# Contents

## Introduction

“The Most Famous Lay Sermon in All of American History” 1

## Part I  Text

1. Writing “A Model of Christian Charity”  13
2. “We Shall Be as a City upon a Hill”  31
3. A Chosen People  44
4. New England in a World of Holy Experiments  58
5. Left All Alone in America  71
6. Love Is a Bond or Ligament  86
7. Moralizing the Market Economy  96
8. The Poor and the Boundaries of Obligation  107

## Part II  Nation

9. Inventing Foundations  123
10. Mobile Metaphors of Nationalism  133
11. From the Top Mast  146
12. Constructing a City on a Hill in Africa  158
13. The Carnage of God’s Chosen Nations  171
PART III  ICON

14 The Historical Embarrassments of New England 189

15 Puritanism in an Existentialist Key 204

16 Arguing over the Puritans during the Cold War 217

17 Ronald Reagan's Shining City on a Hill 233

18 Puritan Foundations of an “Exceptionalist” Nation 247

19 Ambivalent Evangelicals 264

EPILOGUE
Disembarking from the Arbella 280

APPENDIX
John Winthrop, “A Model of Christian Charity”: A Modern Transcription 289

Notes 309

Acknowledgments 341

Index 345
For the last sixty years, a story has been told about the origins of America. Like many historical stories, it is told as a parable: deep and timeless continuities flow out of the specifics of time and place. It is an uplifting story and a haunting one. And it is at least half wrong.

The setting is a vessel in mid-passage on the Atlantic Ocean. The year is 1630. Fast-forward another decade and a half, and a revolution among those passengers’ countrymen would turn the political and religious order of absolutist England upside down. But the voyagers aboard the Arbella were seeking out a new place of settlement in part because they did not believe such a striking break in human affairs was possible. Balancing hope against despair, they were headed instead for North America.

Somewhere in that mid-ocean passage, their elected governor, John Winthrop, confident and commanding in his presence, rose to deliver an address in which he outlined the purpose of their undertaking. “A Model of Christian Charity” Winthrop’s text would come to be titled. A “lay sermon,” historians since the middle of the
twentieth century have called it: “the most famous lay sermon in all
of American history.”1 In it Winthrop confirmed these new Ameri-
cans’ commitment to a new life of obedience, love, and mutual affec-
tions. He reminded them that they sailed not on their own whim or
private ambitions but under a covenant with God: a commission as
clear as God’s covenant with biblical Israel. Their responsibilities to
each other were intense, and the risks of failure were, literally, terri-
fying. But in return, Winthrop offered a promise. If they should keep
true to their purposes they would not only overcome the hardships
the future held for them in New England. The eyes of all people would
be upon them. They would be made “a praise and glory.” And they
would be “as a city upon a hill” to the world.

This story of John Winthrop’s “Model of Christian Charity” has been
repeated over and over in the history books and in the civic creed of
Americans. It has been celebrated not only for its elements of drama—
dangerous ocean passage, inspired words, and exalted sense of
purpose—but as the origin story of the nation that the United States
was to become. Ronald Reagan made a sentence-long extract from
Winthrop’s Model—“we shall be as a city upon a hill; the eyes of all
people are upon us”—into the signature line of his presidency.
Preached to a “little band of settlers” crowded onto the “tiny ship”
bearing them across the Atlantic, as Reagan saw the event in his mind’s
eye, the Model set the vision to which “our people always have held
fast . . . since our first days as a nation”—that they were destined from
their origins to be a beacon of hope and liberty to the world, a model
to all nations. “It was right here, in the waters around us, where the
American experiment began,” Barack Obama told the graduating class
at the University of Massachusetts at Boston in 2006 in the same vein.
It was right here that the earliest settlers “dreamed of building a City
upon a Hill . . . and the world watched waiting to see if this impro-
bable idea called America would succeed.”2
This origin story is so familiar that it barely seems to invite question. Virtually no modern high school or college textbook on American history or the American political tradition fails to mention Winthrop’s words or impress upon students their enduring importance. “A Model of Christian Charity” has been heralded as the nation’s “point of departure,” as the “founding text in American political rhetoric,” and the key script in the “founding moment” of American civic republicanism.³ “City on a hill” is now an instantly recognizable phrase in the vernacular of American nationalism. Thousands of other lay sermons preached in a future United States would outstrip the original circulation of “A Model of Christian Charity.” But Winthrop’s Model is the statement that we have made foundational to “the idea called America.” “In relation to the principal theme of the American mind,” the immensely influential Harvard historian Perry Miller declared in 1954, “Winthrop stands at the beginning of our consciousness.”⁴

There are powerful reasons behind these judgments. The sense of national mission that marks American civic-political culture, its confidence, and its fervent sense of exception from the lot of all other nations: From what source could these have flowed except from that first, origin moment, when a sense of acting on a special covenant with God became fused with the experience of America? Winthrop’s “we shall be as a city upon a hill” seems to hold in its grasp what the future would bring for the United States: its magnet status for a world of immigrants, its economic ascendancy, and its rise to world leadership. The nation’s moralism, its Wilsonian idealism, the endurance of its religious cultures, and its certainty that it had been granted a unique and special part in the unrolling of human history all seem presaged in Winthrop’s text. Critics see less attractive traits of American national culture embedded there as well: the self-righteousness with which the Americans would roll across the continent and project their
power throughout the world as if they and God were working hand in hand to expand the special promises of America. All this has been traced to the Puritan origins of America and the mission statement that John Winthrop wrote for it.

No serious observer claims that “A Model of Christian Charity” holds all the elements of the nation the United States would become. There would be trial and error in the American future and furious contention as well. But since the middle of the twentieth century Winthrop’s Model has seemed to hold in embryo the nation’s most powerful and distinctive threads. To begin at the American beginning is to begin with a text in its mid-oceanic setting, just before its words and its promise to be a “city upon a hill” would begin to be etched on the land.

Most of this is a modern invention and much of it is wrong. None of those who voyaged with John Winthrop to the Puritan settlement in New England left any record that they heard Winthrop’s words in mid-passage. Most likely “A Model of Christian Charity” was never delivered as a sermon at all. Although copies of Winthrop’s text circulated in England during his lifetime, by the end of the seventeenth century they had all literally vanished from memory. One of those long-forgotten copies was discovered in a bundle of old sermons and documents of New England history in 1809, but it was not put into print until 1838. And then it lapsed from sight again almost as completely. An occasional nineteenth-century historian mentioned Winthrop’s “Model of Christian Charity,” but most did not and none pulled it—or its “city upon a hill” line—out of the mass of other colonial American documents as especially important. Through the 1970s mention of “A Model of Christian Charity” was a hit-or-miss affair in standard histories of the United States. It was only in the decade of the 1980s, three hundred and fifty years after its writing, that the incongruously parallel work of a conservative Cold War president, Ronald Reagan, and a radical, immigrant literary scholar, Sacvan
Bercovitch, combined to make Winthrop’s text and metaphor famous. “A Model of Christian Charity” is old, but its foundational status is a twentieth-century invention.

The meanings we now grasp for so eagerly in Winthrop’s words are largely twentieth-century inventions as well. John Winthrop never doubted that he and his fellow New England Puritans sailed under the seal of a covenant with God. Of nothing was he more confident than that they had a key part to play in God’s scheme of history. But in its own time, the call to greatness in Winthrop’s “city upon a hill” line was vastly overshadowed by its reminder of the settlement project’s immense vulnerability. Caution saturated his “city upon a hill” metaphor. It did not promise these incipient Americans that they were destined to be a radiant light to the world but that they would need to work out their ambitions under the world’s most intense, critical scrutiny. The core theme that laced the Model’s words together, from its opening statement of the mutual relations between rich and poor to its fervent closing peroration, was not nationalistic but local and intense: an insistence on love and the obligations of social solidarity that would be often sharply at odds with what capitalist America would become.

The conventional story of Winthrop’s “city on a hill” text is wrong in still other ways. Its current status as a founding statement of American “exceptionalism” to the contrary, almost none of the themes that circulated through Winthrop’s text were unique to the nation that would become the United States. Dreams of founding a new and purer Israel circulated all across the early modern Atlantic. During the long nineteenth-century era of economic and imperial expansion, conviction that a nation’s people had been uniquely commissioned to lead God’s forces of good and civilization played a bedrock role in patriotic cultures far beyond the United States. Even the idea that nations owed their essential character to a foundational moment, to a timeless and enduring origin statement, is far less unique to the United States than is typically acknowledged.
Most conspicuously of all, the phrase “city on a hill” was itself a borrowing, a repurposing for Winthrop’s occasion of the one of the Bible’s most familiar metaphors, which was to be repurposed hundreds of times again, in and far beyond the United States. The importance of Winthrop’s “Model of Christian Charity” is not that it broached ideas and themes exceptional to the history of the United States but that it was, from the beginning, so deeply enmeshed in the world around it.

Above all, to read Winthrop’s “city upon a hill” seriously we need to disentangle ourselves from the lure of simple origin stories. Texts live in and through time. A certain kind of nationalism recoils against that assumption. It strains to fix the nation to a foundational moment or proposition or text as if the idea of the nation—whatever its actual missteps or temporary disruptions—could be held exempt from history itself. But no words or text can be insulated from time. Their occasions change, the possibilities others see in them change, sometimes radically. Every subsequent use is by necessity a rewriting, a reinvention for new hopes, new conditions, and new contentions. To take a key historical text seriously is not to shove these afterlives aside as a debris of misreadings. It is not merely to sketch a history of “reception,” “circulation,” or “influence,” important as these themes may be. Texts endure only through their continuous reappropriation for inescapably shifting times and purposes.

The point is true of every document a nation holds sacred. The Declaration of Independence whose words reverberate through American culture now is not the Declaration of 1776. It is not the radically different Declaration that Thomas Jefferson’s political allies fashioned, taking his “all men are created equal” line out of the sidebar place it occupied in his original text and turning it into a political slogan. Nor is it the yet more sweeping Declaration that antislavery activists would make from a slaveholder’s words or rights activists would construct in the twentieth century. Into our own day the Dec-
laration of Independence has been simultaneously an object of venera-
tion and a site for fierce, vitally important contention over the shapes and forms of justice. The “living Constitution” is, by the same token, not simply a phrase for loose constructionists. Even before its adoption, the U.S. Constitution was being reworked, its silences fleshed out, its ambiguities debated, and its elasticities contended for. Reinvention of their core texts is part of the work that nations do. There is potential chaos in this, of course. But without it there can hardly be any serious public life at all.

Pushing back against the origin myths that have obscured it, this book tells the story of the lives of a text that many twentieth-century Americans would construct to be foundational to the “idea” of America. It is a story of disappearance and revival, long absence and neglect, and successive modern reinventions.

Part I, “Text,” reconstructs the meanings of Winthrop’s words and metaphors in his own seventeenth-century setting. It begins with the occasion of Winthrop’s writing and the key terms he injected into “A Model of Christian Charity”—city upon a hill, chosen people, covenant, charity, and history. Set against the background of an Atlantic culture filled with model cities on a hill, scores of them more prominent in their time than New England, Winthrop’s phrases take on much less triumphant meanings than the standard Arbella story has it. “Charity” was the Model’s most important keyword. For Winthrop, it meant that the rule of love and mutual obligation must take precedence above mere calculus of price and market return whenever the public weal is at risk. From what occasion did that startling premise arise and how was it worked out in the day-to-day practice of economic life?

In part II, “Nation,” a second phase of the story of “A Model of Christian Charity” begins. In the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries the text itself was all but forgotten. But as nationalism swept across Europe and the Americas, some of the themes that had lodged
a century earlier in Winthrop’s text sprang into circulation all the more vigorously. Patriotic cultures fanned desires for origin stories and foundational texts. Empires were constructed on new convictions of divine-historical destiny. Critics turned the chosen people idea into a tool of dissent. African Americans carried the “city upon a hill” metaphor to the new black republic of Liberia. On the dying fields of World War I, where part II concludes, these globally circulating reverberations of the covenant idea played themselves out in a key of high tragedy.

Finally, in part III, “Icon,” Winthrop’s “Model of Christian Charity” and its “city upon a hill” phrase finally slips into the place that modern nationalism had already made for it: as an invented foundation for the new world colossus that the United States had become. Cold War American writers made the Model into the defining document we now take it to be. They did that in part by canonizing it and in part by unexpectedly remaking Winthrop’s New England Puritans, whose reputation had long been buried under the burdens of their religious intolerance and labyrinthine theology, as the nation’s true “Founders.” Then, in the 1980s, Winthrop’s text suddenly swept from the domains of the scholars into the White House and the rhetorical center of modern American politics. No presidents before Ronald Reagan had used the phrase “city on a hill” to define the very character of the American nation and its place in the world. After Reagan, virtually no serious political figure could escape the obligation to quote it.

But the Model’s story had not reached an end. Social scientists attached a new term—exceptionalism—to Winthrop’s text, even as the exceptional post–World War II character of the United States was visibly eroding beneath them. Evangelical Protestants struggled to decide if the America to which they were so deeply attached and yet with which they were so deeply in quarrel was properly called a city on a hill. And in 2016, the nation elected to the presidency a man who did not like the phrase at all—who, turning the Model on its head,
made not America’s shining example but rather the nation’s manifold “disasters” his signature trope.

Through these shifts and turns in uses and meaning, the career of Winthrop’s text runs as a skein of threads through the American past. A forgotten document would arc, much later, toward iconic status. A biblical image would become a metaphor for a settlement project, a free-floating cliché, an element in the transnationally circulating vocabulary of civic patriotism, a statement of high Cold War purpose, and the creedal foundation of a truly “exceptional” nation. Even in Winthrop’s day, his “Model of Christian Charity” carried no single, stable message. “The American point of departure” would be what people would make of it. Braiding together three centuries of making and remaking, this book tells the story of a text that we think we know so well that we barely know it all it.
Index

abolitionism, 152–54, 156–57, 163. See also slavery
Abraham, 48, 84, 155
Adam, 40, 46, 91, 105, 207
Adams, Charles Francis, 190, 201
Adams, John, 139, 144, 145, 196, 235, 271
Adams, Samuel, 137
Africa, 65, 105, 205; imperialism in,
See also Liberia; Sierra Leone; slavery
African Americans, 116, 202, 229–30, 241,
250, 255; free blacks in antebellum
America, 159, 161–63, 228; and the
Liberian project, 8, 158–70, 171; and
New Negro artists and writers, 169.
See also slavery
American Colonization Society, 159–62
American Education Society, 136
American “idea,” the, 2, 3, 6, 7, 29, 149, 151,
218–19, 222, 249, 258, 262–63, 285,
286
American Patriot’s Bible, The, 268, 271
American Revolution, 174, 191, 193, 196,
221, 258; evangelical interpretation of,
273–75; nationalism and, 127–128,
129–30, 141–42
American studies, 149, 218, 229–30, 231
Americans, The (Boorstin), 221, 222, 239
Ames, William, 92
Anderson, Perry, 174
apocalypticism, 60, 61, 78, 277, 278
Arbella, 47, 75; in Glenn Beck’s video, 270;
presumption that the Model was
delivered aboard, 1, 16–18, 23, 27–29,
221, 249; in Reagan’s story of the Model,
235–39, 246; and the tercentennial of
the Winthrop expedition, 189, 202
Asquith, Herbert Henry, 181

Bacevich, Andrew, 261
Bacon, Frances, 114–15
Bale, Frances, 113–14
Bancroft, George, 136, 192–93
Baritz, Loren, 227
Barton, David, 267, 274
Battle of Bunker Hill, memorialization of,
137, 191, 195
Baxter, Richard, 39
Beard, Charles, 206
Beck, Glenn, 269–71, 274, 278
Belgium, 175
Bell, Daniel, 254–55
Bell, David, 127
Bellah, Robert, 227
Benson, Stephen Allen, 164
Benton, William, 219
Bercovitch, Sacvan, 4–5, 154, 229–32,
233
Berlin, Irving, 268
Bettinger House (Almshouse and House of
Employment), Philadelphia, 117–18,
123
Beveridge, Albert J., 173, 178–79
Bible, 137, 198, 202, 269, 270; importance
of, to contemporary American
evangelical Protestants, 265, 267, 274;
importance of, to English Puritans,
25–26, 45–52; importance of, in the
Spanish conquest, 60–62; and Supreme
Court decisions, 273. See also American
Patriot’s Bible, The; “city upon a hill”;
Matthew, book of; New Testament; Old
Testament; typology
Birch, Joseph, 114
Black Panthers, 240
blacks. See African Americans

For general queries, contact webmaster@press.princeton.edu
Blake, William, 144
Blaxton, William, 190, 202
Blyden, Edward, 164–65
Bolton, John, 256–57
Bonhoeffer, Dietrich, 212
Boorstin, Daniel, 221–23, 227, 228, 239, 282
Borden, Mary, 184–85
Boston, 48, 53, 64, 67, 72, 153, 181, 194, 257; in the American Revolution, 196; civic pride of, 203, 204; early ministers of, 50, 83, 105–6, 130, 190; first historical society in, 134; intolerance and dogmatism in, 67, 197–98, 200; merchants of, 104, 105, 107–8; Philadelphia eclipses as leading seaport, 196; political scandals in, 224–25; relief of the poor of, 108, 113, 117, 118, 119; and the tercentennial of its founding, 189–91, 202, 203, 205, 206; Winthrop memorials in, 190, 201, 202
Boston Common “Founders Memorial,” 190–91, 202–3, 224
Boston Day parade, 189–91, 203
Boston Tea Party, memorialization of, 137, 189
Boyer, Paul S., 249
Bradford, William, 62, 137, 190, 271, 273
Brazil, 65, 258, 259
Bremer, Francis, 18
British empire, 67, 96, 126, 174, 176, 178–79
Brooks, Cleanth, 227
Browson, Orestes, 152
Bryan, William Jennings, 282
Buckmaster, Thomas, 111
Bulfinch, Charles, 118
Bulkeley, Peter, 56
Burns, Anthony, 153
Bush, George W., 255, 256, 257, 262, 263, 277, 283; and the chosen people theme, 249, 272
Bush, Jeb, 285
Bushnell, Horace, 154
Cabot, Sebastian, 92
Calabresi, Steven G., 262
California, 236, 240, 241
Calvin, John, 24, 39, 47, 92, 197, 213. See also Calvinism
Calvinism, 24, 47, 49, 52, 65–66, 143, 209, 214, 229, 240
Canaan, 79, 163; as analogue for New World settlements, 48, 49, 50, 53, 60, 61, 68, 81, 101
Canada, 174, 259
capitalism: in early America, 96; in Puritan New England, 96–98
Caribbean, 33, 105, 175, 176, 177, 258
Carson, Ben, 283
Carter, Jimmy, 242–43
Carwardine, Richard, 156
Cass, Lewis, 140
Catholicism: and the Roman Catholic Church as the true “city on a hill,” 38; Protestant campaigns against, 20–21, 33, 35, 37, 71–76. See also Franciscans; Jesuits; toleration, religious
Channing, Edward, 136
Charles I (king of England), 71, 72
chosen people: concept of, 8, 71, 73, 82, 144–45, 158, 172, 231, 249, 272, 278, 286; and cultures of nationalism, 125–26, 141–44; Abraham Lincoln on, 145, 154–57; Herman Melville on, 147–51; in the Model, 7, 30, 44–57, 86, 94, 136; as a tool of criticism, 146–47, 151–52, 153; beyond the U.S., 52–53, 57, 60, 65–66, 70, 125, 143–44, 158, 231; in World War I, 183–85. See also Israel: biblical, analogues of in modern world
Christie, Chris, 283, 285
Chubb, Mercy, 115
Index

347

cities on a hill: in the early modern Atlantic world, 58–59, 66; in early modern England, 39, 110, 141
Civil War (American), 154–57, 158, 172, 177, 253. See also Confederacy, Southern
Civil War (English). See Puritan Revolution (England)

Cleveland, Grover, 268
Clinton, Bill, 248
Clinton, Hillary, 249, 283
Cold War, 248, 253; Reagan’s use of the Model as a document for, 234, 239–42, 246, 281; remaking of the Model during, 4, 8, 9, 94, 214, 216, 217–32, 275
Coleman, Thomas, 72
Coleman, William David, 164
Coles, Robert, 212
Columbus, Christopher, 58, 60–61, 267
Comey, James, 285
Communism, 225, 229; American Communist Party, 221, 252; anti-, 239
Confederacy, Southern, nationalism in, 128, 132, 143, 155
Connecticut, 56, 118, 134, 228
Continental Congress, 235, 269
Cotton, John, 37, 41, 46; and the rules of commerce, 103, 104–5; and sermon of farewell to New England-bound Puritans, 18, 35, 46, 52, 55, 56

covenant, 227, 229; idea of, in nationalist rhetoric, 65–66, 143–44; with God, consequences of breaking, 56, 82, 230; with God, as outlined in the Model, 2, 3, 5, 19–20, 24, 30, 50–51, 87, 93, 94, 146, 287; Puritan idea of, 45–46; theology of, Perry Miller on, 207–9, 210, 211

Craddock, Matthew, 21
Crandall, Prudence, 228
Cromwell, Oliver, 72, 75, 88
Cruz, Ted, 283
Cuba, 172, 176, 258
Cuomo, Mario, 248
Curley, James, 190–91, 202, 203, 223, 224
Curti, Merle, 227
Cushman, Robert, 50

Davenport, John, 84
Davis, Jefferson, 155
Dean, Paul, 139
Declarations of Independence, 13, 18, 124, 142, 190, 229, 235, 284–85; Lincoln and, 156; shifting reputation of, 6–7, 131–32, 222, 246, 251, 281
DeMar, Gary, 271
democracy, in early New England, 45, 87, 194, 199–201, 206

Democracy, in early New England, 45, 87, 194, 199–201, 206

Denmark, 35, 175
de Quiroga, Vasco. See Quiroga, Vasco de Dibelius, Otto, 184
Dolan, Anthony, 237, 243–44
Dominican Republic, 172

Dorchester, England, 53, 103, 109, 110, 111, 112
Dorchester, Massachusetts, 53, 113–15, 116
Douglas, Paul, 224
Douglass, Frederick, 153–54, 157, 163
Douthat, Ross, 269
Dudley, Thomas, 53, 103
Dukakis, Michael, 248
Dunn, Richard, 23
Dutch Republic, 32, 36, 49, 64–66, 68, 143, 175
Dyer, Mary, 67
East India Company, 21, 126
Eaton, Theophilus, 84
Eburne, Richard, 49
Edwards, Jonathan, 92–93, 179, 213
Eggleston, Edward, 136
Eisenhower, Dwight D., 214, 216, 219, 224
Eliot, John, 33
Elizabethan Poor Laws, 110, 112
Emancipation Proclamation, 157
Emerson, Ralph Waldo, 213
Endecott, John, 41
England: charity and the poor in, 34–35, 109–11; chosen people rhetoric in, 39, 48–49, 52–53, 143, 149, 174, 180, 184, 244; emigration from, 15, 20–22, 27, 28–29, 32–37, 67, 102; imperialism in, 72, 75–76, 175; return migration to, 28, 74–75. See also Magna Carta; Puritans, English
English Civil War. See Puritan Revolution (England)
“Errand into the Wilderness” (Miller), 76, 213, 214–15, 220
evangelical Christianity. See Protestantism, contemporary American evangelical
existentialism, 211–13
Falwell, Jerry, 275, 277
Faust, Drew, 132, 155
Federalist Party, 131, 132, 176
Federer, William, 271, 273
Fiennes, William (Lord Saye and Sele), 41
Firestone Rubber Company, 169, 172
First World War. See World War I
Fiske, John, 182
Folsom, George, 135
Forefathers’ Day, 191
Founding Fathers, 191, 194–95, 197, 228, 269, 274, 284
Fourth of July. See Independence Day
France, 194, 255; imperialism in, 175, 176, 178; as a model nation, 141, 143, 178, 180–81; nationalism in, 127, 128, 130, 131, 258; and the Seven Years War, 174; in World War I, 171, 180–81, 184, 189.
See also French Revolution
Franciscans, 61, 68
Franklin, Benjamin, 129, 222, 271
French Revolution, 127, 128, 130, 131, 141, 194, 258
frontier, American, 176, 206
Fulbright program, 218–19
Fuller, Margaret, 152, 213
Gamble, Richard, 276
Garrison, William Lloyd, 140, 153, 163
Garvey, Marcus, 167
George III (king of England), 129
Georgia, 49, 134, 221
Germany: embattled Protestants in, 35, 73–74; emigrants from, to Pennsylvania, 67; imperialism in, 178, 179; nationalism in, 128, 130, 143, 175, 180, 184; in World War I, 180–85
Gingrich, Callista, 266
Gingrich, Newt, 254, 256, 266
Goldwater, Barry, 239
Golway, Terry, 252
Goodrich, Charles A., 136
Gore, Al, 248
Great Britain. See British empire; England; Scotland
Great Depression, 204, 253, 270
Great Society, 226, 247
Great War. See World War I
Greene, Nathaniel, 139
“Guarani republic,” 63–64, 68
Guatemala, 63
Haiti, 163, 172
Handlin, Oscar, 227
Harrington, James, 88
Hartford Convention, 196–97
Harvard University, 169, 194, 221, 285; Harvard College's first class, 74; historians at, 3, 181, 199, 224, 227; Perry Miller and, 204, 205, 212, 213
Hawaii, 172
Hawthorne, Nathaniel, 198
Herndon, Ruth, 116
Heston, Charlton, 268
historical societies, 129, 134–35. See also specific historical societies
Hooke, William, 79
Hooker, Thomas, 36, 52–53, 56
Hopkins, Edward, 83–84
Horneck, Anthony, 39
Houston, Sam, 142
Howes, Edward, 41
Huckabee, Mike, 256, 267, 273
Hughes, Langston, 169
Humphrey, Hubert, 226
Huntington, Samuel, 253
Hutchinson, Anne, 200–201, 228, 232, 233, 249, 251
Hutchinson, Ellen Mackay, 136
immigration: Boston's celebration of, in the 1930s, 189, 202–3; destinations of, in colonial America, 15, 65, 68, 80–81, 195, 196; fear of, 272, 277; and return migration, 28, 74–75, 259, 260–61; to the U.S., 3, 259, 260–61
Independence Day, 129, 130, 131, 132, 140, 142, 152, 228
India, 21, 65, 176, 178
Indians. See Native Americans
inequality, 20–21, 87, 94, 111, 152, 226, 227, 248; in the Model, 19, 20, 26, 87, 88, 91–92, 138
Ireland, 67; English imperialism in, 72, 75, 175; Scots and English migrants to, 15, 80; Winthrop's plan to move to, 35
Isaiah, 60, 70, 89, 237, 244
Italy, 130, 175, 259
Jackson, Andrew, 138, 142, 268
Jackson, Stonewall, 155, 268
Jacob, 48, 155
Jamestown, 193
Japan, 178
Jefferson, Thomas, 174, 176, 222, 229, 238, 262, 271, 284; on Americans as a chosen people, 129, 144–45, 172; and the Declaration of Independence, 6, 131, 235, 281
Jeremiad, 82–83, 129, 151, 278
Jesey, Henry, 87
Jessup, John, 219, 220
Jesuits, 63–64, 67, 68
Jews. See Israel, biblical; Old Testament
Johnson, Edward, 65, 81
Johnson, Lyndon, 226
Jones, Bob, III, 277
Keayne, Robert, 104, 105, 107–8
Kennedy, Geoffrey Studdert, 180
Kennedy, John F., 172–73, 228, 285; use of "city upon a hill" by, 217–18, 223–26, 238
Kennedy, Robert, 226, 283
Kerry, John, 249
Kierkegaard, Søren, 212
King, Martin Luther Jr., 230, 268, 269, 270
Knock, Thomas, 183
Krieger, Larry, 150
LaHaye, Tim, 277
Las Casas, Bartolomé de, 63, 64
Latin America, 33, 60–64, 96, 127, 141, 175, 177, 284
Laud, William (Archbishop of Canterbury), 71, 72, 77
Lazarus, Emma, 238
Lauderdale, Marquis de, 190
LaHaye, Tim, 277
LaHaye, Tim, 277
Las Casas, Bartolomé de, 63, 64
Latin America, 33, 60–64, 96, 127, 141, 175, 177, 284
Laud, William (Archbishop of Canterbury), 71, 72, 77
Lazarus, Emma, 238
League of Nations, 183
Lee, Robert E., 155, 268
Lenin, Vladimir, 235; Leninism, 252
Leppard, George, 235
Levant Company, 21
Lewis, R. W. B., 227
Lewis, Thomas, 143
Light and the Glory, The (Marshall and Manuel), 266–67
Lincoln, Abraham, 249, 262, 269, 283, 285; on Americans as an “almost chosen people,” 145, 154–57
Lipset, Seymour Martin, 253
Locke, John, 207
Lodge, Henry Cabot, 182
love, as central theme in the Model, 2, 5, 7, 19, 22, 23, 24, 30, 51, 87, 90–91, 93–94, 120, 209, 280
Luce, Edward, 261
Lyly, John, 48
Madison, James, 196, 284
Magna Carta, 131, 132
Maier, Pauline, 131
manifest destiny, 32, 125, 142, 144, 173, 176, 179, 269–70
Manuel, David, 266, 271
Markham, Edwin, 190
Marryat, Frederick, 149
Marshall, Peter, 266, 271
Martin, Jerry, 236, 237
Marx, Karl, 252
Marxism, 248, 252, 253
Massachusetts, 137, 139, 144, 169, 189, 201, 203; John Kennedy and, 223, 224, 238; erasure of the word, in the Model, 14. See also Massachusetts Bay Colony
Massachusetts Bay Colony: compared to Penn’s project, 68–69; compared to the Dutch Republic, 65, 68–69; compared to the Jesuit missions in Paraguay, 64–68; economy of, 96–97, 101–6, 195–96, 257; initial death rate in, 34; isolation of, 73–74, 76–85; motives for founding and emigration to, 15, 20, 32–37, 42–43; the poor in, 107–9, 111–16; return migration from, 28, 74–75; size of initial migration to, 15, 27, 99; toleration of dissent in, 36–37, 78–80, 87. See also Massachusetts Bay Company
Massachusetts Bay Company, 15, 45, 54, 97, 193; investors’ controversy in, 21–23, 98–101; Winthrop’s leadership of, 21–23, 28–29, 98–101, 109. See also Massachusetts Bay Colony
Massachusetts General Court, 73–74, 77, 103; and debt cases, 97; and Anne Hutchinson, 201; and the Keayne case, 104; and the poor, 111–12; and wages, 102; Winthrop’s speech on liberty to, 29, 87, 208
Massachusetts Historical Society, 135, 235
Mather, Cotton, 50, 83–84, 179
Mather, Increase, 53
Mather, Richard, 36, 53
Matthew, book of, 38–41, 43, 138, 265, 276
Mayflower, 27, 32
Mayflower Compact, 24, 193–95, 200, 251, 273
McCain, John, 248, 255, 272
McGiffert, Michael, 48
McGovern, George, 226
Melville, Herman, 147–52, 213, 230
Merrifield, Henry, 115
Metaxas, Eric, 262
Mexico, 61, 63, 141, 177, 258, 284
Michelet, Jules, 141
Michell, Jonathan, 81
millennialism, 59–61, 68, 84, 278
Index

Miller, Perry, 3, 222, 271; and the Cold War, 217, 219, 232; early experiences of, 204–5; and "Errand into the Wilderness," 76, 213, 214, 220; and the Model, 16–17, 25, 207–9, 213, 216, 229, 231, 233, 281; and The New England Mind, 209, 220; project of, to understand the Puritan mind and legacy, 205–16

Milton, John, 39, 143

ministers, New England, 45; as "cities on a hill," 38–39; and the English Puritan Revolution, 72, 74–75, 77–78, 80; and idea of a New Israel, 73, 81–84; sermon themes of, 26–27, 40–41, 69, 82–83, 105–6. See also specific ministers


Moore, Susan, 74

Morgan, Edmund, 92, 220–21, 223, 228

Morison, Samuel Eliot, 28, 181–82, 199

Moses, Samuel, 53, 100, 198, 268; as analogue for emigrants, 24, 49, 51, 52, 55, 56–57, 62, 66, 84; and rules of charity, 89

Motley, John Lothrop, 200

Murray, George, 240

Murrin, John, 249

Muzzey, David Saville, 136

Napoleon, 163, 176

National Archives, 13

National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, 167–68

nationalism: burgeoning cultures of, in Europe and the Americas, 3, 6, 7–8, 48–49, 125–32, 138–45, 174–80; critical, 151–54; and imperialism, 174–76; Lincoln's, 154–57; technologies of 126–28; in World War I, 180–85. See also time, nationalist conceptions of; traditions, invented


Navy, U.S., 147–52, 172

Netherlands. See Dutch Republic

New England: attempts to establish as site of America's founding, 8, 191–95, 203, 245; marginal importance of in early America, 80, 195–97; and project of sectional nationalism, 191–95; shifting reputation of, 197–202

New England Society of Charleston, South Carolina, 193

New England Society of New York, 191

"New Israel." See Israel, biblical

New Testament, 268, 276; "city on a hill" in, 37–38, 265; and rules of charity, 89–90; and typology, 47–48; Winthrop's use of, in the Model, 39–40, 50–51, 287
New-York Historical Society, 13, 16, 133, 134–35
Nicaragua, 21, 172
Niebuhr, Reinhold, 211–12
Nixon, Richard, 226
Noll, Mark, 276
Noonan, Peggy, 31, 237, 245
Norton, John, 81
Oakes, Urian, 81, 83
Obama, Barack, 269; on American exceptionalism, 255–57, 263; on the American “idea,” 2, 249, 282; and the “city on a hill,” 2, 249, 283
Old Testament, 39–40, 268; God’s chosen people in, 45, 50, 56, 144; and typology, 47–48, 129, 155; Winthrop’s use of, in the Model, 50–51, 287
oppression, economic, 102–3, 104–5, 106. See also usury
O’Reilly, Edward, 16, 289, 343
O’Sullivan, John L., 130, 142, 173
Owen, Wilfred, 181
Ozouf, Mona, 129
Paine, Tom, 129, 130
Palfrey, John Gorham, 136
Palin, Sarah, 248, 256
Pan-African Congresses, 168
Paraguay, 63–64, 67
Paramino, John Francis, 190, 202, 203
Parrington, Vernon Louis, 201, 206
Pascal, Blaise, 212
Patterson-Smith, J., 184
Penn, William, 123, 271; colony founded by, 66–68, 126, 196, 221
Pennsylvania, 123; as a magnet for European emigrants, 68, 195; as a model society, 66–68, 69, 221. See also Philadelphia
Perkins, William, 38–39
Perthes, Friedrich Christoph, 143
Peter, Hugh, 74
Phelan, John, 60
Philadelphia, 128,156; eclipses Boston as colonies’ leading seaport, 196; poor relief and charitable institutions in, 117, 118, 119, 123–24
Philippines, 172, 173, 178, 179
Pilgrims, 24, 27, 32, 50, 62, 65, 84, 246, 257; anniversary of landing of, 137, 191, 193; contemporary evangelicals’ embrace of, 273; reputation of, 199–200. See also Mayflower Compact
Plummer, William, 139
Plymouth Colony. See Pilgrims
Plymouth Company, 97
poor, the, 123, 152, 159, 259; and contemporary evangelical Protestants, 264, 272–73; English, 34–35, 109–11, 160, 221; in the Model, 5, 19, 20, 24, 26, 88–90, 92–93, 119, 138; in Puritan New England, 87, 94–95, 106, 108, 111–20, 257. See also charity; inequality; poor relief
poverty. See charity; poor, the; poor relief
Protestantism, contemporary American evangelical: ambivalent nationalism in, 275–79; attitudes toward poverty in, 272–73; and Christian histories of America, 266–68, 273–74; and the “city on a hill” phrase, 8, 264–66; marginal place of Winthrop’s Model in, 271–75
Providence Foundation, 267
Providence Island Company, 97
providential history: in the age of nationalism, 124, 129, 141–44, 174, 176, 179; and the American Civil War, 154–57; and contemporary evangelical Protestantism, 266–69, 275–77, 278–79; definition of, 46–47; and the Dutch Republic, 66, 68; and the English, 72, 75, 79–80, 143, 174; and Liberia, 161–65; and the New England Puritans, 46–47, 49, 54, 57, 62, 72, 79–80, 84, 86, 125, 281; and the Spanish colonial empire, 60–62, 68
Puerto Rico, 172
index

Puritan Revolution (England), 1, 21, 37, 71–73, 75–76, 77–78, 215, 258; and care of the poor, 111; New England and, 74–80

Puritans, English: and church organization, 77–78, 79; and the “city on a hill,” 38–39; and covenant theology, 45, 208; efforts of, to discipline unruly English culture, 76; importance of the Bible to, 25–26; improvement of the poor by, 109–11; and religious toleration, 78–79; and sermons, 25–26; terms of self-description of, 42; and typology, 46–48. See also Puritan Revolution (England)


Quakers, 66–68, 69, 78, 117–18, 197

Quiroga, Vasco de, 63, 64

racism, 158–70, 173, 224, 273–74

Ramsey, David, 130

Rankin, Jeannette, 228


Rhode Island, 116, 200

Richardson, Charles F., 136

Roberts, Joseph Jenkins, 165

Robertson, Pat, 271

Robespierre, Maximilien, 141

Roe v. Wade, 274

Romney, Mitt, 249, 256, 283

Roosevelt, Franklin, 238, 268

Roosevelt, Theodore, 167, 178

Rosenthal, Albert H., 226

Rossiter, Clinton, 219

Roe, Edward James, 164

Rubio, Marco, 283

Russia, 92, 175, 176, 178; as a chosen people, 143

Rustin, Bayard, 268

Saint-Gaudens, Augustus, 198

Salem, Massachusetts, 41, 74, 99, 197, 200

Santorum, Rick, 249

Saye and Sele, Lord, 54, 55

Scalia, Antonin, 285

Schaeffer, Frank, 277

Schama, Simon, 66

Schlesinger, Arthur, Jr., 212, 224

Schuck, Peter, 262

Schulzinger, Robert, 179

Scotland, 15, 71, 128, 174

scribal publication, system of, 14

Scudder, H. A., 193

Selma, Alabama, 270, 282

Sermon on the Mount, 38–41, 92

sermons: importance of, to Puritans, 25, 206, 208; structure of, 25–26;
Winthrop's Model imagined as a, 1, 4, 25–27, 28

Seven Years War, 143, 174

Sheidley, Harlow, 192

Shepard, Thomas, 79

Sierra Leone, 160, 169

Slack, Paul, 111

slavery, 59, 65; in colonial America, 80, 96, 127–28; and the colonization of Liberia, 159, 160, 161–62, 163, 169; and dynamics of imperialism, 163, 173, 176,
slavery (cont.)  
197; as foundational to American  
history, 192, 195, 250; in Haiti, 163,  
176; Lincoln on, 155–57; and periods  
of American “exceptionalism,” 258–59;  
as a political issue, 6, 140, 152–54,  
173, 197; in Puritan New England,  
32–33, 105; in Spanish America, 59,  
60, 63, 64. See also abolitionism; Civil  
War
Smith, Thomas, 92
Sombart, Werner, 253
Sorenson, Theodore, 223–25, 228, 238
Soviet Union, 219, 221, 225, 237, 260.  
See also Russia
Spanish empire, in the Americas, 21, 33,  
60–64, 72, 76, 96, 127, 221
Sparks, Jared, 194
Statue of Liberty, 237, 238, 259, 270
St. Augustine, 199, 209
Stedman, Edmund Clarence, 136
Stiles, Robert, 113–14
Stillman, Samuel, 130
Stowe, Harriet Beecher, 142
good trade, 60, 65, 80, 176, 195
Supreme Court, U.S., 225, 268, 285;  
decisions of, that mobilized the  
Christian right, 273–75
Swaggart, Donnie, 277
Sweden, 73, 197
Sweet, Leonard, 61
Taft, William Howard, 167, 183
Tancredo, Tom, 275–76
Tea Party (political movement), 269
Teage, Hilary, 165–66
Texas, 258; Republic of, 142; State Board of  
Education, 250
textbooks, history: for Christian home-  
schoolers, 265, 267; and the Model, 3,  
17, 136, 172, 220, 228, 249–50
texts: lives of, 6–7, 131–32, 280–82
Thoreau, Henry David, 213; Walden, 230
time: nationalist conceptions of, 6, 124,  
129–32, 245–46, 282; thinking “in  
biblical,” 46–48, 129, 155. See also  
typology
tobacco trade, 21, 35, 96
toleration, religious: in the Dutch Republic,  
65; in England, 78, 80; and intolerance  
in New England, 31, 36–37, 78–80, 83,  
197–99, 200–201; in Pennsylvania,  
67–68, 196
Tocqueville, Alexis de, 194, 195; and  
“exceptionalism,” 254
traditions, invented, 128–29, 130–31
Trumbull, Jonathan, 134
Trump, Donald, 283–85
Turner, Frederick Jackson, 182, 206,  
253
Tuskegee Institute, 166–67
typology, 47–48, 83, 129, 155
Universal Negro Improvement Association,  
167
usury, 90, 103, 105
Vane, Sir Henry, 75
Vietnam War, 226, 229, 231, 238, 241
Virginia colony, 21, 97, 193, 205, 221;  
disparaging of, 193–94; emigrants to,  
32; mortality rate at, 34; as most  
important engine of early North  
American growth, 195; primacy to  
foundational status of, 192; tobacco  
and slave economy of, 96
Voice of America, 218
Voltaire, 64, 68
Wakeman, Samuel, 81–82
Warburton, William, 143
Ward, Nathaniel, 79
Warren, Joseph, 237
Warren, Robert Penn, 227
Washington, Booker T., 166, 167
Washington, George, 128, 268
Washington Monument, 191
Weber, Max, 96
Webster, Daniel, 137, 146, 191, 282
Webster, Noah, 134, 136
Wehner, Peter, 283
Weil, Simone, 212
West Indies, 55, 60, 75–76, 164, 167, 267; as magnet for English emigration, 15, 195; trade with, 21, 54, 65, 72

White-Jacket (Melville), 147–52

White, John, 102–3, 110, 111

Williams, Roger, 50, 57, 78, 200, 219, 233, 251

Williams, William Carlos, 198

Wilson, John, 190


Winthrop, Francis Bayard, 133

Winthrop, John: background of, 20–21, 45, 94, 97; in Glenn Beck video, 270–71, 278; and composition of the Model, 15–20, 22–23, 27–30; family and descendants of, 16, 35, 73, 75, 133–35, 190; handwriting of, 14; and Anne Hutchinson, 200–1, 228; Journal of, 17, 23, 29, 48, 55, 75, 78, 103, 133–34, 138, 263; memorials to 137, 190, 202–3; Perry Miller on, 3, 205, 207–9; Edmund Morgan on, 220; motives of, in joining expedition, 32–37, 109; negotiations of, with emigrants and investors, 21–22, 98–101; other writings of, 16, 29, 53, 54, 87; preservation of religious orthodoxy by, 199, 200–1; portraits of, 20, 31; shifting reputation of 50, 68, 83, 135–36, 199, 201–3, 233–34, 247, 257, 262, 271–73; wife of, 36, 45, 98. See also “Model of Christian Charity, A"

Winthrop, John, Jr., 16, 41, 73

Winthrop, Margaret, 36, 98

Winthrop, Robert C., 144, 145, 194

Winthrop, Stephen, 75

Winthrop, Thomas Lindall, 134

Wish, Harvey, 219

witchcraft, 197

Wood, Peter, 251

World War I, 168, 171, 172, 204, 211, 217, 244; mission, sense of, in, 158, 180–81, 182–85; Versailles Peace Conference following, 182–84

World War II, 208, 213, 221, 260, 267

Worster, Donald, 59

Yates, John, 88

Zakaria, Fareed, 261