

## Contents

---

---

<i>Foreword by Alasdair MacIntyre</i>	vii
Introduction	1
I. A New Role for the Papacy: The Origins of Vatican I	5
1. From Bossuet to Maistre: The Deconfessionalization of the State as a Political Problem	7
The Civil Constitution of the Clergy	7
The Autonomy of the Temporal Power in Relation to the Church	15
The Alliance of Church and State as a Matrix of Intolerance	22
The Inadequacy of Spiritual Constraints and the Need for Temporal Constraints	26
The French Revolution through the Lens of Political Theology	30
2. The Collapse of Reactionary Ultramontanism	37
Napoleon's Miscalculations	37
Félicité de Lamennais on the Atheism of the Law	46
Against Political Theology	51
A Papacy Refocused on Its Spiritual Role	58
Alexis de Tocqueville and the Preservation of Gallicanism	69
II. A New Role for the Laity: The Origins of Vatican II	81
3. Intolerant Secularism and Liberal Secularism	83
Auguste Comte: From Papal Infallibility to the Infallibility of Science	84
Laicism as Statism	88
Two Kinds of Laicity	95
Emile Littré's "Catholicism of Universal Suffrage"	99
Charles Péguy: The Eternal Dwelling in the Temporal	103
4. The Political Virtues of Moderation	109
Neither Maurras nor Marx	109
The Political Role of the Laity	117
Freedom of Religion as the Cornerstone of Catholic Political Thought	127
A Degree of Disenchantment since Vatican II	132
A Positive Idea of Laicity	141
Conclusion	147
<i>Notes</i>	153
<i>Index</i>	179

---

---

## Introduction

Representative democracy and liberal Protestantism seem to have a natural affinity. Like liberal Protestantism, representative democracy entails the relegation of belief to the domain of the private, the individual, and the subjective. It privileges not truth as such but the individual's freedom to search for truth. People can pick and choose for themselves from sacred texts in their quest for models and rules of conduct to adapt to contemporary needs. Individualism entails a desire for autonomy that often seems incompatible with submission to religious authorities. From being forces that shaped entire societies, religions are reduced to merely personal preferences. To believe is no longer to belong. This affinity with liberal Protestantism gratifies liberal Protestants and reassures agnostics, but it disturbs both those Protestants who are not liberals and those believers who are not Protestants—starting with Catholics.<sup>1</sup>

The theological drift of democracy is not exclusively in the direction of liberal Protestantism. It also tends toward pantheism, to the idea that God is All and All is God.<sup>2</sup> In putting everyone on the same level, its doctrine of social equality undermines the sense of individuality. The citizen is absorbed by the people, the people by humanity, and humanity itself by an indifferent and undifferentiated Nature. The finite is swallowed up in the vague and nebulous infinite. Sensitivity to difference and to particularity is dulled. The sense of the person is lost in the totality, and the dignity of the individual person becomes meaningless. This pantheistic tendency appeals to environmentalists and to the most radical democrats, and it is welcome to those totalitarian ideologues who find their own freedom a burden. However, it disturbs those believers who uphold the Christian concept of the person and of personal salvation along with the broad outlines of Genesis: for if God created the world, then the world is not God. The tendency toward pantheism is particularly disturbing to Catholics, whose traditions sensitize them to the importance of hierarchy, order, and form.

In this book, I set out to show how the Catholic Church has responded to these two contradictory yet complementary challenges, the upper and nether millstones of liberal Protestantism and pantheism, which, under more or less totalitarian regimes, have squeezed it to the point of persecution or driven it to the point of civil war—for example, during the Vendée (1793), or in Mexico

2 • Introduction

(1926–29) and Spain (1931–39). How has the church adapted to liberty and equality? To what extent has it turned threats into opportunities?<sup>3</sup>

My analysis is organized around the two great councils that, for the Catholic Church, bestrode the last two centuries: Vatican I (1870) and Vatican II (1962–65). I intend to show that the First Vatican Council was just as “modern” as the Second Vatican Council, and even that the latter reasserted aspects of tradition against the former. I intend to show that the two councils represent in effect the two poles between which the Catholic Church oscillates in the age of democracy, but also that these two poles are complementary and can be successfully integrated within a single perspective. By analogy with the “Gregorian Reform” of the eleventh century and the “Counter-Reformation” of the sixteenth century, I speak here of a “Vatican Reform.” I argue that the contemporary Catholic Church is blending the work of the two councils into a coherent program of Vatican Reform on the basis of which it can go forward.

The First Vatican Council set the seal on the renewed affirmation of the importance of the papacy in the democratic age. Under the Ancien Regime, Catholics were for the most part nationalistic and attached little importance to the papacy. But with the end of the “confessional state” and the destabilization of national religious identities came a shift in allegiances. Catholics now looked to Rome as the center of a religious identity that was no longer rooted in national traditions. Vatican I defined the doctrine of papal infallibility. Yet though reactionary in several ways, it nevertheless represented an adaptation to political deconfessionalization. There was an element of liberalism in the triumph of ultramontanism. (By “ultramontanism” is understood the ecclesiastical tendency to look *ultra montes*, beyond the mountains—that is, the Alps—toward Rome, emphasizing the superiority of popes over bishops.) Catholics would never have turned to the papacy in this way had they not in effect agreed with liberals that there was something irreducibly secular about the modern state.

Vatican II completed the work of Vatican I. The council fathers of Vatican II gave explicit, albeit measured and conditional, recognition to the merits of democracy and liberalism. They abandoned the concept that the state as such had specific duties with regard to God. They ceased hankering after the confessional state and acknowledged the right to religious liberty, making it the cornerstone of Catholic political thought. They emphasized the political role of the laity and abandoned the idea that political life ought to be predicated on close collaboration between civil and ecclesiastical hierarchies.

It is not my intention to rewrite the history of the councils, for their story has been well enough told.<sup>4</sup> I intend rather to put forward a history and an interpretation of Catholic political thought in the age of democracy, concentrating on the case of France and on the now somewhat forgotten history of Gallicanism—the doctrine that, in contradistinction to ultramontanism, set a high value on political life and on the milieu of the nation. There are two reasons for this.

In the first place, it was France that set the tone for Catholic political thought between 1650 and 1950, when the church was, more or less, adapting to what we call the “modern world.” In the history of France, we see clearly the tensions that elsewhere remained hidden. France was at once the epicenter and the laboratory for the process. In Spain, Quebec, Italy, and the United States, for example, the debates were neither as wide-ranging nor as profound. It was France, more than anywhere else, that saw real reflection on the relations between Catholicism, nationalism, liberalism, and democracy, because it was France alone that was at once a great Catholic nation, a cradle of the nation-state (unlike Spain or the Habsburg Empire), and the stage for the Revolution. The crisis of the Revolution called forth the most powerful and the most extreme analyses, ranging from the political theology of Joseph de Maistre to a homogenizing Jacobinism and a republican anticlericalism. Over the past few centuries, the most substantial, the most engaged, and the most influential Catholic political thought has been that of France. Demographic shifts within the universal church and internal change in France have latterly combined to bring that intellectual primacy to an end. The internal arguments of American Catholicism now hold center-stage, but that is a recent development. Previously it was in France that religious, political, and intellectual life came together with unparalleled vigor, conferring a more universal significance upon the events of the nation’s history.

Second, the tension between Vatican I and Vatican II, between the two poles of the Vatican Reform, plays out at the level of the universal church a tension that first arose in the heart of political and ecclesiastical life in France. The forces that shaped developments within the Gallican church came to shape the universal church. The Catholic Church was caught between two paradigms to which it neither could nor should conform if it were to remain Catholic: that of a church organized on a purely national basis; and that of a church entirely separate from the nation-state, autonomous and self-sufficient under the guidance of the papacy. This book is therefore especially concerned with the history and varieties of Gallicanism, because, within the Catholic Church, Gallicanism is the preeminent tradition of distinctly *political* thought. Gallicans have always insisted on the autonomy of the temporal or secular power. It was within the matrix of Gallicanism that, from the high Middle Ages onward, the secular tradition took shape. This Catholic tradition, which has attracted surprisingly little attention from professional historians, has nevertheless played a crucial role in the development of the framework of modern politics: the liberal and democratic nation-state.

My project is thus situated at the intersection of several intellectual disciplines: the history of ideas, religious and political history, ecclesiology, and political philosophy, with a particular emphasis on the last of these. It seeks to complement the fine work that has already been done in these various areas.

4 • Introduction

Neither church historians nor historians of political thought have yet attempted a “history of Catholic political ideas in the democratic age.” I aim to fill this gap.<sup>5</sup> I do not presume to paint a complete picture: that would be an impossible task. Thus, I scarcely touch upon “social Catholicism,” nor do I deal with papal policy as such. I can only hope that the reader will accept my oversights and omissions as the necessary price of a welcome brevity. The authors whom I have picked out for analysis have been chosen for their representative character and because they offer the clearest and boldest arguments. It goes without saying that I confine my view largely to Catholic authors. However, the Catholic Church envisages itself precisely as church, and not as sect; as a church that aspires to embrace all, even pagan philosophy. So I have no hesitation in drawing where appropriate upon non-Catholic and non-Christian authors. If the history of the church is, as the church likes to think, the history of Truth, then it is better if it is not confined to the presbytery. The church encompasses the life of nations, and its horizon is the unity of humanity made manifest.

## Index

---

---

- absolutism, 15, 17, 18, 20, 23–25, 26, 37, 42, 43, 66, 79, 125, 126, 149; and the French Revolution, 53, 102; papal absolutism, 65, 83; political absolutism, 56, 57, 72
- Action Française, 109, 110, 114–15; condemnation of, 115
- Acton, John Emerich Dalberg, 1st Baron, 63
- Aeterni Patris* (Leo XIII) (1879), 55–56
- Alberigo, Giuseppe, 177n93
- Althusser, Louis, 111
- Ancien Regime: church and state in, 20–22, 46; politics of, 12; society of (“society of orders” [*orantes, bellantes, laborantes*]), 7–8, 38
- Ancien Regime and the French Revolution, The* (Tocqueville), 53
- Anscombe, Elizabeth, 135, 176n75
- Appolis, Emile, 164n99
- Aquinas, Thomas, 55, 56, 110, 111, 154n16, 161n48, 168n50
- Aristotle, 55
- assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary, the, 65
- atheism, 35, 48, 52, 53, 55, 59, 87, 103, 116, 129; militant atheism, 113; of the state, 60
- Aubert, R., 160n32
- Augustine, 13–14, 104, 107, 124, 131, 152
- Ballanche, P. S., 42
- Balthasar, Hans Urs von, 171n72, 177n92
- Barrot, Odilon, 47, 47–48
- Barruel, Augustin, 44
- Bastiat, Frédéric, 164n100
- Bayle, Pierre, 28
- Bazin, G., 66
- Bellarmino, Robert, on the church as a “perfect society,” 94
- Benedict XVI, 134, 138. *See also* Ratzinger, Joseph
- Berlin, Isaiah, 135
- Bert, Paul, 95–96
- Besançon, Alain, 172n8
- “bishop over externals,” 40
- Blacas, Pierre Louis Jean Casimir de, 44
- Bodin, Jean, 23, 157n53
- Boisgelin, Jean de Dieu-Raymond de Cucé de, 9, 154n19
- Bonald, Louis de, 33, 34, 109, 166n116
- Boniface VIII, 118
- Boudon, Jacques-Olivier, 164n99
- Bossuet, Jacques Bénigne, 16–17, 22, 24, 26, 27–28, 28, 57, 74–75, 120, 131, 154n24, 155n25, 170n64, 174n34; focus of on the Old Testament, 20; on France as an elect nation, 16–17; on the French language, 16; on identification of Louis XIV with the kings of Israel (David and Solomon), 16–17; as the point of reference for Gallicanism, 16
- Bouyer, Louis, 172n8
- Boyle, John P., 68
- Briand, Aristide, 97
- Burke, Edmund, 154n9
- Buttiglione affair (2004), 176n79
- Caesarism and Ultramontanism* (Manning), 64, 163n75
- Cahiers de la quinzaine* (Péguy), 104
- Calvinism, 52
- Camus, Armand-Gaston, 14
- Canet, Louis, 162n65
- Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 118
- Catéchisme positiviste* (Comte), 109
- Catholic Church: and *aggiornamento*, 125; challenge to the universalism of, 10–11; organization of around an apostolic hierarchy based on divine right, 9, 11; as a “perfect society,” 94–95; in Poland, 133; and the principle of election, 7; reconciliation of with the Third Republic, 101–2; social teaching of, 113–14; in the “society of orders,” 7; in the United States, 116–17. *See also* Catholic Church, post-Vatican II
- Catholic Church, post-Vatican II, 132–41; and homosexuality, 135–36; interpretations of the contemporary direction of the Catholic Church, 139–41; and sexual morality, 135
- Cavagnis, Felice, 94
- Chaix d’Est-Ange, Richard, 155n37
- Charismatic Renewal, 138
- Charles X, 47, 48, 52, 58, 60
- Chateaubriand, François-René, 43, 102, 113

- Chenu, M.-D., 110  
Christian Marxists, 110, 112, 114, 115  
Christianity, tendency of toward the apolitical, 12–13  
*City of God* (Augustine), 131  
Civil Constitution of the Clergy, 7–15, 39, 40, 66, 67, 93, 120, 125, 148; and the challenge of homogenization, 14; and the challenge of politicization, 14; challenge to the universalism of the Catholic Church, 10–11; the geography of subscription to, 92; as a major political blunder, 12; opposition to by bishops, 10; priests' response to (the "patriots" and the "non-jurors"), 8–9; rejection of by Pius VI, 8; and the role of the laity, 174n32; as a testimony of the extent of revolutionary politicization, 14–15  
*Civilt' cattolica*, 163n74  
Claudel, Paul, 159n16  
Clémenceau, Georges, 167n20, 170n59  
Clement XI, 22  
Cochin, Augustin, 158n78  
*Code of Canon Law* (1917): canon 218, 68; canon 329, 98  
*Code of Canon Law* (1983), 118  
Combes, Émile, 89, 90, 92, 93, 97, 101  
Community of the Beatitudes, 138  
Comte, Auguste, 84–86, 109, 142, 143–44; and the religion of humanity, 86, 110  
conciliarism, 26, 75, 151  
Concordat of Bologna (1516), 19  
Concordat of 1801, 41, 44–45, 66, 73, 74, 89; article 2, 44; article 3, 44; articles 4 and 5, 90; the Organic Articles, 41–42, 89; and the schism of the "Little Church," 44–45; and the system of "recognized" religions, 41  
Condorcet, Nicolas de, 156n40  
*Confessions* (Rousseau), 31  
Congar, Yves, 175n53  
Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, 136  
Consalvi, Ercole, 44  
*Considérations sur la France* (Maistre), 21, 22, 30, 32, 55  
Constant, Henri Benjamin, 124, 166n116  
Constantine, 40  
Constitution of 1791, article 1, 10  
Council of Constance, 26  
Council of Nicaea, 62  
Council of Trent, 67, 126  
Counter-Revolution, the, 2, 9, 29, 31, 34, 51, 58–59, 111, 148–49; emphasis on collaboration between church and state, 109; exaggeration of both the atheism of the "modern" world and the religious character of the "premodern," 55  
*Cours de philosophie positive* (Comte), 86  
Darboy, Georges, 71, 72  
*De la religion considérée dans ses rapports avec l'ordre politique et civil* (Lamennais), 48  
*De l'Eglise gallicane* (Maistre), 22  
*De l'origine démocratique du christianisme* (Leroux), 174n32  
Declaration of the Clergy of France on Ecclesiastical Power (1682), article 1, 15, 120  
*Declaration of Religious Freedom* (Vatican II), 116, 127–32  
Declaration of the Rights of Man, 37; article 3, 20; article 10, 9, 10, 12, 20–21, 38, 83  
*Défense de la déclaration de 1682* (Bossuet), 120  
*Défense de l'Occident* (Massis), 111  
*Defensio declarationis* (Bossuet), 16  
deism, as a source of laicism, 92  
democracy, 3, 9, 12, 34, 35, 54, 55, 75, 76–77, 87, 100, 114, 119, 125, 140, 144, 145; absolute democracy, 10; Christian democracy, 70, 73–74, 78, 116; and the language of individual rights, 78; and the language of interest, 78; liberal democracy, 25, 101, 116, 117, 124, 130, 132–33, 136, 139, 144, 146, 147, 149–50, 151; modern democracy, 78, 108; and the myth of "representation," 8; and pluralism, 116–17; as popular, 147, 148–49; representative democracy, 1–2, 25, 86, 110; revolutionary democracy, 84; and social equality, 1; as sovereign, 147, 147–48; theological drift of toward pantheism, 1  
*Democracy in America* (Tocqueville), 74, 76–77, 116–17  
Derrida, Jacques, 142  
*Des moyens de gouvernement et d'opposition dans l'état actuel de la France* (Guizot), 160n29  
*Des progrès de la révolution et de la guerre contre l'Angleterre* (Lamennais), 59  
Devlin, Patrick, 135, 176n75  
"doctrines of hate," 97  
Dohen, Dorothy, 178n3

- Dominicans, 110, 111  
Donegani, Jean-Marie, 169–70n56  
Donoso Cortès, Juan, 33, 49  
Dostoyevsky, Fyodor, 111–12  
Douglas, Mary, 176n75  
Dreyfus affair, 103, 106  
*Du pape* (Maistre), 22, 85  
Duguit, Léon, 64, 89  
Dumont, Louis, 178n1  
Dunn, John, 153n3  
Dupront, Alphonse, 151  
Durkheim, Emile, 88
- écoles normales, 87  
Edict of Nantes (1598), 23–25  
Elias, Norbert, 78  
Emmanuel Community, 138  
Enlightenment, the, 33, 142  
*Esquisse d'un tableau historique des progress de l'esprit humain* (Condorcet), 156n40  
eugenics, 145  
*Examen d'un écrit de Jean-Jacques Rousseau* (Maistre), 31
- Faber, F. W., 49  
Faculties of Theology (French), 51  
Falloux, Frédéric de, 173n74  
Fauchet, Claude, 165n116  
Fénelon, François, 14–15, 18, 37, 38  
Ferry, Jules, 87, 95, 95–96, 101, 143, 169n45  
Fessard, Gaston, 115  
Fèvre, Justin, 121, 122, 160n32  
Figgis, J. N., 155n28, 165n110  
Fleury, Claude, 16, 26, 37, 38  
Foucault, Michel, 142  
Fouilloux, Etienne, 111  
France: and Catholic political thought between 1650 and 1950, 3; role of in shaping the Catholic Church's response to liberal democracy, 116  
France, Anatole, 98, 168n44  
Francis I, 19  
freedom of the individual, contemporary philosophies of, 135  
freethinking, as a source of laicism, 92  
French Revolution, 20; antireligious character of, 54; attempts to anchor it in popular culture, 83; and the disembodiment of the French church, 50; and limitations on the role of government, 28; as an overwhelming force, 112–13; as a political  
Pentecost, 12; and the rejection of the alliance between church and state, 22, 40, 46, 109; and the repudiation of Catholic identity, 14  
French Seminary (Rome), 51
- Gallicanism, 2, 3, 15–22, 29, 32, 34–35, 42–43, 46–47, 48, 60, 67, 71, 85, 121; condemnation of by the Holy See, 15; declaration of 1682, 26; distortion of, 125; and the “divine right of kings,” 17–18; ecclesiastical Gallicanism, 18, 26, 65; hyper-Gallicanism, 125; liberal Gallicanism, 123, 124, 125; Napoleonic Gallicanism, 44; neo-Gallicanism, 73–74, 122, 123–25; on the papacy's “power of influence,” 118–19; political Gallicanism, 15, 18, 26, 65, 92, 93, 96, 97, 103, 119, 120, 121; resolute embrace of by French Catholics, 15; as a source of laicism, 92; varieties of, 19; and the yoking of French national identity to Catholicism, 24–25. *See also* Tocqueville, Alexis de, and the preservation of Gallicanism; Vatican II (1962–65), and the reconciliation of the Catholic Church with liberal Gallicanism
- Gambetta, Leon, 87, 88–89  
Gasparri, Pietro, 98  
Gauchet, Marcel, 142  
Gaulle, Charles de, 169n52  
Gernet, Jacques, 169n50  
Gladstone, William Ewart, 163n75  
Görres, J. J., 49  
Gough, Austin, 160n32  
Gratry, Auguste-Joseph-Alphonse, 64–65  
Grégoire, Henri, 39  
“Gregorian Reform,” 2, 58, 61–62n54  
Gregorian University. *See* Roman College  
Gregory VII, 58, 161n54  
Gregory XVI, 63, 69  
Guizot, François-Pierre-Guillaume, 47, 160n29, 166n116  
Gutiérrez, Gustavo, 172n7  
Guyon, Bernard, 171n72
- Habermas, Jÿrgen, 144–45  
Harouel, Jean-Louis, 66–67  
Hart, Herbert, 135  
Hemmer, Hippolyte, 98  
Henry IV, 25, 58

- Histoire critique du catholicisme libéral jusqu'au pontificat de Léon XIII* (Fèvre), 121
- Histoire de consulat et de l'empire* (Thiers), 40
- Histoire de l'idée laïque en France au XIX<sup>ème</sup> siècle* (Weill), 82
- Histoire du Concile Vatican II* (ed. Alberigo), 177n93
- Histoire intellectuelle du libéralisme* (Manent), 124
- Hobbes, Thomas, 119
- homosexuality, 135–36
- Huguenots, 23
- Humanae Vitae* (Paul VI [1968]), 135
- Jabineau, Henri, 10, 18
- Jacobins, 10
- Jansenists, 22
- Jaume, Lucien, 165n114
- Jesuits, 15, 51; expulsion of from French schools, 95–96
- Jeunesse de l'Eglise*, 110
- Joachimite heresy, 113
- Joan of Arc, 107, 171n86
- John Paul II, 123, 132, 133, 133–34, 137, 138, 169n50
- Kalyvas, Stathis, 170n56
- Kantorowicz, Ernst, 155n30
- Kennedy, John F., 178n3
- King's Two Bodies, The* (Kantorowicz), 155n30
- Kolnai, Aurel, 176n73
- Koselleck, Reinhart, 158n78
- La conquête de Plassans* (Zola), 168–69n44
- La Luzerne, César-Guillaume de, 11
- La Religion* (Lamennais), 70
- La tradition de l'Eglise sur l'institution des évêques* (Lamennais), 66
- Laboulaye, Edouard, 41
- Lacordaire, Henri, 60, 74
- Lagarde, George de, 119
- laicism, 88, 90, 141; aggressive laicism, 92, 142; French laicism, 92; as statism, 88–95
- laicity, 90; positive idea of, 141–46; two kinds of, 95–99. *See also* laicism
- laity, political role of, 117–27
- Lamennais, Félicité de, 47–48, 49, 52, 63, 67, 113, 121, 122, 125, 162n62; liberal phase of, 59–60, 69–70, 112
- Latreille, André, 170n60
- L'Avenir*, 60, 63, 66, 73; attack on the divine right of kings, 60
- Lavisse, Ernest, 24–25
- law of sacrilege (12 April 1825), 52, 57; condemnation of by Royer-Collard, 57
- law on freedom of association (1 July 1901), 89
- law on separation of church and state (9 December 1905): article 2, 97; article 4 (on *associations cultuelles*), 90–95
- Le Conservateur*, 47
- Le Livre du peuple* (Lamennais), 70
- Lefebvre, Marcel, 116
- L'Eglise et la République* (France), 168n44
- Lemontey, P. E., 158n2
- Leo X, 19
- Leo XIII, 55–56, 65, 68, 95, 96, 110, 116; call of for *ralliement*, 96
- Leroux, Pierre, 84, 174n32
- L'Esquisse d'une philosophie* (Lamennais), 70
- l'Hospital, Michel de, 25
- liberalism, 34; association of with a critique of politics, 124; Catholic condemnation of, 46; nineteenth-century Catholic critique of, 94
- liberation theology, 112; condemnation of, 140
- Littre, Émile, 87, 95, 170n58; distinction of between the “Catholicism of the clericalists” and the “Catholicism of universal suffrage,” 100–101
- Locke, John, 119, 175n60
- Loisy, Alfred, 99, 110
- L'Orme du mail* (France), 98
- Lotage* (Claudel), 159n16
- Louis XIV, 24, 26, 37, 75, 122, 125; identification of with the kings of Israel, 16–17; persecution of the Huguenots, 23, 25; persecution of the Jansenists, 22, 25; unwieldy system of government of, 53
- Louis XVI, 39
- Louis XVIII, 47, 52, 56, 58; attitude of the bishops to, 56–57
- Loyseau, Charles, 157n53
- Lubac, Henri de, 115, 119
- Lumen Gentium* (Vatican II), 117–18, 126
- L'Univers religieux*, 80
- Lustiger, Jean-Marie, 13, 134, 170n60
- Lutheranism, 52
- Luzerne, César-Guillaume de la, 165n106
- Lyotard, Jean-François, 142

- Machiavelli, Niccolò, 13, 24, 27, 28, 32, 56, 124  
MacIntyre, Alasdair, 135, 176n75  
Maillane, P. T. Durand de, 21  
Maistre, Joseph de, 13, 21–22, 29–30, 31–32, 33, 48, 49, 55, 57, 58, 64, 65, 67, 75, 84, 85, 86, 100, 101, 122, 125, 131, 148–49; anti-Gallican polemics of, 34–36, 43–44; on atheism, 35; attitude of toward the French Revolution, 36; defense of the liberty of the church, 45–46; on the French Revolution as divine chastisement, 35; opposition of to Gallicanism, 121; on Protestantism, 25; on the “Revolution of 1862,” 53, 120–21; on the satanic quality of the French Revolution, 35;  
Malebranche, Nicolas, 155n31  
Manent, Pierre, 77, 124–25, 153n3  
Manning, H. E., 49, 64, 163n75  
Maret, Henry, 63, 64, 71, 72, 72–73, 73–74, 74, 122–23, 125, 138, 160n32; on the authority of the church, 93; political messianism of, 113  
Maritain, Jacques, 13, 115, 116  
Marsilus of Padua, 119, 120, 124  
Marxism, 110  
Masonic Order of the Grand Orient of France, 87  
Massis, Henri, 111  
Mathiez, Albert, 40, 83  
Maultrot, G. N., 39  
Maurras, Charles, 109–10, 170n62; *empirisme organisateur* ideology of, 109. *See also* Action Française  
Maurrassians, 112  
Mayeur, Jean-Marie, 169n52  
McLeod, Hugh, 176n72  
Méjan, François, 99, 167n17, 169n52  
Mellon, Stanley, 164n99  
Melun, Armand de, 65  
Michelet, Jules, 83–84, 84, 113  
Michnik, Adam, 132, 133  
*Mirari vos* (Gregory XVI [1832]), 69  
monarchists, 112  
Montalembert, Charles de, 43, 60, 63, 67, 129, 175n60  
Montesquieu, 52, 54–55, 78  
Mun, Albert de, 116  
Murray, John Courtney, 116, 168n32, 177n83  
nationalism, 3, 102–3; integral nationalism, 109  
Necker, Jacques, 166n116  
Neveu, Bruno, 99  
Newman, J. H., 118  
Nietzsche, Friedrich, 142  
Ollivier, Emile, 61–62, 64, 90, 92, 123  
Orthodox schism (1054), 161n54  
Ozouf, Mona, 143  
pantheism, 1, 95, 113  
papal encyclicals, 68. *See also specific encyclicals*  
Pascal, Blaise, 74, 102  
*Pastor Aeternus* (Vatican I), 49, 126; debate over the terms used to describe papal jurisdiction, 68–69  
Paul, 27, 56  
Paul VI, 135, 169n50  
Péguy, Charles, 103, 114, 124, 144, 149; on the eternal dwelling in the temporal, 103–8  
Pétain, Philippe, 90  
Philip the Fair, 17, 121  
Phillips, George, 49  
Pius VI, 56  
Pius IX, 46, 49, 65, 68, 100, 129  
Pius XI, 169n50  
Pius XII, 132–33  
political theology, 3, 16–17, 30, 33, 34, 52, 74, 86, 102, 121, 125, 140, 149; of absolutism, 56; Gallicanism as political theology, 119; Littré’s opposition to, 101; Pétainist political theology, 115  
*Politics* (Aristotle), 55  
*Politique tirée de l’Ecriture sainte* (Bousset), 16, 27–28  
pope, the, 11, 12, 15, 17, 19, 26, 30, 37, 49, 61, 75, 78, 91, 118–19, 140, 151; and the importance of papal teaching (papal encyclicals and papal audiences), 68; infallibility of, 2, 49, 65–66; jurisdictional primacy of the pope, 68–69; popular devotion to, 68. *See also individually listed popes*; Napoleon, religious policy of; ultramontanism  
Portalis, Jean-Etienne-Marie, 40–41, 42, 58, 70–72, 74, 91, 165n116  
Portier, Philippe, 170n60  
Powers, George C., 156n49  
Pranchère, Jean-Yves, 156n39  
Protestantism, 1, 35; as a source of laicism, 92

- “quarrel over the sacraments” (1750s–1760s), 158n3
- Quinet, Edgar, 84, 101, 121–22, 125, 156n44
- Racine, Jean, 102
- Ratzinger, Joseph, 137–38, 140. *See also* Benedict XVI
- Reflections on the Revolution in France* (Burke), 154n9
- Réflexions sur la protestantisme dans ses rapports avec la souveraineté* (Maistre), 35
- Reformation, the, 161–62n54
- Rémusat, Charles de, 52
- Renan, Ernest, 45, 62–63, 102, 167n10
- Renouvier, Charles, 167n10
- republicanism, 52, 55, 80, 88, 100, 106, 141, 143; anti-republicanism, 87
- Restoration, the (1814–30), 46–47
- Revocation of the Edict of Nantes (1685), 23–25, 34
- Richelieu, Cardinal, 26, 27
- Rivero, Jean, 168n37
- Robespierre, Maximilien, 9–10
- Roman College, 51
- Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 8, 10, 14, 30–31, 56, 106, 107, 124
- Royer-Collard, Pierre-Paul, 50, 51–52, 71, 73, 74, 130; condemnation of the law of sacrilege, 57
- Saint-Martin, Louis Claude de, 33
- Saint-Simon, Henri de, 84
- Sarkozy, Nicolas, 141, 142
- Schatz, Klaus, 69, 159n21
- Schilling, Heinz, 156n45
- Schmitt, Carl, 33, 157n63, 174n45
- separation of church and state: in France, 96; during Thermidor, 159n8; in the United States, 96. *See also* law on separation of church and state (9 December 1905)
- Seyssel, Claude de, 157n53
- Siéyes, Emmanuel, 7
- Simon, Yves, 172n16
- Six livres de la République* (Bodin), 23
- society: “corporate society,” 8; democratic society, 8; “society of orders,” 7–8
- Socrates, 55
- Sorbonne, the, 51
- Souvenirs d'enfance et de jeunesse* (Renan), 102
- Spinoza, Baruch, 119
- Staël, Germaine de, 10, 166n116
- Starobinski, Jean, 31
- state, the: atheism of, 60; deconfessionalization of, 28–29; secularization of, 38; under the Ancien Regime (as the “secular arm” of the church), 46; under a democratic regime, 8. *See also* separation of church and state
- Strauss, Leo, 178n4
- Syllabus of Errors* (Pius IX [1864]), 46, 63, 66, 100, 110, 129, 131; articles 5, 19, and 20, 94
- Système de politique positive* (Comte), 86
- Taine, Hippolyte, 178n1
- Tarquini, Camillo, 94
- Taylor, Charles, 173n30
- Thiers, A., 40, 41, 162–63n69
- Third Republic, 86–87, 99–100; compromise of with the Catholic Church, 101–2; two births of, 88
- Thomism, 110, 111
- Thureau-Dangin, Paul, 165n114
- Tocqueville, Alexis de, 49, 50, 51, 53, 54, 95, 109, 113, 116–17, 124, 126, 144, 149, 164–65n104, 178n1, 165n114; and the preservation of Gallicanism, 74–80
- Tolstoy, Leo, 111–12
- totalitarianism, 95, 116, 117, 132, 133, 134, 137, 146, 150
- Treillard, Jean-Baptiste, 14, 39, 90–91
- Tyrell, George, 110
- Ullmann, Walter, 27
- ultramontanism, 2, 19, 45, 48–51, 123, 151; aims of, 78; core of liberalism at the heart of, 46; geographical considerations, 71–72; political vitality of, 69; and the refocusing of the papacy on its spiritual role, 58–69; rewriting of history by, 53; sociological considerations, 72. *See also* Vatican I (1870)
- Unigenitus* (Clement XI [1713]), 22
- Valéry, Paul, 155n25
- Valmy, Battle of (1792), 102
- Vatican I (1870), 2, 49, 55; condemnation of religious freedom, 127–28; and the end of the Ancien Regime for the Catholic Church, 126; on papal infallibility, 2, 66; refocusing of the papacy on its spiritual role, 58–69; tension between Vatican I and Vatican II, 3, 126. *See also* ultramontanism

- Vatican II (1962–65), 2, 80, 99, 115; and the coming to terms with liberal democracy, 116; as a continuation of the work of Vatican I, 140–41; indifferent stance of toward politics, 117–18; and the reconciliation of the Catholic Church with liberal Gallicanism, 125–27; on religious freedom, 2, 116, 127–32, 137, 150–51; tension between Vatican I and Vatican II, 3, 126
- “Vatican Reform,” 2, 126–27, 140–41
- Veritatis splendor* (John Paul II [1993]), 137
- Veillot, Louis, 49, 63, 72, 80; Tocqueville’s criticism of, 79
- Vignerot, Paul, 111
- Voltaire, 28, 155n31
- Waldeck-Rousseau, Pierre Marie, 89
- Wallon, Jean, 164n96
- Ward, William George, 49, 50, 65
- Weill, Georges, 92
- World War I, 102
- Zola, Émile, 168–69n44