Winthrop's "Model of Christian Charity" has been repeated over and over in the history books and in the civic creed of Americans. It has been celebrated not only for its elements of drama dangerous ocean passage, inspired words, and exalted sense of purpose—but as the origin story of the nation that the United States was to become. Ronald Reagan made a sentence-long extract from Winthrop's Model—"we shall be as a city upon a hill; the eyes of all people are upon us"—into the signature line of his presidency. Preached to a "little band of settlers" crowded onto the "tiny ship" bearing them across the Atlantic, as Reagan saw the event in his mind's eye, the Model set the vision to which "our people always have held fast . . . since our first days as a nation"—that they were destined from their origins to be a beacon of hope and liberty to the world, a model to all nations. "It was right here, in the waters around us, where the American experiment began," Barack Obama told the graduating class at the University of Massachusetts at Boston in 2006 in the same vein. It was right here that the earliest settlers "dreamed of building a City upon a Hill . . . and the world watched waiting to see if this improbable idea called America would succeed."2

This origin story is so familiar that it barely seems to invite question. Virtually no modern high school or college textbook on American history or the American political tradition fails to mention Winthrop's words or impress upon students their enduring importance. "A Model of Christian Charity" has been heralded as the nation's "point of departure," as the "founding text in American political rhetoric," and the key script in the "founding moment" of American civic republicanism.<sup>3</sup> "City on a hill" is now an instantly recognizable phrase in the vernacular of American nationalism. Thousands of other lay sermons preached in a future United States would outstrip the original circulation of "A Model of Christian Charity." But Winthrop's Model is the statement that we have made foundational to "the idea called America." "In relation to the principal theme of the American mind," the immensely influential Harvard historian Perry Miller declared in 1954, "Winthrop stands at the beginning of our consciousness."4

There are powerful reasons behind these judgments. The sense of national mission that marks American civic-political culture, its confidence, and its fervent sense of exception from the lot of all other nations: From what source could these have flowed except from that first, origin moment, when a sense of acting on a special covenant with God became fused with the experience of America? Winthrop's "we shall be as a city upon a hill" seems to hold in its grasp what the future would bring for the United States: its magnet status for a world of immigrants, its economic ascendancy, and its rise to world leadership. The nation's moralism, its Wilsonian idealism, the endurance of its religious cultures, and its certainty that it had been granted a unique and special part in the unrolling of human history all seem presaged in Winthrop's text. Critics see less attractive traits of American national culture embedded there as well: the self-righteousness with which the Americans would roll across the continent and project their

4 Introduction

power throughout the world as if they and God were working hand in hand to expand the special promises of America. All this has been traced to the Puritan origins of America and the mission statement that John Winthrop wrote for it.

No serious observer claims that "A Model of Christian Charity" holds *all* the elements of the nation the United States would become. There would be trial and error in the American future and furious contention as well. But since the middle of the twentieth century Winthrop's Model has seemed to hold in embryo the nation's most powerful and distinctive threads. To begin at the American beginning is to begin with a text in its mid-oceanic setting, just before its words and its promise to be a "city upon a hill" would begin to be etched on the land.

Most of this is a modern invention and much of it is wrong. None of those who voyaged with John Winthrop to the Puritan settlement in New England left any record that they heard Winthrop's words in mid-passage. Most likely "A Model of Christian Charity" was never delivered as a sermon at all. Although copies of Winthrop's text circulated in England during his lifetime, by the end of the seventeenth century they had all literally vanished from memory. One of those long-forgotten copies was discovered in a bundle of old sermons and documents of New England history in 1809, but it was not put into print until 1838. And then it lapsed from sight again almost as completely. An occasional nineteenth-century historian mentioned Winthrop's "Model of Christian Charity," but most did not and none pulled it—or its "city upon a hill" line—out of the mass of other colonial American documents as especially important. Through the 1970s mention of "A Model of Christian Charity" was a hit-or-miss affair in standard histories of the United States. It was only in the decade of the 1980s, three hundred and fifty years after its writing, that the incongruously parallel work of a conservative Cold War president, Ronald Reagan, and a radical, immigrant literary scholar, Sacvan

Bercovitch, combined to make Winthrop's text and metaphor famous. "A Model of Christian Charity" is old, but its foundational status is a twentieth-century invention.

The meanings we now grasp for so eagerly in Winthrop's words are largely twentieth-century inventions as well. John Winthrop never doubted that he and his fellow New England Puritans sailed under the seal of a covenant with God. Of nothing was he more confident than that they had a key part to play in God's scheme of history. But in its own time, the call to greatness in Winthrop's "city upon a hill" line was vastly overshadowed by its reminder of the settlement project's immense vulnerability. Caution saturated his "city upon a hill" metaphor. It did not promise these incipient Americans that they were destined to be a radiant light to the world but that they would need to work out their ambitions under the world's most intense, critical scrutiny. The core theme that laced the Model's words together, from its opening statement of the mutual relations between rich and poor to its fervent closing peroration, was not nationalistic but local and intense: an insistence on love and the obligations of social solidarity that would be often sharply at odds with what capitalist America would become.

The conventional story of Winthrop's "city on a hill" text is wrong in still other ways. Its current status as a founding statement of American "exceptionalism" to the contrary, almost none of the themes that circulated through Winthrop's text were unique to the nation that would become the United States. Dreams of founding a new and purer Israel circulated all across the early modern Atlantic. During the long nineteenth-century era of economic and imperial expansion, conviction that a nation's people had been uniquely commissioned to lead God's forces of good and civilization played a bedrock role in patriotic cultures far beyond the United States. Even the idea that nations owed their essential character to a foundational moment, to a timeless and enduring origin statement, is far less unique to the United States than is typically acknowledged.

6 Introduction

Most conspicuously of all, the phrase "city on a hill" was itself a borrowing, a repurposing for Winthrop's occasion of the one of the Bible's most familiar metaphors, which was to be repurposed hundreds of times again, in and far beyond the United States. The importance of Winthrop's "Model of Christian Charity" is not that it broached ideas and themes exceptional to the history of the United States but that it was, from the beginning, so deeply enmeshed in the world around it.

Above all, to read Winthrop's "city upon a hill" seriously we need to disentangle ourselves from the lure of simple origin stories. Texts live in and through time. A certain kind of nationalism recoils against that assumption. It strains to fix the nation to a foundational moment or proposition or text as if the *idea* of the nation—whatever its actual missteps or temporary disruptions—could be held exempt from history itself. But no words or text can be insulated from time. Their occasions change, the possibilities others see in them change, sometimes radically. Every subsequent use is by necessity a rewriting, a reinvention for new hopes, new conditions, and new contentions. To take a key historical text seriously is not to shove these afterlives aside as a debris of misreadings. It is not merely to sketch a history of "reception," "circulation," or "influence," important as these themes may be. Texts endure only through their continuous reappropriation for inescapably shifting times and purposes.

The point is true of every document a nation holds sacred. The Declaration of Independence whose words reverberate through American culture now is not the Declaration of 1776. It is not the radically different Declaration that Thomas Jefferson's political allies fashioned, taking his "all men are created equal" line out of the sidebar place it occupied in his original text and turning it into a political slogan. Nor is it the yet more sweeping Declaration that antislavery activists would make from a slaveholder's words or rights activists would construct in the twentieth century. Into our own day the Dec-

laration of Independence has been simultaneously an object of veneration and a site for fierce, vitally important contention over the shapes and forms of justice. The "living Constitution" is, by the same token, not simply a phrase for loose constructionists. Even before its adoption, the U.S. Constitution was being reworked, its silences fleshed out, its ambiguities debated, and its elasticities contended for. Reinvention of their core texts is part of the work that nations do. There is potential chaos in this, of course. But without it there can hardly be any serious public life at all.

Pushing back against the origin myths that have obscured it, this book tells the story of the lives of a text that many twentieth-century Americans would construct to be foundational to the "idea" of America. It is a story of disappearance and revival, long absence and neglect, and successive modern reinventions.

Part I, "Text," reconstructs the meanings of Winthrop's words and metaphors in his own seventeenth-century setting. It begins with the occasion of Winthrop's writing and the key terms he injected into "A Model of Christian Charity"—city upon a hill, chosen people, covenant, charity, and history. Set against the background of an Atlantic culture filled with model cities on a hill, scores of them more prominent in their time than New England, Winthrop's phrases take on much less triumphant meanings than the standard *Arbella* story has it. "Charity" was the Model's most important keyword. For Winthrop, it meant that the rule of love and mutual obligation must take precedence above mere calculus of price and market return whenever the public weal is at risk. From what occasion did that startling premise arise and how was it worked out in the day-to-day practice of economic life?

In part II, "Nation," a second phase of the story of "A Model of Christian Charity" begins. In the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries the text itself was all but forgotten. But as nationalism swept across Europe and the Americas, some of the themes that had lodged

8 Introduction

a century earlier in Winthrop's text sprang into circulation all the more vigorously. Patriotic cultures fanned desires for origin stories and foundational texts. Empires were constructed on new convictions of divine-historical destiny. Critics turned the chosen people idea into a tool of dissent. African Americans carried the "city upon a hill" metaphor to the new black republic of Liberia. On the dying fields of World War I, where part II concludes, these globally circulating reverberations of the covenant idea played themselves out in a key of high tragedy.

Finally, in part III, "Icon," Winthrop's "Model of Christian Charity" and its "city upon a hill" phrase finally slips into the place that modern nationalism had already made for it: as an invented foundation for the new world colossus that the United States had become. Cold War American writers made the Model into the defining document we now take it to be. They did that in part by canonizing it and in part by unexpectedly remaking Winthrop's New England Puritans, whose reputation had long been buried under the burdens of their religious intolerance and labyrinthine theology, as the nation's true "Founders." Then, in the 1980s, Winthrop's text suddenly swept from the domains of the scholars into the White House and the rhetorical center of modern American politics. No presidents before Ronald Reagan had used the phrase "city on a hill" to define the very character of the American nation and its place in the world. After Reagan, virtually no serious political figure could escape the obligation to quote it.

But the Model's story had not reached an end. Social scientists attached a new term—exceptionalism—to Winthrop's text, even as the exceptional post–World War II character of the United States was visibly eroding beneath them. Evangelical Protestants struggled to decide if the America to which they were so deeply attached and yet with which they were so deeply in quarrel was properly called a city on a hill. And in 2016, the nation elected to the presidency a man who did not like the phrase at all—who, turning the Model on its head,

"Most Famous Lay Sermon"

9

made not America's shining example but rather the nation's manifold "disasters" his signature trope.

Through these shifts and turns in uses and meaning, the career of Winthrop's text runs as a skein of threads through the American past. A forgotten document would arc, much later, toward iconic status. A biblical image would become a metaphor for a settlement project, a free-floating cliché, an element in the transnationally circulating vocabulary of civic patriotism, a statement of high Cold War purpose, and the creedal foundation of a truly "exceptional" nation. Even in Winthrop's day, his "Model of Christian Charity" carried no single, stable message. "The American point of departure" would be what people would make of it. Braiding together three centuries of making and remaking, this book tells the story of a text that we think we know so well that we barely know it all it.

© Copyright, Princeton University Press. No part of this book may be distributed, posted, or reproduced in any form by digital or mechanical means without prior written permission of the publisher.

### Index

abolitionism, 152-54, 156-57, 163. See also Bacevich, Andrew, 261 slavery Bacon, Frances, 114-15 Bale, Frances, 113-14 Abraham, 48, 84, 155 Adam, 40, 46, 91, 105, 207 Bancroft, George, 136, 192-93 Adams, Charles Francis, 190, 201 Baritz, Loren, 227 Adams, John, 139, 144, 145, 196, 235, 271 Barton, David, 267, 274 Adams, Samuel, 137 Battle of Bunker Hill, memorialization of, Africa, 65, 105, 205; imperialism in, 137, 191, 195 164–66, 168–69, 171–72, 175–76, 177. Baxter, Richard, 39 See also Liberia; Sierra Leone; slavery Beard, Charles, 206 African Americans, 116, 202, 229-30, 241, Beck, Glenn, 269-71, 274, 278 250, 255; free blacks in antebellum Belgium, 175 America, 159, 161-63, 228; and the Beliles, Mark, 267, 271, 273 Liberian project, 8, 158-70, 171; and Bell, Daniel, 254-55 New Negro artists and writers, 169. Bell, David, 127 See also slavery Bellah, Robert, 227 American Colonization Society, 159-62 Benson, Stephen Allen, 164 American Education Society, 136 Benton, William, 219 American "idea," the, 2, 3, 6, 7, 29, 149, 151, Bercovitch, Sacvan, 4-5, 154, 229-32, 218-19, 222, 249, 258, 262-63, 285, 233 Berlin, Irving, 268 American Patriot's Bible, The, 268, 271 Bettering House (Almshouse and House of American Revolution, 174, 191, 193, 196, Employment), Philadelphia, 117–18, 221, 258; evangelical interpretation of, 273-75; nationalism and, 127-128, Beveridge, Albert J., 173, 178-79 129-30, 141-42 Bible, 137, 198, 202, 269, 270; importance American studies, 149, 218, 229-30, 231 of, to contemporary American Americans, The (Boorstin), 221, 222, 239 evangelical Protestants, 265, 267, 274; Ames, William, 92 importance of, to English Puritans, Anderson, Perry, 174 25-26, 45-52; importance of, in the apocalypticism, 60, 61, 78, 277, 278 Spanish conquest, 60-62; and Supreme Arbella, 47, 75; in Glenn Beck's video, 270; Court decisions, 273. See also American presumption that the Model was Patriot's Bible, The; "city upon a hill"; delivered aboard, 1, 16-18, 23, 27-29, Matthew, book of; New Testament; Old 221, 249; in Reagan's story of the Model, Testament; typology 235-39, 246; and the tercentennial of Birch, Joseph, 114 the Winthrop expedition, 189, 202 Black Panthers, 240 blacks. See African Americans Asquith, Herbert Henry, 181

Blake, William, 144 California, 236, 240, 241 Blaxton, William, 190, 202 Calvin, John, 24, 39, 47, 92, 197, 213. Blyden, Edward, 164-65 See also Calvinism Calvinism, 24, 47, 49, 52, 65-66, 143, 209, Bolton, John, 256-57 Bonhoeffer, Dietrich, 212 214, 229, 240 Boorstin, Daniel, 221-23, 227, 228, 239, Canaan, 79, 163; as analogue for New 282 World settlements, 48, 49, 50, 53, 60, Borden, Mary, 184-85 61, 68, 81, 101 Boston, 48, 53, 64, 67, 72, 153, 181, 194, Canada, 174, 259 257; in the American Revolution, 196; capitalism: in early America, 96; in Puritan civic pride of, 203, 204; early ministers New England, 96-98 of, 50, 83, 105-6, 130, 190; first Caribbean, 33, 105, 175, 176, 177, 258 historical society in, 134; intolerance Carson, Ben, 283 and dogmatism in, 67, 197-98, 200; Carter, Jimmy, 242-43 merchants of, 104, 105, 107-8; Carwardine, Richard, 156 Philadelphia eclipses as leading seaport, Cass, Lewis, 140 196; political scandals in, 224-25; relief Catholicism: and the Roman Catholic of the poor of, 108, 113, 117, 118, 119; Church as the true "city on a hill," 38; and the tercentennial of its founding, Protestant campaigns against, 20-21, 189-91, 202, 203, 205, 206; Winthrop 33, 35, 37, 71-76. See also Franciscans; memorials in, 190, 201, 202 Jesuits; toleration, religious Boston Common "Founders Memorial," Channing, Edward, 136 190-91, 202-3, 224 charity, 108, 123; bounds of obligation of, Boston Day parade, 189-91, 203 94, 115-16, 119-20, 124; centrality of, Boston Tea Party, memorialization of, 137, in the Model, 7, 19, 50, 87–91, 93–95, 189 97-98; and contemporary evangelical Boyer, Paul S., 249 Protestants, 265, 272-73; diminished Bradford, William, 62, 137, 190, 271, 273 importance of, in later readings of the Brazil, 65, 258, 259 Model, 125, 136, 209, 226-27, 233-34; Bremer, Francis, 18 in Puritan England, 109-11; in Puritan British empire, 67, 96, 126, 174, 176, sermons, 92-93. See also poor, the; poor 178-79 relief Brooks, Cleanth, 227 Charles I (king of England), 71, 72 Brownson, Orestes, 152 chosen people: concept of, 8, 71, 73, 82, Bryan, William Jennings, 282 144-45, 158, 172, 231, 249, 272, 278, Buckmaster, Thomas, 111 286; and cultures of nationalism, Bulfinch, Charles, 118 125-26, 141-44; Abraham Lincoln on, Bulkeley, Peter, 56 145, 154-57; Herman Melville on, Burns, Anthony, 153 147–51; in the Model, 7, 30, 44–57, 86, Bush, George W., 255, 256, 257, 262, 263, 94, 136; as a tool of criticism, 146-47, 277, 283; and the chosen people theme, 151-52, 153; beyond the U.S., 52-53, 249, 272 57, 60, 65-66, 70, 125, 143-44, 158, Bush, Jeb, 285 231; in World War I, 183-85. See also Bushnell, Horace, 154 Israel: biblical, analogues of in modern world Cabot, Sebastian, 92 Christie, Chris, 283, 285 Calabresi, Steven G., 262 Chubb, Mercy, 115

cities on a hill: in the early modern Atlantic contemporary evangelical Protestants, world, 58-59, 66; in early modern 267-68, 272, 273-74; as a living England, 39, 110, 141 document, 7, 281-82 Continental Congress, 235, 269 "city upon a hill": in the age of nationalism, 3, 8, 32, 139-41, 152-53; anxiety and Cotton, John, 37, 41, 46; and the rules of uncertainty in, 5, 32, 44-45, 146; commerce, 103, 104-5; and sermon of biblical origins of, 6, 37–41, 287; farewell to New England-bound Boston as a, 203; and contemporary Puritans, 18, 35, 46, 52, 55, 56 evangelical Protestants, 18, 265-66, covenant, 227, 229; idea of, in nationalist 275-76, 278-79, 283; and the danger rhetoric, 65-66, 143-44; with God, of dissension, 119, 124; in history consequences of breaking, 56, 82, 230; textbooks, 173, 221, 239, 250, 251; with God, as outlined in the Model, 2, 3, John Kennedy's use of, 217, 223, 224, 5, 19-20, 24, 30, 50-51, 87, 93, 94, 146, 238; as a mobile metaphor, 138-41, 287; Puritan idea of, 45-46; theology 152-53; in modern political rhetoric, 2, of, Perry Miller on, 207-9, 210, 211 226-27, 228-29, 248-49, 252, 262, Craddock, Matthew, 21 285; in the mission of Liberia, 8, 158, Crandall, Prudence, 228 160-61, 164-66, 169-70; in New Cromwell, Oliver, 72, 75, 88 England sermons, 37, 56, 81-83; Cruz, Ted, 283 Reagan's use of, 2, 8, 31, 217, 232-46, Cuba, 172, 176, 258 247, 283; and the scrutiny of the world, Cuomo, Mario, 248 41-43, 146, 158, 165, 287; in surviving Curley, James, 190-91, 202, 203, 223, 224 copy of the Model, 13-14 Curti, Merle, 227 Civil War (American), 154-57, 158, 172, Cushman, Robert, 50 177, 253. See also Confederacy, Southern Davenport, John, 84 Civil War (English). See Puritan Revolution Davis, Jefferson, 155 (England) Dean, Paul, 139 Cleveland, Grover, 268 Declaration of Independence, 13, 18, 124, Clinton, Bill, 248 142, 190, 229, 235, 284-85; Lincoln Clinton, Hillary, 249, 283 and, 156; shifting reputation of, 6-7, Cold War, 248, 253; Reagan's use of the 131-32, 222, 246, 251, 281 Model as a document for, 234, 239-42, DeMar, Gary, 271 246, 281; remaking of the Model during, democracy, in early New England, 45, 87, 4, 8, 9, 94, 214, 216, 217-32, 275 194, 199-201, 206 Coleman, Thomas, 72 Denmark, 35, 175 Coleman, William David, 164 de Quiroga, Vasco. See Quiroga, Vasco de Coles, Robert, 212 Dibelius, Otto, 184 Columbus, Christopher, 58, 60-61, 267 Dolan, Anthony, 237, 243-44 Comey, James, 285 Dominican Republic, 172 Communism, 225, 229; American Dorchester, England, 53, 103, 109, 110, 111, Communist Party, 221, 252; anti-, 239 112 Dorchester, Massachusetts, 53, 113-15, 116 Confederacy, Southern, nationalism in, 128, 132, 143, 155 Douglas, Paul, 224 Connecticut, 56, 118, 134, 228 Douglass, Frederick, 153-54, 157, 163 Constitution, U.S., 139, 153, 196, 240, 246, Douthat, Ross, 269 255, 285; amendments to, 173, 196; and Du Bois, W. E. B., 167-68, 169, 170, 171

Forefathers' Day, 191

Gamble, Richard, 276

348 Index

Dudley, Thomas, 53, 103 Dukakis, Michael, 248 Dunn, Richard, 23 Dutch Republic, 32, 36, 49, 64–66, 68, 143, 175 Dyer, Mary, 67

East India Company, 21, 126 Eaton, Theophilus, 84 Eburne, Richard, 49 Edwards, Jonathan, 92-93, 179, 213 Eggleston, Edward, 136 Eisenhower, Dwight D., 214, 216, 219, 224 Eliot, John, 33 Elizabethan Poor Laws, 110, 112 Emancipation Proclamation, 157 Emerson, Ralph Waldo, 213 Endecott, John, 41 England: charity and the poor in, 34-35, 109-11; chosen people rhetoric in, 39, 48-49, 52-53, 143, 149, 174, 180, 184, 244; emigration from, 15, 20–22, 27, 28-29, 32-37, 67, 102; imperialism in, 72, 75-76, 175; return migration to, 28, 74-75. See also Magna Carta; Puritans, English English Civil War. See Puritan Revolution

(England)
"Errand into the Wilderness" (Miller), 76, 213, 214–15, 220
evangelical Christianity. See Protestantism,

evangencal Christianity. See Protestantism contemporary American evangelical exceptionalism: claims of American, 5, 247–63, 264, 266, 271, 275–76, 282–83, 285; concept of, 8, 252, 256; periods of American, 257–63 existentialism, 211–13

Falwell, Jerry, 275, 277
Faust, Drew, 132, 155
Federalist Party, 131, 132, 176
Federer, William, 271, 273
Fiennes, William (Lord Saye and Sele), 41
Firestone Rubber Company, 169, 172
First World War. See World War I
Fiske, John, 182
Folsom, George, 135

Founding Fathers, 191, 194-95, 197, 228, 269, 274, 284 Fourth of July. See Independence Day France, 194, 255; imperialism in, 175, 176, 178; as a model nation, 141, 143, 178, 180-81; nationalism in, 127, 128, 130, 131, 258; and the Seven Years War, 174; in World War I, 171, 180-81, 184, 189. See also French Revolution Franciscans, 61, 68 Franklin, Benjamin, 129, 222, 271 French Revolution, 127, 128, 130, 131, 141, 194, 258 frontier, American, 176, 206 Fulbright program, 218–19 Fuller, Margaret, 152, 213

Garrison, William Lloyd, 140, 153, 163 Garvey, Marcus, 167 George III (king of England), 129 Georgia, 49, 134, 221 Germany: embattled Protestants in, 35, 73-74; emigrants from, to Pennsylvania, 67; imperialism in, 178, 179; nationalism in, 128, 130, 143, 175, 180, 184; in World War I, 180-85 Gingrich, Callista, 266 Gingrich, Newt, 254, 256, 266 Goldwater, Barry, 239 Golway, Terry, 252 Goodrich, Charles A., 136 Gore, Al, 248 Great Britain. See British empire; England; Scotland Great Depression, 204, 253, 270 Great Society, 226, 247 Great War. See World War I

Haiti, 163, 172 Handlin, Oscar, 227 Harrington, James, 88 Hartford Convention, 196–97

"Guarani republic," 63–64, 68

Greene, Nathaniel, 139

Guatemala, 63

Harvard University, 169, 194, 221, 285; Israel, biblical: analogues of in modern Harvard College's first class, 74; world ("New Israel"), 5, 48-50, 52, 54, historians at, 3, 181, 199, 224, 227; 56, 65-66, 72, 73, 81-84, 141, 143-44, Perry Miller and, 204, 205, 212, 213 147, 149, 151, 164, 172, 174, 200, 231, Hawaii, 172 237, 261; and God's covenant with, 2, Hawthorne, Nathaniel, 198 46, 89, 101 Herndon, Ruth, 116 Italy, 130, 175, 259 Heston, Charlton, 268 historical societies, 129, 134-35. See also Jackson, Andrew, 138, 142, 268 specific historical societies Jackson, Stonewall, 155, 268 Hooke, William, 79 Jacob, 48, 155 Hooker, Thomas, 36, 52-53, 56 Jamestown, 193 Hopkins, Edward, 83-84 Japan, 178 Horneck, Anthony, 39 Jefferson, Thomas, 174, 176, 222, 229, 238, Houston, Sam, 142 262, 271, 284; on Americans as a chosen people, 129, 144-45, 172; and Howes, Edward, 41 Huckabee, Mike, 256, 267, 273 the Declaration of Independence, 6, Hughes, Langston, 169 131, 235, 281 Humphrey, Hubert, 226 Jeremiad, 82-83, 129, 151, 278 Huntington, Samuel, 253 Jessey, Henry, 87 Hutchinson, Anne, 200-201, 228, 232, 233, Jessup, John, 219, 220 249, 251 Jesuits, 63-64, 67, 68 Hutchinson, Ellen Mackay, 136 Jews. See Israel, biblical; Old Testament Johnson, Edward, 65, 81 immigration: Boston's celebration of, in the Johnson, Lyndon, 226 1930s, 189, 202-3; destinations of, in Jones, Bob, III, 277 colonial America, 15, 65, 68, 80-81, 195, 196; fear of, 272, 277; and return Keayne, Robert, 104, 105, 107-8 migration, 28, 74-75, 259, 260-61; to Kennedy, Geoffrey Studdert, 180 the U.S., 3, 259, 260-61 Kennedy, John F., 172-73, 228, 285; use of "city upon a hill" by, 217-18, 223-26, imperialism, 8, 126, 168, 171, 259; American, 171-80; European, 59-60, 238 96-97, 171, 174-75, 176, 177-79; Kennedy, Robert, 226, 283 and the Model, 135-36, 172-74, Kerry, John, 249 179-80, 182, 231; and nationalism, Kierkegaard, Søren, 212 174-76 King, Martin Luther, Jr., 230, 268, 269, 270 Independence Day, 129, 130, 131, 132, 140, Knock, Thomas, 183 142, 152, 228 Krieger, Larry, 150 India, 21, 65, 176, 178 Indians. See Native Americans Lafayette, Marquis de, 190 inequality, 20-21, 87, 94, 111, 152, 226, LaHaye, Tim, 271, 277 227, 248; in the Model, 19, 20, 26, 87, Las Casas, Bartolomé de, 63, 64 88, 91-92, 138 Latin America, 33, 60-64, 96, 127, 141, Ireland, 67; English imperialism in, 72, 75, 175, 177, 284 175; Scots and English migrants to, 15, Laud, William (Archbishop of Canterbury), 71, 72, 77 80; Winthrop's plan to move to, 35 Isaiah, 60, 70, 89, 237, 244 Lazarus, Emma, 238

League of Nations, 183 Massachusetts, 137, 139, 144, 169, 189, 201, Lee, Robert E., 155, 268 203; John Kennedy and, 223, 224, 238; lending: in early New England, 103, 105-6; erasure of the word, in the Model, 14. in seventeenth-century England, 97; See also Massachusetts Bay Colony rules of, in the Model, 19, 22-23, 24, 30, Massachusetts Bay Colony: compared to 89-90, 94, 103, 108. See also usury Penn's project, 68-69; compared to the Lenin, Vladimir, 235; Leninism, 252 Dutch Republic, 65, 68-69; compared Leppard, George, 235 to the Jesuit missions in Paraguay, Levant Company, 21 64-68; economy of, 96-97, 101-6, Lewis, R. W. B., 227 195-96, 257; initial death rate in, 34; Lewis, Thomas, 143 isolation of, 73-74, 76-85; motives for Liberia, 8, 161-62, 171-72; Booker T. founding and emigration to, 15, 20, Washington and, 166-67; "city on a 32-37, 42-43; the poor in, 107-9, hill" rhetoric in, 160-61, 163-66; critics 111-16; return migration from, 28, of, 163; founding of, 158-61; Marcus 74-75; size of initial migration to, 15, Garvey and, 167; W. E. B. Du Bois on, 27, 99; toleration of dissent in, 36-37, 167 - 7078-80, 87. See also Massachusetts Bay Light and the Glory, The (Marshall and Company Manuel), 266-67 Massachusetts Bay Company, 15, 45, 54, 97, Lincoln, Abraham, 249, 262, 269, 283, 285; 193; investors' controversy in, 21-23, on Americans as an "almost chosen 98-101; Winthrop's leadership of, people," 145, 154-57 21-23, 28-29, 98-101, 109. See also Lipset, Seymour Martin, 253 Massachusetts Bay Colony Locke, John, 207 Massachusetts General Court, 73-74, 77, 103; and debt cases, 97; and Anne Lodge, Henry Cabot, 182 love, as central theme in the Model, 2, 5, 7, Hutchinson, 201; and the Keayne case, 19, 22, 23, 24, 30, 51, 87, 90-91, 93-94, 104; and the poor, 111-12; and wages, 120, 209, 280 102; Winthrop's speech on liberty to, Luce, Edward, 261 29, 87, 208 Lyly, John, 48 Massachusetts Historical Society, 135, 235 Mather, Cotton, 50, 83-84, 179 Mather, Increase, 81, 82 Madison, James, 196, 284 Magna Carta, 131, 132 Mather, Richard, 36, 53 market economy: and colonial Pennsylva-Matthew, book of, 38-41, 43, 138, 265, 276 nia, 67; in early New England, 80-81, Mayflower, 27, 32 96-98, 101-6, 199; and the Model, 7, Mayflower Compact, 24, 193-95, 200, 251, 22-23, 88-90, 98-101,120, 280 Maier, Pauline, 131 McCain, John, 248, 255, 272 manifest destiny, 32, 125, 142, 144, 173, McGiffert, Michael, 48 176, 179, 269-70 McGovern, George, 226 Manuel, David, 266, 271 Melville, Herman, 147-52, 213, 230 Markham, Edwin, 190 Merrifield, Henry, 115 Metaxas, Eric, 262 Marryat, Frederick, 149 Marshall, Peter, 266, 271 Mexico, 61, 63, 141, 177, 258, 284 Martin, Jerry, 236, 237 Michelet, Jules, 141 Marx, Karl, 252 Michell, Jonathan, 81 Marxism, 248, 252, 253 millennialism, 59-61, 68, 84, 278

Miller, Perry, 3, 222, 271; and the Cold War, Morgan, Edmund, 92, 220-21, 223, 228 217, 219, 232; early experiences of, Morison, Samuel Eliot, 28, 181-82, 199 204-5; and "Errand into the Wilder-Moses, 53, 100, 198, 268; as analogue for ness," 76, 213, 214, 220; and the Model, emigrants, 24, 49, 51, 52, 55, 56-57, 62, 16-17, 25, 207-9, 213, 216, 229, 231, 66, 84; and rules of charity, 89 233, 281; and The New England Mind, Motley, John Lothrop, 200 209, 220; project of, to understand the Murray, George, 240 Puritan mind and legacy, 205-16 Murrin, John, 249 Milton, John, 39, 143 Muzzey, David Saville, 136 ministers, New England, 45; as "cities on a hill," 38-39; and the English Puritan Napoleon, 163, 176 Revolution, 72, 74-75, 77-78, 80; and National Archives, 13 idea of a New Israel, 73, 81-84; sermon National Association for the Advancement themes of, 26-27, 40-41, 69, 82-83, of Colored People, 167-68 105-6. See also specific ministers nationalism: burgeoning cultures of, in mission, national, 3-4, 32, 124-25, 141-42, Europe and the Americas, 3, 6, 7–8, 173-81, 183-84, 219-20, 225-27, 258, 48-49, 125-32, 138-45, 174-80; 266 - 67critical, 151–54; and imperialism, "Model of Christian Charity, A": anxiety, 174-76; Lincoln's, 154-57; technolodoubt, and uncertainty in, 31, 39-43, gies of 126-28; in World War I, 180-85. 52, 70; and charity, 87-90, 93-95, 108, See also time, nationalist conceptions of; 119-20; Cold War reevaluations of, traditions, invented 217-18, 221-27; confidence and pride Native Americans, 32, 67, 174; depicted in in, 31-32, 44-45, 52; covenant theme Boston's Winthrop memorial, 202; in, 45, 50, 86, 93; economic relations in dispossession of, 33–34, 47–48, 22-23, 89-90, 97-98, 100-101, 105, 175-77, 270; goal of conversion to 106; first print publications of, 135-36, Christianity of, 33, 61–64; in Puritan 181-82; as a foundational document New England, 34, 53, 82, 116, 263; in American civic culture, 1-6, 8-9, rationalization of violence against, 49, 124-25, 132, 216, 233-34, 245, 53, 62, 173; in the Spanish empire, 250-51; inequality in, 19, 87, 88-89, 63-64 280, 286; love in, 87, 90-91; modern Navy, U.S., 147-52, 172 transcription of, 289-308; obscurity of, Netherlands. See Dutch Republic for three centuries after its writing, 4-5, New England: attempts to establish as site 125-26, 133, 136-37, 173-74; place of of America's founding, 8, 191-95, 203, in histories and anthologies, 3, 17, 136, 245; marginal importance of in early 172-73, 181, 190, 208, 219-20, 227, America, 80, 195-97; and project of sectional nationalism, 191-95; shifting 249-51, 268, 271; Reagan's use of, 233–46, 248; scholarly interpretations reputation of, 197–202 of, 204-5, 207-16, 221-23, 229-32, New England Society of Charleston, South 276; setting of its composition, 1-2, Carolina, 193 15-30, 101; structure of, 19-20, 23-24, New England Society of New York, 191 87; surviving manuscript copy of, "New Israel." See Israel, biblical 13-15, 133-35. See also "city upon a New Testament, 268, 276; "city on a hill" in, hill" 37-38, 265; and rules of charity, 89-90;

and typology, 47-48; Winthrop's use of,

in the Model, 39-40, 50-51, 287

Moore, Susan, 74

More, Thomas, 63

New-York Historical Society, 13, 16, 133, 134–35 Nicaragua, 21, 172 Niebuhr, Reinhold, 211–12 Nixon, Richard, 226 Noll, Mark, 276 Noonan, Peggy, 31, 237, 245 Norton, John, 81

Oakes, Urian, 81, 83

Obama, Barack, 269; on American exceptionalism, 255–57, 263; on the American "idea," 2, 249, 282; and the "city on a hill," 2, 249, 283
Oklahoma, curriculum controversy in, 251
Old Testament, 39–40, 268; God's chosen people in, 45, 50, 56, 144; and typology,

47–48, 129, 155; Winthrop's use of, in the Model, 50–51, 287 oppression, economic, 102–3, 104–5, 106. *See also* usury

O'Reilly, Edward, 16, 289, 343 O'Sullivan, John L., 130, 142, 173 Owen, Wilfred, 181 Ozouf, Mona, 129

Paine, Tom, 129, 130 Palfrey, John Gorham, 136 Palin, Sarah, 248, 256 Pan-African Congresses, 168 Paraguay, 63-64, 67 Paramino, John Francis, 190, 202, 203 Parrington, Vernon Louis, 201, 206 Pascal, Blaise, 212 Patterson-Smith, J., 184 Penn, William, 123, 271; colony founded by, 66-68, 126, 196, 221 Pennsylvania, 123; as a magnet for European emigrants, 68, 195; as a model society, 66-68, 69, 221. See also Philadelphia Perkins, William, 38-39 Perthes, Friedrich Christoph, 143

Phelan, John, 60 Philadelphia, 128,156; eclipses Boston as colonies' leading seaport, 196; poor

Peter, Hugh, 74

relief and charitable institutions in, 117, 118, 119, 123-24 Philippines, 172, 173, 178, 179 Pilgrims, 24, 27, 32, 50, 62, 65, 84, 246, 257; anniversary of landing of, 137, 191, 193; contemporary evangelicals' embrace of, 273; reputation of, 199-200. See also Mayflower Compact Plummer, William, 139 Plymouth Colony. See Pilgrims Plymouth Company, 97 poor, the, 123, 152, 159, 259; and contemporary evangelical Protestants, 264, 272-73; English, 34-35, 109-11, 160, 221; in the Model, 5, 19, 20, 24, 26, 88-90, 92-93, 119, 138; in Puritan New England, 87, 94-95, 106, 108, 111-20, 257. See also charity; inequality; poor relief poor relief: in England, 34-35, 88, 109-11, 257; in Philadelphia, 117-18, 123; in

257; in Philadelphia, 117–18, 123; in Puritan New England, 108, 111–16, 118–19, 257 poverty. *See* charity; poor, the; poor relief

Protestantism, contemporary American evangelical: ambivalent nationalism in 275–79; attitudes toward poverty in, 272–73; and Christian histories of America, 266–68, 273–74; and the "city on a hill" phrase, 8, 264–66; marginal place of Winthrop's Model in, 271–75

Providence Foundation, 267
Providence Island Company, 97
providential history: in the age of
nationalism, 124, 129, 141–44, 174,
176, 179; and the American Civil War,
154–57; and contemporary evangelical
Protestantism, 266–69, 275–77,
278–79; definition of, 46–47; and the
Dutch Republic, 66, 68; and the
English, 72, 75, 79–80, 143, 174; and
Liberia, 161–65; and the New England
Puritans, 46–47, 49, 54, 57, 62, 72,
79–80, 84, 86, 125, 281; and the
Spanish colonial empire, 60–62, 68
Puerto Rico, 172

Puritan Revolution (England), 1, 21, 37, quotation for, 236-39; speechwriting 71-73, 75-76, 77-78, 215, 258; and for, 236-38, 243-45 care of the poor, 111; New England and, Rhode Island, 116, 200 Richardson, Charles F., 136 Puritans, English: and church organization, Roberts, Joseph Jenkins, 165 77-78, 79; and the "city on a hill," Robertson, Pat, 271 38–39; and covenant theology, 45, 208; Robespierre, Maximilien, 141 efforts of, to discipline unruly English Roe v. Wade, 274 culture, 76; importance of the Bible to, Romney, Mitt, 249, 256, 283 25-26; improvement of the poor by, Roosevelt, Franklin, 238, 268 109-11; and religious toleration, 78-79; Roosevelt, Theodore, 167, 178 and sermons, 25-26; terms of Rosenthal, Albert H., 226 self-description of, 42; and typology, Rossiter, Clinton, 219 46-48. See also Puritan Revolution Roye, Edward James, 164 (England) Rubio, Marco, 283 Puritans, New England: as a chosen people, Russia, 92, 175, 176, 178; as a chosen 44-57, 73, 82-84, 231; democracy and, people, 143 194-95, 199, 206; doubts of, 31-32, 42, Rustin, Bayard, 268 43, 209-11, 212-15; importance of the covenant idea to, 24, 45-46, 49-50, Saint-Gaudens, Augustus, 198 207-9; intolerance and, 31, 78-80, 83, Salem, Massachusetts, 41, 74, 99, 197, 200 197-202; and market relations, 94-98, Santorum, Rick, 249 Saye and Sele, Lord, 54, 55 101-6, 120; sense of mission and, 4, 69, 76–77, 80, 86–87, 172–74, 214–15; Scalia, Antonin, 285 Schaeffer, Frank, 277 and sermons, 25-26, 82-83; shifting reputation of, 8, 172-74, 197-99, Schama, Simon, 66 201-3, 205-7, 217-32, 271, 273; Schlesinger, Arthur, Jr., 212, 224 treatment of the poor by, 111-16, 119; Schuck, Peter, 262 and typology, 46-48; Winthrop's Schulzinger, Robert, 179 Journal as source of information on, Scotland, 15, 71, 128, 174 17 - 18scribal publication, system of, 14 Scudder, H. A., 193 Quakers, 66-68, 69, 78, 117-18, 197 Selma, Alabama, 270, 282 Quiroga, Vasco de, 63, 64 Sermon on the Mount, 38-41, 92 sermons: importance of, to Puritans, racism, 158-70, 173, 224, 273-74 25, 206, 208; structure of, 25-26; Ramsey, David, 130 Winthrop's Model imagined as a, 1, 4, Rankin, Jeannette, 228 25-27,28Reagan, Ronald, 254, 256, 264, 271, Seven Years War, 143, 174 Sheidley, Harlow, 192 284-85; addition of the word "shining" by, 243-44; "city on a hill" as warning Shepard, Thomas, 79 for, 239-43; and John Kennedy's use of Sierra Leone, 160, 169 the Model, 217-18, 238; making of the Slack, Paul, 111 Model into an icon of hope by, 31–32, slavery, 59, 65; in colonial America, 80, 96, 242-46, 281; popularization of the 127-28; and the colonization of Liberia, Model's story by 2, 4-5, 8, 17, 232-34, 159, 160, 161-62, 163, 169; and 282-83; source of "city on a hill" dynamics of imperialism, 163, 173, 176,

slavery (cont.) tobacco trade, 21, 35, 96 toleration, religious: in the Dutch Republic, 197; as foundational to American history, 192, 195, 250; in Haiti, 163, 65; in England, 78, 80; and intolerance 176; Lincoln on, 155–57; and periods in New England, 31, 36-37, 78-80, 83, of American "exceptionalism," 258-59; 197-99, 200-201; in Pennsylvania, as a political issue, 6, 140, 152-54, 67-68, 196 173, 197; in Puritan New England, Tocqueville, Alexis de, 194, 195; and 32-33, 105; in Spanish America, 59, "exceptionalism," 254 60, 63, 64. See also abolitionism; Civil traditions, invented, 128-29, 130-31 War Trumbull, Jonathan, 134 Smith, Thomas, 92 Trump, Donald, 283-85 Sombart, Werner, 253 Turner, Frederick Jackson, 182, 206, Sorensen, Theodore, 223-25, 228, 238 253 Soviet Union, 219, 221, 225, 237, 260. Tuskegee Institute, 166-67 See also Russia typology, 47-48, 83, 129, 155 Spanish empire, in the Americas, 21, 33, 60-64, 72, 76, 96, 127, 221 Universal Negro Improvement Association, Sparks, Jared, 194 167 Statue of Liberty, 237, 238, 259, 270 usury, 90, 103, 105 St. Augustine, 199, 209 Stedman, Edmund Clarence, 136 Vane, Sir Henry, 75 Stiles, Robert, 113-14 Vietnam War, 226, 229, 231, 238, 241 Stillman, Samuel, 130 Virginia colony, 21, 97, 193, 205, 221; Stowe, Harriet Beecher, 142 disparaging of, 193-94; emigrants to, sugar trade, 60, 65, 80, 176, 195 32; mortality rate at, 34; as most Supreme Court, U.S., 225, 268, 285; important engine of early North decisions of, that mobilized the American growth, 195; primacy to foundational status of, 192; tobacco Christian right, 273-75 Swaggart, Donnie, 277 and slave economy of, 96 Sweden, 73, 197 Voice of America, 218 Sweet, Leonard, 61 Voltaire, 64, 68 Taft, William Howard, 167, 183 Wakeman, Samuel, 81-82 Tancredo, Tom, 275-76 Warburton, William, 143 Tea Party (political movement), 269 Ward, Nathaniel, 79 Teage, Hilary, 165-66 Warren, Joseph, 237 Texas, 258; Republic of, 142; State Board of Warren, Robert Penn, 227 Education, 250 Washington, Booker T., 166, 167 textbooks, history: for Christian home-Washington, DC, 137, 172; as a "city on a hill," 243-44 schoolers, 265, 267; and the Model, 3, 17, 136, 172, 220, 228, 249-50 Washington, George, 128, 268 texts: lives of, 6-7, 131-32, 280-82 Washington Monument, 191 Weber, Max, 96 Thoreau, Henry David, 213; Walden, 230 time: nationalist conceptions of, 6, 124, Webster, Daniel, 137, 146, 191, 282 129-32, 245-46, 282; thinking "in Webster, Noah, 134, 136

Wehner, Peter, 283

Weil, Simone, 212

biblical," 46-48, 129, 155. See also

typology

West Indies, 55, 60, 75-76, 164, 167, 267; as magnet for English emigration, 15, 195; trade with, 21, 54, 65, 72 White-Jacket (Melville), 147-52 White, John, 102-3, 110, 111 Williams, Roger, 50, 57, 78, 200, 219, 233, Williams, William Carlos, 198 Wilson, John, 190 Wilson, Woodrow, 136, 172, 173-74, 182-84, 254 Winthrop, Francis Bayard, 133 Winthrop, John: background of, 20-21, 45, 94, 97; in Glenn Beck video, 270-71, 278; and composition of the Model, 15-20, 22-23, 27-30; family and descendants of, 16, 35, 73, 75, 133-35, 190; handwriting of, 14; and Anne Hutchinson, 200-1, 228; Journal of, 17, 23, 29, 48, 55, 75, 78, 103, 133-34, 138, 263; memorials to 137, 190, 202-3; Perry Miller on, 3, 205, 207-9; Edmund Morgan on, 220; motives of, in joining expedition, 32-37, 109; negotiations of, with emigrants and investors, 21-22,

98-101; other writings of, 16, 29, 53, 54, 87; preservation of religious orthodoxy by, 199, 200-1; portraits of, 20, 31; shifting reputation of 50, 68, 83,135-36, 199, 201-3, 233-34, 247, 257, 262, 271-73; wife of, 36, 45, 98. See also "Model of Christian Charity, A" Winthrop, John, Jr., 16, 41, 73 Winthrop, Margaret, 36, 98 Winthrop, Robert C., 144, 145, 194 Winthrop, Stephen, 75 Winthrop, Thomas Lindall, 134 Wish, Harvey, 219 witchcraft, 197 Wood, Peter, 251 World War I, 168, 171, 172, 204, 211, 217, 244; mission, sense of, in, 158, 180-81, 182–85; Versailles Peace Conference following, 182-84 World War II, 208, 213, 221, 260, 267 Worster, Donald, 59

Yates, John, 88

Zakaria, Fareed, 261